NEBULA

A Journal of Multidisciplinary Scholarship

Guest Editor:

Rebecca Beirne

Content

Note on contributors

Ahmad S. Abu Baker

Assistant Professor in English Literature at Al al-Bayt University, Jordan, since 2003. Abu Baker is Acting Chairman of the English Dept. at Al al-Bayt University and received his Doctorate in English and Comparative Literature from Murdoch University in Western Australia in 2002.

Paul Booth

Paul Booth is currently a Ph.D. candidate at Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute. His current research interests include digital culture and the influence of New Media on Old. His articles have appeared in the *Texas Speech Communication Journal; Games and Culture* as well as having published academic guidebooks for students with College Prowler Publications.

Tara Brabazon

Tara Brabazon is Professor of Media Studies at the University of Brighton. She has published nine books: *The University of Google*, *The Revolution will not be downloaded*, *Tracking the Jack*, *Ladies who Lunge*, *Digital Hemlock*, *Liverpool of the South Seas*, *From Revolution to Revelation* and *Playing on the Periphery*. A former national teaching award winner and finalist for Australian of the Year, she is Director of the Popular Culture Collective (http://www.popularculturecollective.com)

Victor Osaro Edo

Dr. Victor Osaro Edo is a lecturer in the Department of History, University of Ibadan, Ibadan. He specializes in Benin Studies as well as political and cultural history. Edo has published a number of articles in books and journals. Some of his published books include: African Culture and Civilization (Ibadan,2005),co-edited with O.Oguntomisin and *African Civilisation from the Earliest Times to 1500 A.D.*(Ibadan,2007). He is a member of the Historical Society of Nigeria (HSN) and is currently the co-ordinator of postgraduate programmes of the Department of History of the University.

Kane X. Faucher

Kane X. Faucher is a novelist and lecturer at the University of Western Ontario. His specialty is in ontology, polemic, and theories of propaganda. His works of literary and academic endeavour have appeared recently in *Exquisite Corpse, Recherche Litteraire, Janus Head, Angelaki: Journal of the Theoretical Humanities, 3711Atlantic*, *Zygote in My Coffee 9, Quill and Ink, Jack Magazine* and *Defenestration* (only to name a few). He has provided an editor's introduction to Che Elias' novel, *The Pagan Ellipsis*. His novel, *Urdox!* was released in 2004*,* and *Codex Obscura (*with an introduction by Raymond Federman) will be appearing this summer. His chapbook, *Cystem SansCrit*, has been released by Dusty Owl Press. He is an editorial member of the journal, *Skandalon*, as well as the general editor of the soonto-be inaugurated journal, *Critical Mass: Theory & Fiction*. In his contribution to *Nebula*, Kane explores the inconsistencies in Mao Tse Tung's rule as well as elevating his speculation over these irregularities

to a form of intellectual intrigue which almost borders on the esoteric, at least, the transcendental. Carefully written and highly reflective *Mao's Dialectical Materialism as an individualism: Theory and Practice* will be of great interest to readers of Marxist and Deleuseian critical theory as well as those interested in subversive readings of any kind.

Robert Goff

Robert Goff resides in Providence, Rhode Island and teaches films courses at the University of Massachusetts, Boston and at Providence College. Recent publications and presentations include "The Joy of Aging: Alex Comfort and the Popularization of Gerontology." Journal of Aging,Humanities and the Arts. October, 2007 and"Rhode Island on Film: Changing Views of Tourism in the Regional Travelogue" copresented with Patricia Raub at The Northeast Historic Film Summer Symposium, July 20-21, 2007. Bucksport, Maine.

Saddik Gohar

Saddik Gohar received his PhD and Masters in English Literature and Criticism from the University of Pennsylvannia in Indiana (USA). He received his first BA in English language from Ain Shams University in Cairo University and another BA in English literature from Mansora University in Egypt. His "The Political Poetry of Le Roi Jones and Mdhafa Al-Nawwab: A Comparative Perspective" is forthcoming in the fall volume of the Digest of Middle East Studies (Wisconsin University). His "Protest and Revolt:

Afro-American and Arab Poets in Dialogue" was published in *Creativity in Exile* (New York: Rodopi, 2004). Saddik is interested in translation and has worked as a part-time translator for a considerable period of time.

Yue Ji

Yue Ji has taught music at Nanjing University of Aeronautics and Astronautics, in China since 2003. She holds two Master degrees, one from University of Alberta, Canada on piano performance, and the other from Nanjing Normal University, China, on music education. Her research interests include music education, interdisciplinary study of music, letters, and history, and intercultural studies.

Jim Kent

James Kent is a tri-lingual graduate from the University of Hertfordshire and is currently completing an MA at Brighton University. He is best known for his 5 years as Breakfast presenter and commentator on National Radio within Luxembourg, and as a pioneer of English broadcasting within the Grand Duchy. As a result of 2 years further study of Thai language and culture, he developed interests in predicting the outcome of new media growth in Anglo and Asian contexts.

Yashar Keramati

Yashar Keramati is studying in the field of International Relations at the University of British Columbia, Canada. Currently he is on exchange

for one year at the University of Cape Town, so as to learn about the history and effects of apartheid as well as to volunteer within the most impoverished areas. Keramati has published previously in *Nebula* 4.1 & 4.2.

Nejmeh Khalil-Habib

Nejmeh Khalil-Habib was born in Haifa, Palestine, in 1946 and was raised in Beirut, Lebanon. She received an MA in Arabic literature from the Lebanese University in 1991 and is currently completing her Doctorate at the University of Sydney. She is currently teaching in the Arab and Islamic Studies Department at the University of Sydney. She has acted as editor for the Australian-Arabic literary magazine, *Joussour* and has published innumerable essays, translations, reviews and columns in both English and Arabic journals and newspapers worldwide. Her monograph *AlNamouthaj Al-Insani Fi Adab Ghassan Kanafani* was published by Bissan Inc. in Beirut in 1999. Bissan also published her first collection of short stories entitled *Wal Abna' Yaddrusson* in Beirut (2001). Her latest collection of short stories, *Rabiun Lam Yuzhir* was published in Beirut by Al-Markiz Al-Arabee Lil-Abhath Wal-Tawtheek (2003). Her latest book a study of Australian literature entitled *Min Australia: Wujooh Adabiya Mu'asirah* was published by Dar al-Arabiya lil Uloom in Beirut, 2006.

Stephen Mallinder

Stephen Mallinder is the research officer of the Higher Education Academy's Art Media Design Subject, based at the University of Brighton. He is also a founder member of pioneering electronic act Cabaret Voltaire. He moved to Australia in the mid 1990s, establishing Off World Sounds in 1996, and recorded under the names Sassi & Loco and The Ku-Ling Bros. Concurrently, Stephen Mallinder has held consultancy positions for Sony Music Australia and Mushroom Music. He has been Talks Producer for RTR-FM. He is finishing a PhD at Murdoch University in Western Australia with the title ***Movement***.

An Attempt to Reconcile Epicurus' Hedonism with His Epistemology and More Particularly with His Physics.

By Kane X. Faucher

In Book III of his *Rhetoric*, Aristotle outlines four types of forensic questions for cases in which accountability is sought to be derived from actions, otherwise known as stasis theory. These are: 1) was the act committed? 2) If so, were there harmful consequences? 3) If so, to what degree (or intensity) of harm? 4) All things considered, was the act justified? Ethics, in order to be substantive, must endeavour to forge its link between theoretical postulates and practical application, allowing passage from an epistemic process of beliefs or reasoned-out maxims to the arena of action (or inaction, as the case may be, which can in itself be considered a mode of action). It is not the intention to distort the analysis of the foregoing with a heavy-handed Aristotelian perspective, but to posit this initial forensic detail as ancillary to a deeper understanding between the seemingly disparate Epicurean hedonistic ethics (the privileging of the pleasures of the mind as enduring over that of the body, which is ephemeral) and his various assertions made in his physics and epistemology. In the process of our analysis, we will return to this fourfold question set, reframed in so far as it can elucidate more normative claims.

It proves difficult to set Epicurean ethics upon the foundation of his physics, for pleasure and pain are not atomic qualities. They are epistemic "movements" (and we use this term with reservation), for the pleasure that Epicurus endorses is that of the catastemic, or tranquil variety. However, we cannot be cavalier and ignore the suspiciously analogous links between the physics and the ethics, for even if constructing this bridge be a task worthy of Sisyphus, it may provide us with an understanding of a continuity among the mental processes of Epicurus as an attempt to remain as consistent as possible with his principles. These analogies will be put forward in a tentative and speculative fashion, but not as a decisive means of imputing to either his physics or ethics a causal relation that is firmly established.

For Epicurus, the supreme good is pleasure—and of this variety, the sort that produces a state of *ataraxia*. This state stands as the highest epistemological ideal for Epicureans since it is the state in which one is at complete untroubled peace, neither in want or excess (akin, in a slight way, to the Buddhist ideal of "nirvana"), and most importantly a freedom from pain and distress. He provides a typology of desires in terms

of those that may be called full and those that may be deemed empty. When we speak of full and empty, we do not call up the strict definitions of bodies and voids, but more so the effect of full meaning being substantive, or material, and emptiness being non- substantive, or immaterial. In this typology there is a split between natural and empty desires, the empty being a process of purely imaginary fictions taken into the mind that plague it with complications that are unnecessary and inhibit a proper pursuit of pleasure. These empty desires are characterized as being hard to procure, beyond the immediate limits of our power, and with a tendency to cause more pain upon acquisition. For example, to desire the attainment of public office would entail grand efforts, and though it would bestow upon one prestige, title, and wealth, these forms of pleasure are not without their perils. Moreover, if the candidate fails to procure this pleasure, the candidate will feel a sense of loss and pain. Of the natural variety of desires, these are split up into the necessary (those desires that are complete the thought—that are what?) and the automatic (those desires that are inherent in the body for its maintenance). Of the necessary desires, Epicurus splits them up into three categories: those desires necessary for happiness (e.g. friendship), those necessary for freedom from distress (e.g., peace), and those necessary for living (i.e., rest). Owing to the privileged status of pleasure as itself the pursuit of life, its very goal, virtues such as justice, prudence, and so forth are rendered to be in the service of life—in fact, as the very instruments necessary to procuring a refined sense of pleasure. In this instance, virtues lend themselves to an unhindered attainment of various pleasures just as medicine lends itself to health.

Of these pleasures, Epicurus advocates the catastemic variety more than the kinetic. It is not that, as the Cyrenaics claim,[1] Epicurus rejects kinetic pleasures (pleasures associated with the body) wholesale, but that the quality of kinetic pleasures do no have the same lasting positive effects as more mind-based pleasures. Kinetic pleasures are typified by their ephemeral short duration, and frequently lead to pain as a consequence. But it is not as though Epicurus rejects all kinetic pleasure, for this can be sought for intrinsic purposes with the caveat that it is done with prudence and moderation. This is part of what Epicurus demands of us when we are to make our pleasures choiceworthy: i.e., that we will have a view to our future states and that reason will accompany our choices. In sum, mental pleasures are greater than bodily ones (Cicero, De Fin. I.55), for they yield up a more pronounced duration of pleasure that does not bring over-excited states in the mind.[2] Epicurus does not vilify bodily pleasures through a prohibitive asceticism, but asks us to mediate these sorts of pleasures with a view to reason and virtue. The occasional indulgence is pardonable, but a sustained voluptuous living will produce a course far from the ideal of *ataraxia*.

There are instances when pains are necessary "evils" so to speak, but they must be productive. Though it might first appear counterintuitive, the endorsement of some pains proves fecund for a variety of reasons. For instance, the only way we know to avoid pains is through experience. This inevitably occurs when we encounter a new situation that we have never experienced that may produce a painful result (like the child who has yet to form the conception of a hot stove or experiencing a first heartbreak) from which we learn. These painful instances fortify our knowledge and allow us to make the appropriate choices in the future to avoid such pains. Another example would be those pains which produce pleasurable results, such as the rigours and stresses associated with learning; though the student may navigate upon stormy seas as he or she attempts to understand the instructive lesson, the result is finally the attainment of understanding, an

understanding which no doubt will produce pleasure.

We cannot pass over the importance of memory and experience in matters of choice. In fact, to choose one act over another to procure pleasure or lessen the degree of pain depends on possessing a knowledge as to what exactly promotes pleasure and pain. Memory, dependent upon time, image, and sensation, endows us with an archive of experiences we can draw upon in the face of making choices. Say, for instance, I wish to order a drink at a tavern. Because I have frequented taverns prior to this hypothetical event, and have sampled a number of the available liquors available for purchase, experience tells me that in the past I found a single malt scotch preferable to a blended whiskey. I know this because, having sampled both these drinks, I found the more aged drink to be more agreeable to my palate in relation to its alternative. The criteria for this judgement were my senses, which detected the two distinct tastes and allowed me to judge one as being more preferable to another. Having stored this event as memory allows me to pursue a course of action in the present towards that which evokes more pleasure. I have been thus conditioned by past pleasurable (or, by contrast, painful) experiences.[3] Memory does indeed present heuristic benefit in guiding one's future choices on the horizon of possibilities.

Memory also assists me in making choices between events I have never experienced if and only if there are constitutive elements in these possible events that hold similarity with my prior experiences. This is the reason why I can decline an offer to drink a glass of knives because experience has shown me that knives are sharp and are not meant to be drunk. Though I have never experienced drinking a glass of knives, memory allows me to conjoin the perilous sharpness of knives with the established fact that my flesh is easily cut by such instruments. In this sense, as absurd as this example may be, memory and experience act as our motivation to act, to choose between possible experiences. And, for Epicurus, this is essential to selecting that which will produce the sort of pleasure we seek, while having a view to prior events and to consequences of our decisions.

But we now have to consider accidental pleasures. Without experience and memory, any pleasures we happen upon would be accidental. And indeed it is in our earlier years when we are at our most formative that pleasures and pains occur through trial and error. But once these experiences are formed and edified in memory, we become, with the aid of reason and selection, more capable of procuring tranquil states. This state of tranquility may be another reason why Epicurus speaks highly of venerable years, for the course and direction to the goal of pleasure is more linearly demarcated without the hindrance of limited experience and the hot temper of youth. In our youth, inclinations fuelled by desires cause several deviations from the goal of pleasure, and it is only through the continued edification of memory and experience that we can attain a state untrammelled by unchecked desires. So it is in this vein that Epicurus does not privilege grand achievements as being on the course to *ataraxia*, for these entail enormously laborious efforts—and most oftimes at the risk and peril of inviting more pain than is necessary: "there is no need of actions which involve competition"(Epicurus, *Vatican Sayings* I 17). There is in this statement a blush of Stoicism, especially insofar as one is encouraged to not enter into competitive situations where victory is not already assured.

Epicurus is a monist, for he believes that only one property is intrinsically valuable—and here we should realize that both pleasure and pain are degrees of one property because pain itself is not existent per se, but only the characteristic absence of pleasure. In this way, the pain-pleasure relation is univocal insofar as both sensations represent one movement with two possible effects, but this monism is tempered by the fact that pleasure is considered in the affirmative and granted positive status in his metaphysical understanding. Pleasure is the "yardstick for judging every good thing"(Epicurus *Letter to Menoeceus* 127-32). This is not to say that Epicurus does not value virtues, but that they are secondary to the highest Good. Moreover, as a psychological hedonist, he attributes our pursuit of pleasure and aversion to pain to nature, as the 'mainspring' of our conduct. We will examine this in more detail as we proceed.

The state of *ataraxia* is an absence of pain, and is unconscious, because it entails that there be no motions in the flesh or soul that threaten its tranquil stability. It is a state of not wanting. However, this formulation raises an objection: how can that which is unconscious be equated with the supreme good? It is usually by conscious acts and understanding that we recognize the Good, and so for those critics who espouse a Protagorean view of unconscious human measure as being innately of the Good, this form of the Good will not assuage them. This same criticism follows upon the heels of another, mainly as regards the question concerning why Epicurus does not recognize the positive effects of pleasure itself rather than merely the cessation of longing. However, this criticism is quieted when we consider his fragments as a whole.

Thus far, our analysis has given us cause to prepare this argument, otherwise known as the Pleasure Theory of Goals:[4]

1) A person who desires or is motivated to produce a state of affairs commensurate with the acquisition of pleasure and the avoidance of pain will be thus motivated to prefer one state of affairs over another if and only if the person believes that his preference will produce the aforementioned goal.

2) If there exists a belief that pleasure can be acquired and pain avoided by committing to a course of action, this is in itself both a necessary and sufficient condition for a motivation to act in this regard.

3) And if there is a choice between two possible states of affairs, the person will choose that which will promise the greatest duration in a pleasurable circumstance in accord with (and assisted by) secondary virtues.

However, to make pleasure (or even happiness), our goal can be problematic owing to its elusive character. One has only to refer to John Stuart Mill's claim that happiness (or pleasure) cannot be achieved when we make it a goal in itself (cf. Mill's writings on Jeremy Bentham and the hedonic calculus). We must forget about it and have pleasure occur indirectly—just as we must not focus on sleep when trying to fall asleep, or just as squeezing a handful of sand will only succeed in causing the sand to slip away the more we tighten our grip. Once we reflect upon pleasure, especially when it is presently occurring, we negate it; we appear to posit ourselves outside the experience. Despite this paradox, however, our contention could be that the unconscious expression of pleasure does not threaten to be elusive, for we do not immediately

reflect upon it. Moreover, we cannot insist that Epicurus is doing anything more than setting the foundation for our actions, and that that which occurs as subsidiary is done in that spirit without reflection: that is, we come to express Epicureanism through a kind of instinct rather than a constant pause to reflect upon matters of choice. Perhaps this idea of non- reflection informs why Epicurus insisted that his disciples memorize his doctrines, for by being edified in the mind in said manner, the actions of choice and deliberation would become a matter of unconscious habit. This is echoed as a pedagogical tool in John Locke's notion of "cozening" children to knowledge through the use of amusements and rule-based games that are surreptitiously instructive.

One plaguing doubt still remains in terms of the explanatory cause of our so-called natural inclination to seek pleasure and avoid pain, and the inauguration of an entire ethical groundwork, something reminiscent of the criticism levelled against Democritus' ethics: though it is natural to seek pleasure and avoid pain, this state does not directly imply an "ought." How does a matter of fact compel us to choose in terms of ethical decisions? Deriving a normative claim from observing a purely descriptive behavioural phenomenon inherent in all human beings is pernicious, to say the least. For surely each of us is imbued with a tendency toward violence, but this tendency does not mean we necessarily ought to commit violent acts, to make beastly aggression a principle of endorsement. This process of deriving the "ought" from the "is" may be the corruption of the consistency of the principles themselves, for there are several observable instances of human behaviour that we could choose from to found an ethical stratagem. For example, Epicurus states that competition is an act incommensurate with pleasure; however, competition is observable in all species (for food, for mates, etc.). Why could we not espouse an ethical doctrine of competitive values, a Calliclesian ethics?[5] This is why it may be necessary to make links among the ethics, epistemology and physics, for this connection would fortify the foundation for the assertion of pleasure-seeking.

In evaluating any ethical principles, Epicurean or other, we should have recourse to the following criteria[6]:

1. To ensure that the principles are consistent in themselves.

2. To ensure that the principles contain intelligible notions.

3. To ensure that the principles are coherent with understanding and facts.

4. To ensure that the principles are theoretically sound and applicable.

5. To ensure that, if the principles are founded on more general principles, they do not produce incorrect implications to support what they assert.

6. To ensure that where there is contestation, there is not a misunderstanding of the positions or the terminology.

In the interests of confining the scope of our inquiry, we may here briefly evaluate Epicurus' ethics

according to these criteria. We have already shown above how there is a possible violation of the first proposition in terms of inconsistency. As for the second proposition, we find in the literature a seemingly well-bred consensus on the notions, linked consistently with appropriate definitions; however, one may take issue on the actual terms themselves.[7] Epicurus is careful in basing his ethical assertions upon matters of established fact, a modelling after observations of nature, so the third proposition is not violated. Considered in this paradigm, the ethics seem to withstand a continuous and consistent link between theory and practice, where all action is linked with the goal of pleasure, and so the fourth proposition is maintained. The problem with the fifth proposition can be viewed as a corollary of the problem of number one, for application may not follow from mere observation in this regard, the implications being highly selective in terms of observable fact at the exclusion of other natural symptoms of human beings that also may be witnessed. The last proposition seems more applicable to the gross misconstruing of Epicurean doctrine by the more ribald Cyrenaics, though both schools seem to share many of the same tenets in terms of epistemology and a few shared terms in their mode of ethics.[8]

Before we seek to establish some semblance of physical and epistemological foundation for the ethics, we shall return to Epicurus' "stasis theory" of *ataraxia* as a kind of litmus test for Epicurean ethics.

1. *Do we seek pleasure and avoid pain?*

This seeking is established by recourse to natural and observable facts of our behavioural disposition. There is nothing formally normative in the assertion that it is the case that we do indeed seek pleasure and avoid pain. It is merely a question of fact, this fact being learned through observation—the observation of existent things given credence by the truth of the senses, and the observation of several instances of pleasure seeking and pain-avoidance accumulating and sedimenting into memory. So, by an inductive process, memory and experience attest that the case is true.

2. *If so, are there harmful consequences?*

This matter can only be settled by an observation of the outcomes of a variety of pleasures, classified and enumerated by type, duration, and intensity.

Established here are the means of procuring pleasures, and a classification of these to determine which yields the most beneficial varieties. In terms of pain, that, too, is measured according to these terms.

3. *If harm is the result, what is its degree and duration?*

"Pain does not last continuously in the flesh: when acute it is there for a short time, while the pain… does not persist for many days"(Epicurus KD 4). It becomes established that some pleasures do produce eventual harm, such as continued bodily excesses, but these harmful delicacies are due to kinetic intensity, comparable to the burning coil of magnesium that emits high energy for a short duration or the quick exhaustion of phospho-creatine in the body. When the pleasures are of such intensity, they become quickly

extinguished, leaving in their wake a vacuum—a vacuum otherwise known as pain.

4. *If the degree and duration of pain are existent, is the risk of seeking pleasure and avoiding pain justifiable?*

As enumerated above, some pains are necessary and therefore justified in the future pursuit of pleasure. Of course, the goal of *ataraxia* does not take into full consideration the timeliness of acts (a necessary condition of memory and the ability to make reasoned choices), but at the time of Epicurus' writing, stasis theory (the belief that the mind and body are ideal in a state of complete rest) had been appended to by writers like Hermagorus, who added the notion of timeliness by adopting Gorgias' term of "kairos" (in Greek, the "right, or opportune moment" as distinct from chronos, or linear time taken as a whole).[9]

Speculative Links

Now that the basic precedents of Epicurean *ataraxia* have been established above, it may prove useful to engage in a few speculative considerations for future direction on this subject.

1. Conscious pleasurable states come to be from mediation with something outside the body, while unconscious pleasure (*ataraxia*) is equilibrium of the body where the forces of need and external forces are balanced, cancelled out. But due to the fact that there are objects that impinge upon the body, and an internal state that reacts to external stimuli and impels us to act (such as hunger), there is change in the bodily state toward pleasure. In order for desire or satiety to come to be, there must be a movement of the atoms to stimulate said responses (be their originating from an external source or deriving internally through imaginings). For nothing, including pleasure, can come to be out of nothing. This claim is an *ex nihilo nihil fit* argument ("nothing comes from nothing"). Something as mundane as hunger is a good example of this case. The desire to eat which accompanies hunger is due to an atomic cause: the body possesses fewer atoms over time due to the continued moulting of a constant emission of atoms, and this situation can only be restored to balance by a replenishment of substance, a claim echoed in Lucretius' *De Natura Rerum* to explain why objects and people don't simply just shrink until they vanish.

2. Pleasures must be in infinite supply and of differing varieties, for if pleasures were finite there would be the possibility that one day all pleasures would be exhausted and succeeding generations could not attain them. This conclusion is comparable to the explanation that there are an infinite amount of atoms that give rise to why things can continue to come into being (Lucretius I. 225-37). If pleasure or atoms were finite in number, and time is infinite, there would come a point when both would be exhausted.

3. In his *Letter to Herodotus* (39-40), Epicurus asserts that the reality of bodies is attested to by our senses, and that if there were no void, bodies would remain unmoved. We can here perform a case of

substitution, for it suffices to say that pleasure "exists" (or is perceivably existent in the mind) because our senses detect its presence. Moreover, if the means of pleasure did not have spaces which it could "occupy",: so to speak, those who were in the absence of a state of pleasure could never experience the presence of pleasure. Despite Aristotle's invective against the atomists' notion of vacuum, we retain it here to describe how movement is at all possible. And so, as well, pleasure is made distinct by what it is not; namely, its absence (or, pain).

4. Pleasure and the absence of pleasure (pain as the privative description of pleasure) are substantial qualities in the mind. Thoughts which incur painful desires of longing through imagination are not in themselves substantive, for it is in this instance that the mind complicates itself unnecessarily over that which is beyond its powers to procure. Real desires, by contrast, are felt in the body without the provocation of the mind. That is, the desires are produced by the bodily state, such as hunger and thirst Other forms of full desires by which the subject wishes to avoid the heat of a flame, or any such aversion, are originally founded by a bodily state that had in the past experienced the pain of non-avoidance, and so the mind does not provoke the act. However, it is formed by experience, and experience is formed by sensations, sensations that attest to the truth of objects, with those objects being the substantive ground of this so-called mental provocation. As for the full desires such as friendship that do not appear to have any external source of provocation, these may be attributable to the natural disposition of human beings to commune and avoid the pain of isolation, and so friendship takes on a role of utility beneficial to the subject.

5. Pleasures are by necessity varied, just as atoms are distributed in varying concentrations and sizes to account for the differentiation of objects, for if pleasures were not varied there would be no differentiation in terms of type. However, this does not entirely invalidate the Epicurus' monistic hypothesis, since pleasure is a univocal term with varied expressions.

6. We may equate pain with void, for if pain is defined privatively as the absence of pleasure, maybe there is a problem with our definition of pain, or our comprehension of the interaction between substance and void/privated substance. Because we cannot admit of a middle term, there is only pleasure and its absence in a spectrum. This middle term would be the curious absence of both pleasure and pain. "Pain" provides a location for pleasure just as the void provides a location for atoms. This movement allows for us to experience different degrees of pleasure over time.

It has been my hope that I have not taken too gross of a liberty with these conjectures, nor to have been too sparse with the expositional analysis as set forth from the start. This list is by no means an exhaustive account of the variety of ways we can attempt a reconciliation between Epicurean ethics and his physics, nor have we exhausted all the criticisms that can be levelled against the theory. More to the effect, it provides an example of the strategies we may utilize rather than an exemplary use of one strategy for the disclosure of a fully fleshed-out analysis. As I am more familiar with a process of ideas rather than arguments themselves, I hope that this attempt at argumentative rigour marks a growing trend toward a more refined approach to scholarship. More refined, yet still speculative.

Despite Epicurus' rarefied and sophisticated definition of pleasure as being the absence of pain (thereby hitching its definition on a non-affirmative instance), it is another pleasure narrative in a large arena of such attempts – attempts found in Descartes, Locke, Bentham, Nietzsche, Freud, and Moore. One of the dangers of Epicurean hedonism is its tendency to epistemologically transcendentalize pleasure in such a way as to make it a passage to the Good. However, one of the fringe benefits – and one that Epicurus himself may not have acknowledged – is found in the ethical domain: in *The Will to Power*, Nietzsche states that all morality and its impetus are based on principles of pain and pleasure. Or, more accurately, that of seeking pleasure and avoiding pain.

Notes

[1] A rival school of hedonism, the Cyrenaics – counting among its number the famed Aristippus – advocated for physical pleasure being the means to a good life.

[2] It should be noted that Cicero was a staunch admirer of Epicurean principles and makes frequent allusions to the words of Epicurus, explicitly or indirectly in his moral writings.

[3] This theory of conditioned behaviour can be found in P.T. Young: "The Role of Hedonic Processes in the Organization of Behaviour," in Psychological Review, LIX 1952, 249-62.

[4] The Pleasure Theory of Goals was originally advanced by Henry Sidgwick (cf. The Methods of Ethics, Bk. II, Ch. 3), and has since been discredited by leading ethicists and psychologists; however, we advance it here as a tentative derivation of the text's Epicurean assertions (1-3 above). It is also an attempt to reconcile ethical hedonism with psychological hedonism, although there is an inherent inference suggesting the impossibility of the subject's impartiality, making no room for any act that can be authentically altruistic.

[5] Callicles is the disputant in the Platonic dialogue, *Gorgias*. Callicles asserts that the few strong should dominate over the many weak. Socrates forces Callicles through maieutic argumentation that the many weak together could overcome the few strong in physical contest. Apart from this text being a foundational one for a study of rhetoric and linguistic reference theory, it also stands as a potential advocacy of democratic ideals. Nietzsche would wrest Callicles' point of the "few strong" in his own work, recasting it in terms of the will to power and (arguably) reconciling the 'ought' and 'is' of actions that have ethical basis.

[6] I am indebted to Richard B. Brandt for the succinct formulation of these criteria; see his Ethical Theory, Prentice Hall, 1962, 299-300.

[7] The risk of defining the derivatives of pleasure as a means of proposing actions on the basis of a stable definition presupposes that there is universal consensus on the very definition of what constitutes pleasure. In a survey of literature on the issue of pleasure, most philosophers vary in terms of what constitutes

pleasure. Bentham, for example, constructs a pseudo-empirical evaluation of pleasure in terms of certain activities possessing a certain number of "hedons." The danger of definitional complicity in this regard is compounded thus further by placing them in a value-based hierarchy.

[8] I base this claim on the informative work done in this area by Voula Tsouna, especially in <u>The Epistemology of the Cyrenaic School</u> (Cambridge University Press 1998) where the rival claims and mutual affinities between the two schools are given a fair and clarified treatment.

[9] For a more developed notion of Greek time, cf. Gilles Deleuze, <u>The Logic of Sense,</u> wherein he discusses the fundamental metaphysical differences between chronos and aion in particular without soliciting the notion of kairos.

The Evolution and Development of Central Administration in Ebiraland, 1920-1997.

By Victor Osaro Edo

Abstract

Ebiraland constitutes one of the ethnic groups in the Middle Belt zone of Nigeria. It, however, did not evolve a centralized form of leadership until the advent of the British colonial authorities, which brought together the various Ebira groups under the leadership of Attah Omadivi in 1902. The year 1902 therefore marked the evolution of a monarchical form of administration and the gradual development of central administration in Ebiraland. The paper will therefore examine the nature of the development of central administration in Ebiraland between 1902 and 1997, when the present incumbent monarch, Ado Ibrahim, ascended the throne as the Ohinoyi of Ebiraland.

Introduction

Ebiraland is a small hilly inland area that stretches roughly for twenty three kilometres west of the Niger at Ajaokuta and thirty two kilometers south-west of the Niger-Benue confluence. The range of hills occasionally rises to six hundred and sixty seven metres above sea level. With the exception of natural barriers like forest reserves, practically, the area which is about eighty square kilometers has been occupied and what started as tiny villages have joined together as near towns, gradually and progressively expanding towards one another in modern times. Ebiraland thus presents an aerial view of one huge settlement with intervening barriers.

Today, in a Nigeria of thirty-six states, the Ebira people are located in the present Kogi State. Farming is their major occupation. Several Ebira people, however, are scattered all over Nigeria, particularly in Edo, Ondo, Kwara, Plateau and Benue States where they are well known as indefatigable farmers.

The Ebira people are generally believed to be of Jukun origin. Oral tradition favours this theory and also claims its ultimate ancestry from the Jukun of Wukari[1]. The people are said to have resented the central administrative authority of the Junkuns in the Wukari area of the Kwararafa kingdom. Thus, the Ebira, like other disparate ethnic groups, migrated under their leader whose actual personal name has remained unknown, though one account has it that he was called Ebira.[2] They migrated frequently and at different times from one unsuitable spot to another as an expression of their resentment against tyrannical rule, among other reasons. In the case of the former reasons, they did so in order to free themselves from the resented bondage and clutches of the Jukuns and headed southwards before the end of the sixteenth century.[3] However, they were settled at home in groups without a centralised authority until the advent of colonial rule which brought them together under a central leadership. If there was any form of centralization in Ebiraland, it was in the sphere of religion. Politically, the different groups and settlements had independent clan heads with different nomenclatures. Hence, the Ebira people did not evolve a centralised political leadership and had no paramount chief before the British occupation of the area in 1902.

Pre-Colonial Ebira community was essentially segmentary. It consisted of five principal clans among several others, namely, Okengwe, Eika, Okehi, Adavi, and Ihima. The respective priests (heads) of these clans were known as Ohindase, Adeika, Ohiomahi, Asema and Obonbanyi.[4] Each clan was self- governing and did not regard any other as superior to it. Significantly, the clan was the main unit of political organization. The post of the clan head was normally conferred on the oldest living male member of the clan. His religious duties and disciplinary powers were, however, limited to his own family. His political influence was quite small and although he presided over the meetings of his clan, his judgement was determined largely by the consensus of opinion of the elders.

Economically, the clan head held in trust for the clan, part of the income from all the clan lands, such as the produce from palm oil and locust bean trees, during the pre-colonial period. Also, the leg of whatever game that was killed was given to him, which he shared with the kindred heads[5].

Early Administration

In the pre-colonial times, the administration of all the clan heads constituting a community in Ebiraland lay in the hands of the elders, influential individuals and the chief priest (Ohinoyi).[6] The group of elders consisted of the clan heads, kindred heads and other people whose age, maturity and wisdom commended themselves to the other elders. The composition of this group was more-or-less constant because whenever the representative of a clan died, his place was taken by another member of the same clan. For this reason, the group could, in fact, be termed the council of elders. Its meeting normally took place in the market place or any other central open place[7], as was the case with the Igbo in the pre-colonial period. In the same vein, Habibu A. Sani argues that in those early days of the ancestors, whenever there was a problem to be collectively solved or a special occasion to be celebrated, the clan heads and age-group leaders usually put their heads together at a family meeting where possible solutions were debated and agreed[8].

An influential individual (Onoru) might be any man (apart from the Chief Priest) who, because of personal attainments in wealth, war, physical or margical power had won the respect of others and could become famous not only in his own clan group , but throughout Ebiraland.[9] However, he had no political authority in other clan groups. By virtue of his position in society, he normally succeeded in imposing his will upon others or in getting the meeting of the council of elders to respect his views. He could therefore be regarded as the *de facto* head or co-ordinator of the council of elders. In many respects, the Onoru's word was law because the people feared going against him as he could deal with them severely through the use of physical force or otherwise. In fact, this was the main, apart from the council of elders, around whom political authority revolved. The meeting of elders could hardly take a decision whenever he was absent, because it was realized that were he to be opposed to it, he could obstruct its execution[10]. The philosophy and practice was that might was right, and so it was in practice.

The office of the chief priest was rotated, from clan to clan or from kindred to kindred. The chief priest was the overall religious head of the Ebira community and the position was occupied on a rotational basis among the five major clans that formed the community. It was the responsibility of the clan whose turn it was to provide an incumbent. On this ground, one can talk of central leadership in Ebiraland, which had the responsibility of co-ordinating the affairs of the council of elders in the pre-colonial period. The function of the office was basically religious. The chief priest saw to the well-being of the society. He made sure that peace was maintained in the land and settled quarrels among the clans whenever the need arose. Politically, he was usually responsible for calling the meetings of the council of elders to discuss and decide on any pressing problem(s) in the interest of the community. The office of the chief priest did not normally go to the oldest man, but to a middle-aged man, though maturity was a considerating factor[11]. Two or more candidates might compete or be earmarked for the position, but it was up to the meeting of the council of elders of the clan to decide who was the most suitable.[12]

Knowledge of the priesthood and the various rituals as well as divination, by the would-be or prospective candidate, were of advantage. The people who had the final say in the selection process and determined who was chosen were the diviners.[13] If they all agreed that the proposed man had divine support, all was well. Nobody would be made chief priest against the decision of the diviners and hardly would any individual ever dare to assume the office without divine support. Having been selected, the failure to perform his duties or the occurrence of calamities during a priestly tenure of office could mean death for him and it would mean a bad reputation for his clan, which sometimes led to its being excluded from holding the chieftaincy[14].

The duties of the Chief priest, therefore, were primarily religious; to keep the land or the country good. He presided over all public religious occasions and fertility cult ceremonies and was closely identified with the crops. The supervision and the timing of the annual nocturnal ancestral worship festival was one of his most important duties because it was believed that unless the festival was celebrated at the correct time, calamity would follow[15]. In sum therefore, the chief priest performed religious, political and economic functions and was the rallying force until the colonial period, when a new kind of political leadership, to bring all Ebira communities under a central authority was fashioned out by the British colonialist through

their policy or method of divide and rule.

The Advent of the British

The foregoing observations were in place when the British conquered Ebiraland in 1902. In the light of the British system of administration, the political organization in Ebiraland did not meet the aspirations of the British administrators; hence there was the need for a central leader to whom authority could be delegated by the British colonial power. The Ebira were therefore forced to look for an influential person to take charge of the affairs of the area under the British administration. This was the beginning of real central administration in a society that was hitherto non-centralised. The influential individual and the chief priest would not fit into the kind of central leadership required by the indirect rule system as neither of them was ready to submit to the control of the British authorities. Reference is made below to the role of Agidi, an influential individual, who stood against British occupation of Ebiraland. However, the British created one and imposed him on the Ebira as we shall demonstrate below.

Meanwhile, the evolution of central administration in Ebiraland, which resulted in the emergence of a monarchical institution, was not without some difficulties. First, was the task of turning a non-centralised society into a unitary administration. Second, was how to get a unifying leader acceptable to all. And third, was whether any clan was ready to surrender its independence to another. Nonetheless, the Ebira people were used to coming together in the face of crisis. Thus, in moments of war, they came together as a united front to ward off the incursion of the enemy. Indeed, the Ebira people had built strong confidence in their warfare and 'superior' weapons – bows and arrows. The invasion of Ebira country by the Nupe (1865-1900) did not make them doubt their military superiority.[16] The Nupe invaders were successfully resisted by the Ebira under a leader who later became Attah Omadivi. The Nupe invasion was organized in the form of raids for slaves. But the Ebira people were soon to realize that their warfare and their 'superior' weapons could not defend them against the British in 1902. In 1895, an outstation was placed at Kabba by the Royal Niger Company and a fort was built there by Captain Turner, an officer attached to the Niger Constabulary[17].

On 1st January, 1900, Frederick Lugard took over the government of Northern Nigeria from the Royal Niger Company and hoisted the British flag at Lokoja[18]. Kabba was formed into a province which included the Akoko, Kukuruku and Ebira countries, and was administered from Lokoja, which was also the head-quarters of the protectorate of Northern Nigeria, with Sir William Wallace as its first Resident.

In 1902, a small military escort led by Mr. Malcom and Lt. F.F.W. Byng-Hall sent into Ebira country was seen by the Ebira people as an incursion[19]. They refused to meet with the British demand for the supply of food, seeing this as a direct insult on their persons. Mr. Malcom and his party, outnumbered, were attacked with arrows by the Ebira and escaped by a night march to Kabba, arriving the next day. The British soldiers used this as casus belli and marched on them with fire arms. The Ebira country was subjugated and

pacified. The resident in Ebiraland described the result of the expedition as follows: "The Ebira were no doubt severely punished during the expedition and I now find them very afraid of the whiteman"[20]

With the defeat of the Ebira, the British then imposed their rule on them, politically uniting the various clans by force. The question that follows from here is: how did the British succeed in their mission? In an attempt to answer this question and trace the evolution of the institution of the monarchy in Ebiraland as from 1902, it is worth noting that in the British colonial history, the policy of indirect rule featured very prominently. Indirect rule was a principle whereby the people were ruled through their own traditional institutions. Indirect rule as conceived by Lord Lugard was a dynamic system of Local government. The use of indigenous political institutions for the purpose of Local government was contingent upon certain modifications to the institutions. In places where there were no centralised leadership, the British administrators imposed one on the community. According to Michael Crowder:

> The administrations imposed by the occupying powers were adhoc and greatly influenced by the personality of the man imposing them and the circumstances under which an area was being occupied, whether by treaty or by conquest. More important was the society to be governed. Different techniques were employed to govern the large centralised state, the small independent village, and the nomadic tribe.[21]

The British Conquest and the Imposition of Central Administration

During the British occupation of Ebiraland, Agidi, one of the notable personalities among the Ebira, led an armed resistance against any form of British rule. In 1902, he and his men attacked the small British group led by Mr. Malcom, the political officer.[22] The latter barely escaped death. After this event, Ebiraland was declared a land of 'savages' and Mr Malcom ordered a detachment of the West African Frontier Force (WAFF) to sit among them in order to 'tame' them.[23]

In 1903, a punitive expedition under Major Marsh, Lieutenants Sparrenbarg, Moran, Byng-Hall, Gallway, Smith, Oldman and Captain Lewis, was organized to call Agidi to order and to establish permanent peace in Ebiraland.[24] In this expedition, the British received the whole hearted co- operation of Omadivi, who was the representative of Ohindase Abogunde – the chief priest at the time. Omadivi, like Ohindase, was from the Okengwe clan. Omadivi supplied vital information, most especially on how to capture Agidi who was his political rival.[25] In fact, both Omadivi and Agidi were notable personalities or influential individuals in the Ebira of that time. While the former was loyal to the Chief priest, the latter was not. By 1904, Ebiraland was fully pacified and Mr. Morgan, the Resident of Kabba province, was able to say with confidence that the Ebira people now feared the "whiteman" and were at "peace with each other".[26]

In gratitude to his co-operation, Omadivi was made the "Oivo Ohinoyi" (the whiteman's chief) of Ebiraland. Omadivi could be compared with chief Dogho of Warri.[27] The latter provided skilled men and

war canoes for the British in the Ebrohimi expedition of 1894. In the Benin expeditions of 1896-1897, Dogho was also at hand to aid the British. His services were appreciated and he was rewarded by being made the Governor of the Benin river.[28] Likewise, the leadership of Ebiraland fell on Omadivi in 1903 because of his loyalty to the British and he took the title of Attah,[29] synonymous with the title of the neighbouring Igala monarch.

Although the British appointed Attah Omadivi as the chief of Ebiraland, his power, until his death in 1917, was little felt outside his own clan. This was largely so because his appointment was not marched with the establishment of Native Administration. His appointment as the paramount chief nevertheless paved the way for the effective centralised political leadership that followed the establishment of a Native Authority in 1923.

Attah Omadivi died in 1917 and was succeeded by Arudi Adano who died within a few months. Not much was known about the short reign of Adano, the second Attah appointed by the British. However, his death in 1917 opened the stage for a fierce struggle for the position of paramount chief by a number of notable personalities.

There was therefore a search for a central chief whose loyalty and confidence, like Attah Omadivi, the British could vouch for. An influential man to take charge of the Native Administration was needed. Sir Frederick Lugard's policy was to look for a capable man of influence to take charge of the Native Administration and through him the colonial authorities were to rule the indigenous populace. The British system of indirect rule was, after the 1914 Amalgamation, extended to the Southern provinces. In the eastern Nigeria, for example, warrant chiefs were appointed.[30] As far as the "Primitive Communities" in the north were concerned, Lugard stated that:

> The first step is to endeavour to find a man of influence as chief, and to group under him as many villages or districts as possible, to teach him to delegate powers and to take interest in "Native Treasury", to support his authority and to inculcate a sense of responsibility.[31]

In Ebiraland, after a tortuous struggle for the stool by many prominent leaders among whom were Ozigizigi, Owada Adidi, Onoruoiza Ibrahim and many others, the man of influence found was Onoruoiza Ibrahim,[32] who represented Attah Omadivi in colonial administration. As we shall soon find out, Omadivi and Ibrahim were relations. Besides, Ibrahim was fairly literate, which enabled him to relate easily with the British administrators. He was therefore picked as Chief of the land. He also took the title of Attah. He reigned for thirty seven years from 1917 to 1954. In the official records he was simply referred to as Attah Ibrahim. Nonetheless, he faced serious oppositions from his people throughout his reign as he was considered an imposition by the British. Even then, towards the latter part of his reign he fell out with the British authorities, especially Sharwood Smith, the then British Governor of northern Nigeria.

Unlike Omadivi, his predecessor, Attah Ibrahim was made the paramount chief not only over Ebiraland but also over non-Ebira areas, such as Lokoja, Ogori, and Magongo.[33] His area of jurisdiction, which extended

over 1520 sq[2] kilometres, became one of the largest in the northern Nigeria. Byng- Hall remarked in 1923 that if Attah Ibrahim had been an Hausa or born in one of the Hausa States, he would have been made an Emir.[34] In the same year, he was promoted to a third class chief grade which was then the highest in the Kabba province.[35]

As the paramount chief of the Ebira Division, Attah Ibrahim became the sole Ebira Native Authority controlling Grade B Court, which was the highest in the Division. The court could try criminal cases, pass bye-laws concerning marriage, divorce and inheritance. It could also impose jail sentences up to six months. In the newly created Ebira Division and Ebira Native Authority therefore, Attah Ibrahim was vested with wide powers. F.F.W. Byng-Hall who had been the brain behind the creation remarked that the Attah Ibrahim's appointment as the paramount chief was "really the first time there has been any sort of one man administration."[36] But who was this Attah Ibrahim? What qualifications or qualities did he have to warrant his appointment?

Attah Ibrahim was the son of Zainebu (popularly known as Iy'ebe), who was a powerful and wealthy trader and a renowned figure in Ebira country. Zainebu was the daughter of the deceased "Oivo Ohinoyi", Attah Omadivi. Attah Ibrahim was also the maternal great grandson of the celebrated Ohindase Abogunde[37].

Descent wise, Attah Ibrahim was connected with the two most renowned families in Ebiraland, namely Omadivi and Ohindase Abogunde. But descent in traditional Ebira society as Y.A. Ibrahim correctly pointed out, "did not necessarily qualify one to hold any important state office"[38] Moreover, in a patrilineal society like Ebira, premium is not placed on connection through the female line.

If maternal descent disqualified Ibrahim from holding an important public office, his personal qualities, loyalty and service to the colonial government endeared him to the British administrators, especially Byng-Hall. Besides, the position of Ebira central chief was a colonial creation and so anybody could succeed to it. Attah Ibrahim had better chances than most people in Ebiraland. He thus became the custodian of Ebira political institutions until he voluntarily resigned in 1954.

A young and energetic man, Attah Ibrahim was a devout muslim. He received his early Islamic education from Mallam Abdul Salami of Ilorin. He later proceeded to Bida for further Islamic studies.[39] He was knowledgeable and fluent in Hausa, Nupe, Arabic and could write some English. Between 1908 and 1911, he was in the company of some British political officers, among whom was captain F.F.W. Byng-Hall serving them loyally as an interpreter and a messanger. In 1917, he was the tax assessment scribe for Byng-Hall. Attah Ibrahim served the colonial officers so loyally that Byng-Hall remarked that "I have found him of great use in dealing with the Ebira".[40]

However, in spite of all these qualities, Attah Ibrahim soon fell out with the British especially Sharwood Smith, the Governor of northern Nigeria, for his opposition to British rule as time went on. He was therefore seen by the authorities as biting the fingers that fed him. Unfortunately too, his people or subjects went against him as they clamoured for democratic rule and representation in the Ebira Native Authority

where the Attah was the Sole Native Authority. It was this quests for democratic practice, as the wind of change was blowing, that swept off Attah Ibrahim from office, though he resigned voluntarily in 1954. Two years later in 1956, the Ebira Native Authority elected an ex-serviceman, Alhaji Mohammed Sani Omolori who had been in the forefront of the struggle against the Attah as the monarch of Ebiraland. He nevertheless took the title of Ohinoyi, the implication of which was that the monarch this time around was not an imposition and was subject to the will of the people.

Indeed, throughout the forty years of Alhaji Sani Omolori on the throne of Ebiraland as monarch, he did not possess the political weal of the late Attah Ibrahim. Whereas the Attah typified the example of a self-willed monarch, the Ohinoyi could not do anything without the consent of the Ebira Traditional Council until he died in 1996. There is no doubt therefore that throughout the forty years of Alhaji Sani Omolori on the throne (1956-1996), the Ebira Traditional Council dictated the pace and accounted for the relative peace in Ebiraland during his reign. His was the case of a ruler who was placed on the throne by his people and consequently ruled according to their desire.

After 1996 however, the relative peace witnessed during that era is no more. At the death of Sani Omolori in 1996, it was difficult for a successor to emerge. When at last one did emerge, it would appear that it went to the highest bidder: somebody who had regarded himself as 'His Royal Highness' even when an incumbent was on the throne. With the backing of the authorities that be, he succeeded in imposing him self on the Ebira in the same manner that the British imposed the late Attah Ibrahim, his father on the Ebira then. Thus, since April, 1997, Alhaji Ado Ibrahim, a business tycoon had occupied the seat of the Ohonoyi of Ebiraland.

In the bid to resolve the institutional problem, the government of Kogi State did two things. First was that the monarchy will be rotated among the five major clans identified at the beginning of this study and secondly, that the title of the Ohinoyi be retained as the official title of the monarch and not that of the Attah, which the incumbent monarch would have very much loved to be associated with as his father was the first and only Attah[41]

As it is, for eighty years, the monarchy in Ebiraland with its attendant problems has come to stay. It would appear, however, that it was the reign of Attah Ibrahim(1917-1954) in spite of the criticisms against his person that accounts for the major infrastructural as well as educational developments of Ebiraland to which little may have been added since 1954. Such developmental projects embarked upon and completed during his reign include: the Okene Water Wooks, the Okene District Council, the Okene Central Mosque, construction of roads, the Okene Middle School, the Sudan Interior Mission Health Centre, the Okene post office among others.[42]

From the foregoing, his reign witnessed pioneering activities in all areas of human endeavours. In fact, in the area of politics he was a dominant leadership figure as he was a thorn in the flesh of the British and the emirs of the House of Chiefs between 1947 and 1954.[43] He was responsible for consolidating the land that is Ebira today. Many years after his death, it has been argued that only very little has been added to

the development of Ebiraland, while a great deal of the above highlighted infrastructure, particularly the Okene Water Works, has collapsed. However, the downward trend in development can be likened to the general malaise pervading the entire Nigerian nation in recent times.

Conclusion

In conclusion, it can be asserted that the British indirect administration gave birth to the Monarchy in Ebiraland. The British succeeded in bringing together groups of non-centralised communities (clans) under a central leadership, now resident in Okene, which only comparatively sprang from Okengwe. Since 1917, Ebiraland has only seen the reign of three monarchs namely: the Attah Ibrahim (1917-1954), Sani Mohammed Omolori (1956-1996) and Alhaji Ado Ibrahim (from April 1997 to date). However, it is significant that British administration in Ebiraland is nothing short of a revolution. The revolution saw not only the emergence of a monarchial system of government, rather it brought an hitherto non-centralised societies under a common leader and hence got the people united under one central authority. Today, the Ebira could speak with one voice in spite of the various existing settlements into which they were grouped as clans in the pre-colonial era.

Notes

1. T.N. Tamuno, "Peoples of the Niger Benue Confluence" in J.F. Ade-Ajayi and I. Espie (eds), <u>A Thousand Years of West African History</u>, Ibadan: I.U.P 1965) P. 212.

2. H.A. Sani, <u>Sociology of the Ebira Tao People of Nigeria</u> (Ilorin: University of Ilorin Press, 1993) p.6.

3. Ibid. P.6

4. Z.O. Apata, "Boundary Delimitation and the Merger of Ogori/Magongo With Igbira Division, 1918-1966: A study of the problems of changing Political and Cultural Identity" (M.A. Dissertation, University of Ibadan, Ibadan, 1978) P.14

5. Y.A. Ibrahim "Igbira Traditional Institutions" Unpiblished Article (1974) P. 10.

6. Ibid. P. 10

7. Ibid. P. 11

8. H.A. Sani, <u>op. cit </u>P. 10

9. Y.A. Ibrahim, <u>op. cit</u> P. 12

10. Ibid P. 13

11. Ibid. P. 14

12. Ibid. P. 14

13. Ibid P. 14

14. Ibid. P. 14

15. Ibid. P. 15

16. This invasion is referred to as the Ajinomo war.

17. Y.A. Ibrahim, "The search for Leadership in a Nigerian Community. The Igbira Tao C1865-1954" (M.A. Dissertation, A.B.U. Zaria, 1968) p. 156.

18. A.H.M. Kirk-Greene, <u>Lugard and Amalgamation of Nigeria: A Documentary</u> Record, (London: Frank Cass, 1968).

19. C.R. Niven, 'Geography and Ethnography of Kabba Province" (1926)

20. N.A.K. B. Morgan, "Kabba Provincial Monthly Reports", January 1904 ACC 64.

21. M. Crowder, <u>West Africa under colonial Rule,</u> (London: Hutchinson,1968).

22. K.V. Elphinstone (comp) <u>Gazetter of Ilorin Province</u>

23. Ibid. PP. 10-30 24.

24. Ibid. PP. 10-30.

25. Y.A. Ibrahim, "The Search for Leadership in a Nigerian Community <u>op. cit</u>. P. 102

26. Ibid P. 102

27. Ikime, "Chief Dogho: The Lugardian System in Warri 1917-1932" in the <u>Journal of the Historical Society of Nigeria (J.H.S.N.),</u>Vol. III, December, 1965 P. 313.

28. Ibid. P. 313.

29. N.A.K. D.O.O. File Wel/1936 Vol. 1 History of Igbira.

30. A.E. Afigbo, The Warrant Chiefs: Indirect rule in South eastern Nigeria, 1891-1929, (London, Longman,1972).

31. Sir F.D. Lugard, "Report on the Amalgamation of Northern and Southern Nigeria and Administration" in A.H.M. Kirk-Green (ed) Lugard and Amalgamation of Nigeria: A Documentary Record (Frank Cass, 1968) P. 49.

32. Y.A. Ibrahim, "The Search for Leadership in a Nigeria Community" Op. cit. P. 224.

33. N.A.I. CSO 26/2 File No. 12941 Kabba Province Annual Report 1923 PP. 12-15 N.A.K. Loko Prof. File 3647/1923 Igbira Division, creation of NAK S.N.P. 9 3647/1923 – Igbirra Division (Kabba Province) creation of

34. N.A.K. Loko Prof. File 3647/1923 Igbirra Division, creation of

35. N.A.K. S.N.P. 17/2/ File 10756 Vol. 1, Ethnographical Notes on the Tribes in Kabba province.

36. N.A.K. Loko Prof. File 128/1922, Kabba District Amalgamation of

37. Y.A. Ibrahim, The search for Leadership in a Nigerian community… op. cit P. 124.

38. Ibid. P. 124

39. N.A.K. Loko Prof. 28, Diary of Captain Byang-Hall, Resident, Kabba province, 1924.

40. Ibid.

41. Even now, the matter is yet to be resolved, as it remains one of the sources of tension between the monarchy and the people in Ebiraland.

42. These developmental projects were some of the achievements carried out during the thirty seven years' reign of Attah Ibrahim from 1917-1954.

43. The various debates in the sessions of the Northern Nigerian Legislative council and House of Chiefs between 1947-1954 showed that Attah Ibrahim was a fearless nationalist, for which he must have incurred the wrath of the British Administrators.

Mediating New Technology: the Realization of a Digital Intellect.

By Paul Booth

Introduction

One of the more difficult aspects to deal with in the academic study of contemporary media is that technology often becomes out-dated or obsolete within years – or even months – which limits the effectiveness of critical study. Technology changes at an exponential rate, and perhaps nothing changes faster than home entertainment. In recent years there has been an explosion in the availability of consumer-priced electronics to make even the most techno-phobic user a home video pioneer. From TiVo to HDTV, from Blu-Ray to Plasma screens, the sheer influx of new technology creates a disarmingly high volume of "technology" to write about. And as rapidly as technology changes, so too does the type of "thinking" – the intellect – of media consumers change. New media technology lies at the forefront of a rapidly changing mindset in consumers. As Steven Johnson points out in *Everything Bad is Good for You*, new media has encouraged "more intellectually demanding" viewers – audience members whose intellects have been stimulated and advanced by the demands that new media places upon them (9). As part and parcel of new technology's ability to enact new ways of thinking, contemporary technology claims to offer a way for users to get closer to the text than previous technology allowed. As pointed out in *Nebula 4.3*, audiences are becoming more and more familiar with this type of interactive technology: Atkinson writes about how her film *Crossed Lines* which "presents a malleable form of digital fiction" that allows audiences to control not only what they view, but how they view it ("Crossed," 96). By introducing aspects of interactivity to a media product, and changing the nature of the encoding of media messages, media producers of new technology like the DVD declare that the "text" is becoming easier for the audience to grasp.

In this paper, I show how technology changes not just the demarcation between media reception and production, but also the fundamental change in thinking – a change I call "digital intellect." A digital intellect has two, paradoxical, meanings. First, it values and understands the impact that technology has on the reception of mediated entertainment. Second, as the term "digital" implies, it represents a fundamental binary opposition between audience and produce. Just as digital files read as either "1" or "0," a digital

intellect reads media as determined by its own production. Through an understanding of the DVD and its false interactivity, we can observe this new digital intellect.

The first meaning of "digital intellect" indicates a change in our cultural mindset. As Johnson says, the reception of new media is "enhancing our cognitive faculties" (12). The popularity of new media that has seen the creation of a digital intellect, has also exceeded current technological bounds. This mediation, however, is severely limited by current technological allowances. As I show, despite these changes in media, when new technology is mediated through an old medium, they cannot reach their full potential.

The second meaning of "digital intellect" is more determined, as we find that viewers are often faced with an "either/or" choice, which is advertised as interactivity. This paper concentrates on this latter view of digital intellect, to expound upon the former: while current scholarship in media and technology has seen a rapid evolution, viewers may not yet have caught up to the possibilities of their own "digital intellect." Because of this digital intellect that has formed in modern audiences, areas of scholarship that have been relatively static for years have seen a dynamism. This paper examines two closely related areas of media criticism and identifies how they have changed with a rise in digital intellect. By examining a specific text – in this case, a "choose-your-own-adventure" DVD of the 2006 film *Final Destination 3 (FD3)* – I show how new technology can stymie mediation. Digital intellect, however, forces old technology to work with new media. To see how this new intellect forms, I will first describe the relationship between technology and mediation. I then examine how the process of "encoding" and "decoding" functions, both in an Old Media context, as well as in a new media manner, to enable a digital intellect in the audience. Further, I examine how the issue of "encoding" and "decoding" is, at heart, an issue of genre. Finally, I explore the implications of interactive audiences and DVD technology. What I conclude, however, is that no matter how many interactive or user-centric decisions a DVD offers, the user is *not* given a truly interactive experience. The DVD of *FD3* presents itself as interactive, because audience members are given choices throughout the film to determine the paths the characters will travel. Yet these are false choices, a *false interactivity*. Because the medium has not yet caught up to the capabilities allowed through the DVD technology, and because modern audiences now perceive through a digital intellect, DVD technology has been subsumed by the televisual medium. Indeed, because audiences are already primed to be active and interpretive, new technology like the DVD mirrors, rather than produces, an interactivity that is inherently present in the technology. Digital intellect is here realized in an audience with a strong mental sense of new media. My paper concludes that interactive technology based in Old Media (i.e., technology like the DVD that must be presented in a televisual format) can only give the impression of interactivity, and that, instead of new media needing new technology, in reality it is new technology that demands new mediation.

Digital Intellect, Media, and Technology

As stated above, by "digital intellect" I refer to the ways in which new media have created a different and novel way for audiences to interpret and respond to media. In the past, audience responses to media

were analyzed in a variety of ways. In 1956 psychologists Donald Horton and R. Richard Wohl formulated their "para-social interaction" theory of spectatorship. In this, they stressed that viewers of media can form social bonds to both characters and real individuals on television. Horton and Wohl determined that although "para-social interaction … is analogous to and in many ways resembles social interaction in ordinary primary groups," it is not "true" interaction between two people (229). In other words, viewers often form bonds with the personas they witness onscreen, and these bonds have a place in their life that resembles the place of bonds between real people. The characters on television are perceived as real and not fictionalized to these viewers, because their lives are so closely followed that they become as intimately known as real people. This one-sided social bond helped to show how audiences could appear active towards a media text.

However, as new technology has allowed audiences to further explore media, both as entertainment and as epicenter of identity construction[1], these audiences have developed a technological savvy that extends past media's former constraints. Specifically, as Steven Johnson states, popular media have been "growing increasingly complex over the past few decades" and have been "exercising our minds in powerful new ways" (13). He specifies the ways in which audiences interpret media create different ways of thinking, but insinuates that this is related to technology. For instance, he claims that television programming before the advent of the VCR tended to have more linear and less complex plots. Today, with television on DVD readily accessible to anyone with a Blockbuster card or a Netflix account, television shows have gotten more complex, with greater character development and storylines that stretch across seasons. In other words, technology has changed media, and with that change, the ways in which audiences interpret that technology has increased their digital intellect.

Nan Adams, as well, shows that knowledge can come in many forms. She writes that "technological advancements have allowed fluency across all cultures and at the same time have rapidly increased our ability for information gather, storage and retrieval," and that in this, "a new intelligence has begun to emerge" (94). This "digital intelligence" has emerged in "our postmodern pluralistic global culture" and increases "our ability to develop effective strategies" (93). This change, seen through the ways in which media and technology interact with an audience, affect not just the ways in which audiences *see* media, but also the way in which audiences *think*. New technology lies at the heart of this change.

In this paper, I shall use the term "media" to refer to anything that represents, or attempts to represent, something else and the term "technology" as the vessel through which this mediation occurs. In this case, new media would refer to digital media that has emerged in the past decade or so, and Old Technology would be the means by which Old Media would have been broadcast or sent out before digital technology. In other words, media is the presentation of content through a channel; technology, alternatively, is simply the mechanics of the production of that channel.

Media and Technology

Of course, it must be asked if media scholars can find use in studying "technology." I would like to posit that although the line between media and the technology that mediates may be slim, it is an important one. Brian Winston, for one, articulates the blurring of this line in the introduction to his history of communication technology: he writes that there is a "historical pattern of change and development in communication" and that it resides with a change in the mediation of "technology" (3). Further, McLuhan famously quoted that the "medium is the message," linking, at least for him, the communicative abilities of a single medium and the meaning of the output from that medium (7). Yet, does this mediation change with different technology? For each medium, different communicative aspects of the mediation do, in fact, occur, and these can be linked to the technology of mediation. For example, although both VHS tapes and DVDs are viewed through a technological device (VCR, DVD-player) on a technological device (television), the interpreted mediation of both is significantly different. The inherent properties of the *technology* foster a different viewing habit in the audience. Because DVDs can be paused at exact frames, flipped from chapter to chapter, scanned at different speeds, stopped and started precisely, and even hyperlinked from primary feature to secondary feature and back again, the experience of watching a DVD is different from watching a VHS tape, where the basic mechanics of stop, start, pause, fast-forward and rewind encompass the majority of the options. The technology of the DVD changes the way that we watch mediated and recorded entertainment on television, and helps foster differences between the receptions of the mediated text.

Yet, in many ways, the current use of the DVD continues to be mired by the mediated style of traditional electronic media, like television. As Atkinson writes, "Instead of harnessing the capabilities of the medium whereby new genres of interactive storytelling could be conceived, what we are witnessing is the effect characteristic of Remediation, whereby old media is recycled, reformatted and delivered through a different channel" ("Versatility," 23). Atkinson here references Bolter and Grusin's formulation of "Remediation," the powerful notion that all media simply reuse the material from previous media. Key to the production of the DVD, however, is that producers make use of the *notion* of interactivity – a feature *not* remediated from previous media – and thereby highlight the digital intellect of the viewership. Viewers, aware of the *capabilities* of a medium, become enamored with its possibilities.

One way of highlighting the interactive components of the DVD is in the extra-textual features. For example, the relationship authors Brookey and Westerfelhaus had with the DVD text of *Fight Club* was substantially different than what would have occurred on VHS. For Brookey and Westerfelhaus, the DVD of *Fight Club* offered rich secondary sources of information, including background featurettes and commentaries that "offered fresh and valuable insights" on the film (26). With an inherent comparison between the primary and secondary texts, because both are packaged in the same location, the DVD as a whole "can be employed to discourage and discount some interpretations while encouraging others" (Brookey and Westerfelhaus, 39). Thus, while comparing the various extra-textual features, including the commentary and the featurettes to the film, the researchers found that the DVD of *Fight Club* demonstrated an underlying homophobic attitude of the film, through a playful ironic distancing from the overt masculinity contained within the film text itself. It is not that the text of *film* did, but that the text of the *DVD* – the

technology, in other words – did. The VHS copy of this would not have had the same effect, not just because the text is presented differently, but also because the technology does not have the same capabilities and could not allow it. This same difference can be seen in other examples of different technology mixing in similar media: take, for example, the track-skipping capabilities of the digital CD versus the more linear analog tape. As CDs became more popular, the concept of the "album" changed. No longer did albums need to be linear arrangements of songs; CDs led to a change in the audience's reception and interpretation of audio texts.

But how does the text of the DVD differ from other media texts? A DVD is a unique combination of many different contents: combined into one larger package, the primary text of the film or television show is usually packaged with extra features like deleted scenes, commentaries or the like. Thus, the DVD text is not one particular media text, but rather the *combination* of all the secondary texts as well. It is a hypermediated, user-controlled technology that allows for a greater amalgam of mediation (cf. Atkinson, "Crossing"). The abilities new technology open up clear the way for media scholars to make new connections between texts and to produce media scholarship that examines the inherent messages of different media.

(Digital) Encoding/Decoding

One of the most interesting aspects of DVD technology is the impact that it has had on audience participation with a filmic text. Although he writes before the advent of DVDs, Stuart Hall articulates how different interpretations of texts can exist because of the participation of the audience. *Producers* of media and *receivers* of media can mis-communicate when the ideas from the producers are encoded differently from how the same signals are decoded by the audience. Different viewers will decode the same production encoding in different ways. As Hall articulates, for one of the decoding positions taken by the audience, "it is possible for a viewer … to decode the message in a globally contrary way" (172). Instead of arguing that the message is *this* or *that*, viewers take their own readings and retool them for their own use. In other words, current viewers of media with their digital intellect do not now passively receive information from the producers of media; they instead actively work to shape and mold the media into their own interpretations. With this feedback on the media text, producers shape their encoding methods to more align with what media audiences decode. Producers often "are concerned that the audience has failed to take the meaning as they … intended," and actively work to court viewers through understandable encoding (Hall, 170). The media text thus becomes the intermediary in a conversation between the producers and the receivers, and functions as a necessary channel to aid in a dynamic communication.

Hall writes about the triangular relationship between producers, audiences, and media in general. John Fiske, however, is more specific to television as a medium when he writes about the decoding of messages. For example, he underlines a number of common encoded messages in a television program, *Hart to Hart*, which all work to produce the universal decoding of encoded messages on a show. Indeed, all revolve

around the efforts put forth by audience to engage in new readings of the show and of the characters. He writes, "the technical codes of television can be precisely identified and analyzed" and that the producers "give meaning to what is being photographed" for the television (135). We know that the bad guys are bad guys because they wear black; the encoding of the hue "black" as a signifier of "evil" is a common code across media. The active audience in this case not only decodes the significant themes and icons that the show's producers put in the show, they also *extend* this knowledge into *other* media texts: it's not just that any particular decoding functions on a specific show – it is that the decoding works on a *variety* of texts. Importantly, however, this knowledge exists through repetitive reception: the more one watches, the more one becomes used to the codes. In sum, both Hall and Fiske make a point of establishing within a basic framework how active audiences emerge and how media texts function, yet also establish that this activity remains determined by the production.

Audiences with digital intellect work differently at decoding than did audiences with an analogic intellectualism of the past. It is not just a change in specific audiences, however, but rather a change in culture. This "change in … culture" is caused by "digital technology," according to Adams (96). Through "our ability to interact with this emerging digital environment," audiences have become more active and more able to decode the messages of producers (96). In fact, an audience's ability to decode these messages often overtakes the producers' ability to encode: writers of fan fiction often take the encoding of producers and subvert it for their own personal use. In his analysis of amateur music videos created through footage "poached" from television shows like *Star Trek*, Henry Jenkins writes that "fan viewers are often totally disinterested in the identity of the original singer(s) but are prepared to see the musical performances as an expression of the thoughts, feelings, desires, and fantasies of the fictional character(s)" (235). These early fans delineate the edges of a digital intellect.

Fiske's work with television audiences does not limit itself to decoding of elements, however. In the introduction to the book *Reading Television*, John Hartley writes that "broadcast television" is "a principle mechanism by which a culture could communicate with its collective self": in other words, TV as a medium facilitates a reciprocal relationship between producers and receivers (Hartley, xvi). Fiske and Hartley later detail a semiotic analysis of television when they articulate the Codes of Television. As they define it, a code is "a 'vertical' *set* of signs … which may be *combined* according to certain 'horizontal' *rules*" (41, emphasis in original). In other words, the set of signs that are used to decode television texts exist in a relationship with the production encoding of the rules under which those codes exist. A "code depends upon the agreement of its users," and thus affects the reception of the media (41).

In this way, not only do audiences participate in the construction of televisual texts, but the technological texts themselves do as well. When one media text is encoded in a certain way, and then decoded, and that *same* decoding is used on a different text, it is as if that first text has influenced the reading of the second in a profound manner. Audiences use texts just as producers use audiences – through technology. The interaction of an audience and a text, through the encoding/decoding model set up by Hall and elaborated upon by Fiske, demonstrates the effusive power of media technology.

The influence of DVD technology, however, has seen the *combination* of texts taking precedence over the experience of a singular text. When primary media texts (films) are combined with secondary media texts (extra-texts), the combination becomes greater than the sum of its parts. The audience views the film not as pure cinema, but as part of a larger product. The mechanisms for film production, distribution, and marketing, are visible on the DVD itself – making the media text more than simply the film. It is the film process itself. DVDs have made film viewers savvier, more knowledgeable, and more influential as an audience. They have, in other words, contributed to a digital intellect.

With a text that is, in itself, combinatory, the users can complement the interactive components of the technology. Much like producers of television programs encode into the media text certain characteristics that are generically decoded by the audience, so too do producers of DVDs encode into the text of the DVD certain aspects of the technology that are decoded by the audience. For example, just as Fiske points out that something as innocuous as "make-up" in television shows can affect the "merging of ideological codes," so too can producers of DVDs encode seemingly innocuous messages into the text of the DVD (139). One common encoding on DVDs is the presence of interactive menu screens that display some important moment from the film: in the DVD for David Fincher's *Se7en*, for instance, the menu screens flash and screech in the same manner as does the movie when the killer's notebooks are found. The producers of DVDs encode meaning into these screens. Audiences decode these as elementary aspects of the text.

Thus, although Hall hypothesized the encoding/decoding model within the model of old media, like television and film, the implications for new media, like the internet, are far- reaching. Decoders of new media have been inundated with new material – and a new method of reception – that has changed the way audiences think. Digital audiences, more than any other type of audience, have the ability to *alter* the original text, to "encode" their own messages into them, and become producers in their own right. George Landow calls this "wreaderly," meaning that the demarcation between "writer" and "reader" has changed (Landow, 14). An example of this is the wiki: an online device that allows for instantaneous interaction between people and text. One can post text, and any other person can seamlessly edit that text. As Richard Kahn and Douglas Kellner write, wikis exist as texts "*in process*, with viewers able to trace and investigate how the [digital] archive has grown over time, which users have made changes, and what exactly they have contributed" (718). Digital copies of media texts are exact simulations: they allow for loss-free transfer. Any would-be wreader thus can make changes that are just as effective as they are affective. These wreaders have the ability to *change* the primary text itself. In effect, they alter the relationship between the style of the text and the technological substance of the genre.

(Digital) Genre: Innovation/Convention

In fact, genre is perhaps one of the most significant factors involved with understanding digital intellect. Genre theory, the examination of conventional elements that constitute a recognized format, produces a

tension in the audience between expectation and innovation. When elements are recognized as generic, they are automatically filed as encoded elements of a mediated text. However, when they are new or not recognized, they must be parsed to be understood and categorized. This is a central tenant of digital intellect. Genre contrasts convention and innovation to affect both the role of the producer and the role of the audience member. Audiences understand genre by decoding the specific elements put there by the producers that make it understandable. It is, in other words, a reciprocal arrangement.

For this effect, producers encode new elements into conventional genre that innovate and change what audiences think the genre can be. The classic example of genre evolution is the Western: for decades the genre effects of the Western remained consistent. Later, however, the genre evolved from the early days of cinema where it was a generally racist and violent exaltation of Manifest Destiny to more modern versions of Westerns, which see the genre as a critique of the patriarchal expansion of the pre-Civil War era. Modern westerns see a "modest revival" with a "successful attempt to remodel the genre" (Buscombe, 293).

But to define what elements make up a genre is, perhaps, a confusing proposition to ask, as Rick Altman writes in his seminal article "A Semantic/Syntactic Approach to Film Genre." According to Altman, the trouble with genre studies has been that it has either focused on genre as a semantic practice, where scholars focus on "the genre's building blocks" like iconography, locations, characters, traits, and the like; or on a syntactic practice, which organizes genre based on "the structures into which they are arranged," like the thematic elements that situate the *meaning* of a genre in a specific order (1984, 10). In other words, a semantic approach to genre studies is inclusive and allows many films to be part of a genre. A syntactic approach to genre studies is more exclusive and limits the types of films that are included in a general canon. Altman eventually calls for a method of genre studies that combines both semantic and syntactic through audience interpretation: a "spectator response" he writes, is "heavily conditioned by the choice of semantic elements and atmosphere because a given semantics used in a specific cultural situation will recall to an interpretive community the particular syntax with which that semantics has traditionally been associated in other texts" (1984, 17). His later book calls this spectator response a "pragmatic" view of genre (1999). The pragmatics of a genre indicates a change in the *use* of the genre. The pragmatic approach argues, "every text has multiple users," describes, "why different users develop different readings," "theorizes the relationship between users," and "considers the effect of multiple conflicting uses" (1999, 214). In effect, he argues that genre is not just constructed from *textual elements* and from *ideological meanings*, but also from *diverse uses*.

The audience, thus, is the bridge between the dual elements of genre. What is important to note, however, is that, because of the time period in which he wrote, Altman does not deal with the advent of new media to the extent that film studies does today. The very notion of "genre" has changed with new technology, and the ever-expansive definitional elements that constitute the meaning of the term have altered because of new media.

As example of this, audiences with a digital intellect bridge these dual elements and can often play with

the effect genre can have. Audiences can reinterpret the genre of a film through the re-editing of an online film trailer. These audiences, through their digital intellect, have the ability to reconceptualize the basic structure that lies at the heart of genre. The realm of the digital offers the amateur film editor the chance to interact more fully with the primary filmic text: by changing the text itself, the user becomes a creator of a completely *new* object. The audience member changes the text itself, using the "enchanc[ed] cognative facilities" that Johnson indicates emerge through audience interaction with new media (12).

Altman later conceptualizes the relationship that genre and audience as a "necessary" one (1996, 279). Indeed, the film industry depends on the relationship between a maintained, generically trained audience and the media text itself. He recognizes a tension between the "actualization" of generic tenants and the "failure to respect those norms" (1996, 280). Whenever a genre film introduces a new element, for example, audiences must negotiate in themselves a tension between adapting their generic expectations to the new film type, or rejecting the film for being too different from what is conventional.

However, one must be able to work with syntactics, semantics, *and* pragmatics to allow audiences to realize their digital intellect. In fact, as Fiske and Hartley point out in *Reading Television*, the codes of television function in a generic way: the signs that make up the codes "within a single medium … will vary according to the context or genre" (36). The point here is not that genre functions in different manners, but that in either case, the audience focuses the interpretation. Genre does not function without the input of the audience just as an audience's goal in watching a media text can be the decoding of codes. To be more specific, if a producer wants the audience to understand a text in a particular way, he or she must use tools that an audience understands, like genre, but because the audience's role in the production of the tools necessary for understanding genre has changed, that has necessitated a change in the role of genre in general. Technology has mediated that change, but that mediation may not be enough.

The Text: The DVD of *Final Destination 3*

With an understanding that digital intellect has changed how viewers examine media and technology, we can examine the relationship that the DVD of *FD3* has with its audience and see how the DVD offers what appears to be an interactive experience. What we find, however, is that the "interactivity" promised by *FD3* is nothing other than *false interactivity*. The choices offered are determined beforehand by the producers of the DVD. Yet, in presenting these options, the producers are playing on the digital intellect of the viewer: only audiences that are already attuned to the interactive capabilities of DVD technology can become part of the "Choose-your- own-adventure" mentality. *FD3* has previously been analyzed, most notably by Atkinson ("Versatility"). In her article, she describes the limited interactivity of the *FD3* DVD: "we are not actually able to 'change the characters fates'" ("Versatility," 30). Indeed, for Atkinson, *FD3* serves not as an illustration of the pinnacle of interactive achievement, but rather as a model for what *might* be possible with *future* technology: the Blu Ray player. As she says, "just as the invention of television led to the invention of the different genres of television programming and the multi-camera studio, so too

should the technology of DVD bring with it a proliferation of new techniques of interactive storytelling" ("Versatility," 34).

Yet, instead of concentrating on what is most interesting about what *might* happen, it also behooves us to examine the nature of what brought us to this point in our culture: interactivity, even the false interactivity of the *FD3* DVD, has become a necessary and important feature for new technology. DVDs are hyped as a technology that allows the audience to experience the film in a new way. Producers of DVDs are thus concentrating on a new form of viewer: an audience with a digital intellect. Because of the hyper-mediated environment of the DVD, the viewer can decide in what order to watch things, in which language and with which special features highlighted. If audiences have become more active in the decoding/encoding process, then the relationship between genre convention and innovation changes. Adams shows that "intellectual skills have begun to depend upon our ability to interact in a digital environment" using "technology [as] a tool" (96). However, technology is more than a tool; technology is, instead, an indication of digital intellect. By attempting to harness new properties of new media – hypermediation and interactivity – DVDs like the one for *FD3* present a new way of watching films. However, because the presentation is still, inherently, in an *old medium* (television or film), the technological constraints necessarily limit the new properties. When this happens, these properties become less innovative, and more conventional – and the convention is that of false interactivity.

Perhaps a definition here would help articulate what I mean by "false interactivity." I use the term "interactivity" to refer to the relationship between a new media text and the audience: when the audience can actively change what occurs in the text, and the text can reflect those changes. For example, a video game is often cited as interactive because the player can "interact" with the text and affect how the game plays, what levels are achieved, and what environments are explored. In reality, the exploration of the game is an example of what I mean by "false interactivity," for the interaction happens solely in the mind of the player: the video game text has already been laid out and the environment already programmed, and the player has only the options that have been put in the game's code from which to choose. A medium with false interactivity is one in which the user consciously and willingly suspends her disbelief and enters into a witting contract with the medium to pretend that she has choice. It is granting control to a medium that, in reality, doesn't have any. Players selflessly and willingly giving up control for the sake of seeming like one has more control (Booth). However, because players *feel* as though they are exploring *new* territory, the game becomes a much more interactive experience only *for the individual players*. False interactivity is the hallmark of the relationship between technology and mediation, especially when the development of the media outpaces that of the technology.

Thus, at the heart of the concept of interactivity lies the issue of audience participation. And for the audience's participation, the DVD presents what is seen as an effective technology. As an exemplar of the false interactivity of the DVD, the DVD of *Final Destination 3 (FD3)* provides a relevant focus of analysis. The third film in the *Final Destination* trilogy, *FD3* continues in the teen horror milieu of the first two films: a small group of beautiful teenagers manage to narrowly escape death thanks to the intuition of the protagonist. The specter of Death, however, is unsatisfied, and thus kills each individual in the group, in

the order that he or she would have died had they not escaped. Specifically for this third film, the teenagers avoid Death by exiting a roller coaster moments before it crashes. Each character that gets off the coaster is eventually killed, each in a spectacularly gruesome and bloody way.

What is of particular interest in this DVD is that the producers encoded what they term an "interactive" aspect to it. Viewers of the DVD are given the opportunity to take advantage of DVD technology and interact with the text itself. Specifically, moments before each character's death scene the film pauses and a title card appears that asks you, the audience member, to choose between two choices. Picking one of the options sends you down a different fork in the convoluted plot: sometimes the character does not die after all, sometimes they die in a different manner, or sometimes something completely unexpected happens. You do not know which choice will lead down which path; however, you do know that one choice will lead to what happened in the theatrical run of the film, while one choice will lead to something "new." What perhaps is most textually rich about this DVD, however, is that any new scenes added for the interaction of the viewer must have been planned, written, shot, edited and produced deliberately for this DVD presentation. However, none of these scenes would have, at the time of filming, furthered the narrative. The encoding of the DVD takes these new scenes and incorporates them into the larger technological text of the film. In this way, the DVD is not just a new way of watching the film, it becomes a new text altogether.

Thus, a tension exists for viewers of this DVD text. Should viewers attempt to mirror the plot of the film as it was shown in the movie theatre, where interactivity is slighter, or should they try different endings? Because the outcome of each decision is unknown when the decision is being made, viewers can only understand their determinations in hindsight. Interestingly, however, there is, despite the pretense of interactivity, a thread of decoding throughout the DVD. If the viewer does *not* choose the path that occurred in the theatrical run of the film, the film itself might end after the new scene. As shown in Atkinson, it is possible to watch the entire film in 20 minutes, as one choice may allow the theatrical version to be shown, or a different version in which the protagonist dies early in the film and the film ends ("Versatility," 39). The point is, there is no way for the viewer to know, beforehand, which way the DVD should go, which not only presents a new generic experience, but also increases the decoding the viewer must do.

When the disc for *FD3* is first put in the DVD player, the viewer is introduced to the concept of the interactivity when the screen reads "please select a version to view: Theatrical Version or Choose the Fate! You're in Control. Cheat death by changing the movie and the destiny of the characters" (*FD3*). When chosen, this second option immediately shifts to a new menu control:

> Would you save innocent strangers from their Final Destination? At several key points you will be asked to make a decision with Mortal Consequences. What would you do? Select heads, or perhaps tails? Use your remote to select an option, then choose their fate. But fate is an impatient mistress, dear friend, and if a decision is not made quickly, she will choose for you (*FD3*).

As the announcer intones these words as they flash upon the screen, the viewer is given the choice to

decide the action of the film. In other words, it is not that the entire film is hyper- mediated, but rather that at a crucial few points, the audience can pick a direction in an expanding flow-chart of options.

Even within this menu option, the viewer is shown the DVD producer's encoding process, and is encouraged to actively decode the message in a particular way. The encoding message is inherent within the option itself: that there are two versions (a "theatrical" and a "Choose the Fate!"), and that in one, the audience is in control and that in the other, it is the "director's" decision. This encoding provides the audience with a decisive binary opposition between their way and the director's way of viewing the film. Yet, this remains a sense of false interactivity.

Further, the encoding/decoding effects continue throughout the "Choose the Fate!" option on the DVD. The first time the viewer is given the choice to decide the fate for the characters, it is at a crucial coin toss: when the protagonist's boyfriend flips the coin in the air, should it land heads or tails? The decision as to the fate of the characters supposedly rests in the audience's use of the remote control. However, whichever choice the viewer picks, the resulting film proceeds in the same manner. There are only two differences: the first is that a character calls the coin in the air depending on which choice the viewer picked, an audio dub that would have been simple to enact on the DVD, and the second is that what *would* have been a dream sequence in the theatrical version of the film ends up being what actually happened to the characters in the film world.

In fact, picking the "tails" option will end the movie after 20 minutes. Instead of being "in control" of the characters' fates, the user instead is faced with the proposition that their choice was "wrong" from the standard generic standpoint of the movie. This reinforces new media as a genre while negating it as a technology. The film itself is not what the user would have expected, and their choice forms the basis for their incorrect decoding of the producer's encoding of the DVD. Ironically, what is important to note here is that the producers of this DVD are, in fact, attempting to create a more interactive media presentation for an audiences attuned to that type of digital presentation.

This encoding helps to shape a generic change for the audience in their anticipation of the film. Instead of expecting to find a teenage slasher/gory horror film, they now expect to find a new media product. There has been, in effect, a change in what genre *is*. Instead of focusing on the properties of a categorization of film, the audience now focuses on the categorization of the properties of a technology. New media, and the DVD specifically, becomes a genre: a product of the audience's own devising. And this product becomes more than a horror movie, more than a teenage slasher film. Because this media product seems to be produced from somewhere between the makers of the film and the audience, the audience members that participate in the "Choose the Fate!" option feel as if this genre is more defined and refined by them than others can be.

Thus, although the producers of the DVD have attempted to create a new media paradigm of audience interaction, because the audience has *already* learned to be active through the decoding of messages, and through their reception and participation in genre, the impetus for the audience members to experience the

interaction of the DVD is lessened. It takes new technology for a new media product to demonstrate new media principles. This doesn't occur in the DVD because the presentation of that media is through an old media technology. By virtue of its own inherent properties, the TV is "old," and all the "desires and fears it once aroused as the latest, most popular, all singing, all dancing attraction" have been "transferred to new media such as the Internet" (Hartley, xvii). New media requires new technology to truly embrace the inherent differences between the paradigms.

Conclusion

If we look at *FD3* as an exemplar text of what possibilities exist for DVD technology, we can see a lot of promise. As Atkinson establishes:

> The future of advanced DVD production technology is a future in which narrative interactions will be previsualized within the film production process. The generation of suitable interactive content will be factored into both the preproduction planning stages and the film production process, and will in turn affect the ways in which we engage with the content, shifting both user consumption and expectation exponentially ("Versatility," 34).

The future of home entertainment may yet be interactive; as I have shown, however, it is not there yet. We as an audience take comfort in knowing that we can have a role to play in media, if we want it. And yet, what appears to happen when these new technologies are mediated through old technologies is that they fall short of what is expected. It is not interaction, because it has already been preplanned. When the "wrong" choice of *FD3* ends the film, the audience cannot help but feel that there is a "right" choice – the theatrical choice. Given this, the DVD for *FD3* still asserts the director as the ultimate auteur of the film. If the director's version is seen as the "correct" one, then any audience member who chooses the "Choose the Fate!" option on the film only tries to mirror what the director intended. The choice for the film is not a choice at all, but rather a connect-the-dots: connecting the scenes to make the director's coherent picture. A digital intellect strives for more.

The DVD for *FD3* is marketed as an interactive experience, but in reality there is nothing but false interactivity. This, however, is not the fault of the producers of the DVD, but of the technology. Television cannot offer the sort of intertextual, interactive entertainment possibilities that the internet can, and as such is necessarily limited by its own technological development. Perhaps what future mediation of film will entail will be the presence of a digital environment that allows for true interactivity: a Wiki-movie, for instance. Although the process by which this encoding/decoding is far beyond the scope of this paper to analyze, it is not too much to imagine that audience participation will only increase as the availability of digital technology does. Digital intellect, as Adams states, "is emerging" (96). It is not yet fully formed. However, for now, the DVD is a technology ahead of its medium.

Works Cited

Adams, Nan. "Digital Intelligence Fostered by Technology." <u>The Journal of Technology Studies</u> 30 (2004): 93-97.

Altman, Rick. "A Semantic/Syntactic Approach to Film Genre." <u>Cinema Journal</u> 23 (1984): 6-18.

-----. "Cinema and Genre." <u>The Oxford History of World Cinema</u>. Ed. Geoffrey Nowell-Smith. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1996. 276-285.

-----. (1999). <u>Film/Genre</u>. London: BFI Publishing.

Atkinson, Sarah. "The Versatility of Visualization: Delivering Interactive Feature Film Content on DVD." <u>Nebula 4.2</u>: (2007). 21-39.

-----. (2007b). "Crossed Lines: The Creation of a Multiform, Multiscreen Interaction Film." <u>Nebula 4.3</u>: (2007). 79-99

Barker, David. "Television Production Techniques as Communication." <u>Television: a Critical View</u>. Ed. Horace Newcomb. Oxford: Oxford UP, 2000. 169-182.

Booth, Paul. "Shall Ne'er the Twain Meet?: *Enter the Matrix,* Narrative and New Videogame Studies." Presentation at Annual Midwestern Popular Culture Association Conference. Oct 2005.

Brookey, Robert, and Robert Westerfelhaus. "Hiding Homoeroticism in Plain View: the Fight Club DVD as Digital Closet." <u>Critical Studies in Media Communication</u> 19 (2002): 21- 43.

Buscombe, Edward. "The Western." <u>The Oxford History of World Cinema</u>. Ed. Geoffrey Nowell-Smith. Oxford: Oxford UP, 1996. 286-294.

<u>Final Destination 3</u>. Dir. James Wong. Perf. Mary Elizabeth Winstead, Ryan Merriman. DVD. New Line Pictures, 2006.

Fiske, John, and John Hartley. <u>Reading Television</u>. 2nd ed. London: Routledge, 2003.

Fiske, John. "The Codes of Television." <u>Media Studies: A Reader</u>. Ed. Paul Marris and Sue Thornham. Edinburgh: Edinburgh UP, 1996. 133-141.

Hall, Stuart. "Encoding/Decoding." <u>Media and Cultural Studies Keyworks</u>. Ed. Douglas Kellner and

Meenakshi Durham. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2006. 163-173.

Hartley, John. "Foreword: 'Reading' Television Studies." Foreword. <u>Reading Television</u>. By John Fiske and John Hartley. London: Routledge, 2003. ix-xxii.

Horton, Donald and R. Richard Wohl. "Mass Communication and Para-Social Interaction." *Psychiatry 19*. (1956). 215-229.

Jenkins, Henry. *Textual Poachers*. New York, NY: Routledge. 1992.

Johnson, Steven. *Everything Bad is Good for You*. New York: Riverhead Books. 2005.

Kahn, Richard, and Douglas M. Kellner. "Oppositional Politics and the Internet: A Critical/Reconstructive Approach." <u>Media and Cultural Studies Keyworks</u>. Ed. Douglas Kellner and Meenakshi Durham. Malden, MA: Blackwell, 2006. 703-725.

Landow, George. <u>Hyper/Text/Theory</u>. Baltimore, MD: The Johns Hopkins UP, 1994.

McLuhan, Marshall. <u>Understanding Media: the Extensions of Man</u>. Revised ed. Cambridge, MA: MIT P, 1994.

Turkle, Sherry. <u>Life on the Screen.</u> New York, NY: Simon and Schuster, 1995.

Winston, Brian. <u>Media, Technology, and Society</u>. London: Routledge, 2000.

Notes

[1] See Sherry Turkle's work on identity and virtual reality.

Social Networking Sites: will they survive?

By Jim Kent

Social Networking Sites (SNS) have achieved phenomenal success since the launch of sixdegrees.com in 1997. Original sites such as Friendster, Lunarstorm and MiGente, are now all dwarfed by the phenomenally successful Myspace[1], and Facebook[2]. A useful historical record of the development of Social Networking sites was made by Boyd and Ellison in 2007[3], although more work is needed to understand the gratifications delivered, how users derive a sense of identity and the cross cultural implications to users. The goal of this short paper is to weave digitization, identity and community into an analysis that is both historically rigorous and conscious of contemporary innovations.

Do Social Network sites mark a legitimate paradigm shift or a mere extension of previous technologies?

Email and the tools to share digital data had been widely available in many communities for decades prior to the success of social networking sites. Chat fora, for example, also had the capacity to create friends lists and thus a micro on-line community. The imperative driving popular applications on SNS such as photo sharing was already available on sites such as Flickr and video sharing on Youtube. These sites are highly rated in their sectors, but neither was able to create a Social Network based around content. Users preferred to build a social network of friends and then distribute content. Fourteen million photographs are uploaded daily on the Facebook platform (2008), more than the combined total of the next 3 sites[4]. Often additional digital content is stored on other sites such as Youtube but distributed on SNS, thus reducing previous successful sites to mere data storage servers. Newsgroups had been heralded as networks of individuals focussed on a discussion or topic however SNS more accurately mirrors physical relational networks, because; "the world is composed of networks, not groups[5]" (Wellman, 1988, p. 37).

The availability to users of extensive email address lists is one key reason as to the success of SNS launched since 2005, in contrast to their predecessors. Indeed, the email forwarding culture on the "bored office worker network[6]" (Peretti, 2007, p.158) had already been present prior to SNS. However SNS both capitalised on and encourages members of the BOWN to create or copy, content, often humorous, and distribute around a users network, using single click mass publishing. Therefore SNS success has not been

based on new applications, with the exception of making it user friendly for users to automatically *one click* publish within their network, digital data, thus creating dynamic new content for users and facilitating vast amounts of information sharing.

SNS sites are a recognised part of the innovations delivered by Web 2.0. The evolution of user generated content replacing professionally edited work is encapsulated by SNS, as is the ability of the owners to make money whilst providing a platform rather than original content. Andrew Keen's controversial and influential demolition of Web 2.0 in *The Cult of the Amateur*, concludes that the risks from sexual predators within sites such as My Space make them a key, free web speech battle ground, between the ACLU/Silicon Valley versus concerned parents and responsible legislators

This argument could be developed to answer the question if the SNS platform was ever needed, or has the creation of the platform spawned a generation of users communicating about nothing.

"We are in great haste to construct a magnetic telegraph from Maine to Texas; but Maine and Texas, it may be, have nothing important to communicate"[7] (Thoreau 1980 p.52)

What gratifications are driving growth in Online Social Networks? In what ways are these limited?

(i) Maintaining friendships

It has been documented that the majority of users did not join Social Networks in order to make new contacts but to manage, maintain and re-contact with extended physical networks. Ellison, Steinfield, and Lampe (2007) suggest that Facebook is used to maintain existing offline relationships or solidify offline connections, as opposed to meeting new people. In addition, Lenhart and Madden (2007) reported that 91% of U.S. teens who use SNS do so to connect with friends. This in itself is not surprising but remains useful evidence to distinguish SNS from previous sites which are focused on making new contacts.

Although Facebook has allowed external users to develop more than 25,000 applications as of May 2008, and as claimed by the sites developers, all of its 64 million active users choosing to install at least one[8], questions remain as to whether the gratifications delivered by such functionality will be enough to prevent mass desertion by users over time. Since users after relishing initial contact with old friends discover that similar limitations to cyber relations apply as to their physical contacts. Friendster demonstrates the inverse relationship between the scale of social networks and the quality of the relations within them—a relationship rooted in the limits of human time and attention.[9] (Peretti 2007, p.155)

Identity by means of network

A feature of SNS profiles is the possibility for users to see the number and identity of other user's contacts. Conflicting psychologies motivate some users to maximise the number of contacts published as "friends" in contrast to other users who value a minimal number of contacts, giving the impression of selectivity. Either option can be interpreted as an attempt to shape the public persona and thus identity of the user. "Public displays of connection" serve as important identity signals that help people navigate the networked social world, in that an extended network may serve to validate identity information presented in profiles[10] (Donath and Boyd 2004, P.71-82). This sense of context and online identity can be of particular importance for individuals who perceive themselves as lacking such in the real world.

Evidence suggests that individual users respond favourably to the concept of logging on to become part of a community[11] (Nishikant Kapoor, Joseph A. Konstan, Loren G. Terveen 2007 p.4). The same study also highlighted the importance of having pictures of the users on their own profile and the ability to search by picture, other users. Facebook maximises opportunities to publish the pictures of a users friends on users own profiles, reinforcing the sense of identity "by who we know" as referred to previously.

Identity by means of personal data broadcast and photo publishing

Many SNS obligated all users to create an online profile of themselves, collating and then publishing personal preferences of favourite movies and books and other personal data. This data was then protected from public access, with many sites requiring *friends* to give mutual permission for connection to each other's profiles. This permits users to consciously shape their public persona and permit online friends to gather far more data in less time than in real world relationships. In addition the ability to publish photographs as often as is wished by the user, allows users to communicate "this is who I am by what I do."

A likely consequence of any system where users are obligated to create a profile of personal data will be some users shaping their public perception by incorporating false data, as evidenced on the Friendster network with the rise of Fakesters. (Mieszkowski, K. 2003). Myspace was a target of accusations by mainstream media, of permitting adults to misrepresent themselves in order to gain access to children. (Consumer Affairs, 2006) However, the actual threat of paedophiles grooming potential victims and consequently meeting them was over represented in main stream media (Wolak, Mitchell, & Finkelhor, 2006). They also report that although one out of seven teenagers received unwanted sexual solicitations online, only 9% came from people over the age of 25. Research suggests that popular narratives around sexual predators on SNSs are misleading—cases of unsuspecting teens being lured by sexual predators are rare (Finkelhor, Ybarra, Lenhart, Boyd, & Lordan, 2007). Furthermore, only .08% of students surveyed by the National School Boards Association (2007) met someone in person from an online encounter without permission from a parent.

The issue of trust

Some SNS have succeeded in convincing the vast majority of their users to trust both the data found on individuals' profiles and the wisdom of publishing date about themselves. Dwyer, Hiltz, and Passerini (2007) demonstrated that Facebook users expressed greater trust in Facebook than MySpace users did in MySpace and thus were more willing to share information on the site. Despite mainstream media stories of online evidence being used against users in job interviews or Beauty Pageants[12], the gratification of publishing personal data remains so strong that users continue to publish personal data that could be costly in the long term. This suggests that users' desire for identity is worth the calculated risk, despite the fact that for some users, their online network has not been reinforced by physical contact. Secondary levels of protection are offered by some sites in the form of privacy controls, allowing some data to be invisible to some "friends". Nevertheless, many users publish enough information to be victims of prejudice[13].

Personality and the cultural norms of users.

The personality profile of users can be broken down into distinct groups often referred to as; inviters or distributors, responders and the silent majority. SNS have given "inviters" the opportunity to easily spread digital data, whilst providing responders and the silent majority with frequently changing dynamic content pertinent to their own social network. Inviters receive enough positive feedback from responders to continue to invest time and energy into creating new content for all other users, at no cost to the SNS. More work is needed to investigate if SNS have created a new generation of inviters and distributors, or these individuals would have operated as such even without SNS. In addition for this cycle of distribution to continue in the long term, the issue of whether *inviters* will need to be remunerated and recipients to pay for content will need to be addressed.

Social rules and regulations governing the content of first conversations are created over time by communities. These rules had already been redefined online by existing electronic communication, especially chat, which had created the potential for millions of users to have their first contact with other previously unknown users. The webs global reach creates the potential for one SNS to become a Global network. Existing evidence of SNS being designed for one cultural group and yet ultimately being dominated by other groups is common. The Google-based network Orkut, for example, was launched in the United States with an English-only interface, but Portuguese-speaking Brazilians quickly became the dominant user group (Kopytoff, 2004).

Asian and Anglo Saxon differences are a specific challenge, by means of language and social protocols. Social Networks based around regional Korean relationship protocols were analyzed by Kyung-Hee Kim and Haejin Yun. Their work on how Cyworld.com supported both interpersonal relations and self-relation

for Korean users traces the subtle ways in which deeply engrained cultural beliefs and activities are integrated into online communication and behaviours. Asian SNS typically receive less global media exposure making their own developments harder to trace yet both Japanese and Chinese web usage should not be underestimated, with Japanese Bloggers being the most prolific in 2007, with 37% of all global postings[14].

Differing cultural expectations over relational management and mutually agreed frequency of contact is yet to be satisfactorily addressed by an SNS, since in real life, we become closer or more distant depending on key environmental and emotional variables, "Networks must be supplemented in order to represent change over time." (Warren Sack 2007)

SNS are clearly delivering significant short term gratifications, and the attraction to join remains strong amongst new users[15]. Their longer term success is unclear at this time, as users grapple with the physical realities of relational management. The likelihood of a successful global network and the cross cultural implications will quickly grow after one group of cultural communication norms are adopted by all. Whether those norms are to be Anglo Saxon, Japanese or Chinese is still unknown. Continued convergence of other web technologies within SNS is likely, (live on line chat within Facebook was added on April 6th 2008) as they compete for members. Ultimately the fate of any SNS, including Myspace and Facebook will be dependent on their longer term successful commercialisation and profitability which remains in significant doubt[16].

References

Boyd, D. M. & Ellison, N. B. (2007). "Social network sites: Definition, history, and scholarship". *Journal of Computer-Mediated Communication*, *13*(1), article 11. http://jcmc.indiana.edu/vol13/issue1/boyd.ellison.html

Consumer Affairs. (2006, February 5). "Connecticut opens MySpace.com probe". *Consumer Affairs*. Retrieved July 21, 2007 from http://www.consumeraffairs.com/news04/2006/02/myspace.html

Donath, J., & boyd, d. (2004). "Public displays of connection". *BT Technology Journal, 22*(4), 71–82.

Dwyer, C., Hiltz, S. R., & Passerini, K. (2007). "Trust and privacy concern within social networking sites: A comparison of Facebook and MySpace". *Proceedings of AMCIS 2007*, Keystone, CO. Retrieved September 21, 2007 from http://csis.pace.edu/~dwyer/research/DwyerAMCIS2007.pdf

Ellison, N.B., Steinfield, C., and Lampe, C. (2007) as reported in Boyd, d. m., & Ellison, N. B. (2007). "Social network sites: Definition, history, and scholarship". *Journal of Computer- Mediated Communication*, *13*(1), article 11. http://jcmc.indiana.edu/vol13/issue1/boyd.ellison.html

Peretti, Jonah (2007) "Notes on Contagious Media" in Joe Karaganis (ed) *Structures of Participation in Digital Culture*. Social science research council New York

Keen, Andrew (2007) *The Cult of the Amateur*. Nicholas Brealey Publishing.

Kopytoff, V. (2004, November 29). "Google's Orkut Puzzles Experts". *San Francisco Chronicle*. Retrieved July 30, 2007 from http://www.sfgate.com/cgi-bin/article.cgi?f=/c/a/2004/11/29/BUGU9A0BH441.DTL

Lenhart, A., & Madden, M. (2007). "Teens, privacy, & online social networks". *Pew Internet and American Life Project Report*. Retrieved July 30, 2007 from http://www.pewinternet.org/pdfs/PIP_Teens_Privacy_SNS_Report_Final.pdf

Mieszkowski, K. (2003, August 14). "Faking out Friendster". *Salon.* http://www.salon.com/tech/feature/2003/08/14/fakesters/index_np.html

Nishikant Kapoor, Joseph A. Konstan, Loren G. Terveen (2005), "How Peer Photos Influence Member Participation in Online Communities". In *CHI '05 Extended Abstracts on Human Factors in Computing Systems* at Portland, USA.

QuantCast (2007a) "Profile for Facebook.com," http://www.quantcast.com/facebook.com ,

QuantCast (2007b) "Profile for MySpace.com," http://www.quantcast.com/myspace.com,

Sack, W. (2002). "What does a very large-scale conversation look like?" *Leonardo: Journal of Electronic Art and Culture, 35*(4): 417–426.

Schonfeld, Eric, Tech Crunch. Jan 31 2008. *Facebook Finances Leaked* http://www.techcrunch.com/2008/01/31/facebook-finances-leaked/

Thoreau, H. D. (1980). *Walden, or, life in the woods; and, on the duty of civil disobedience.* New York: Penguin.

Technorati.com. State of the Blogosphere, April 2007. Full report http://www.sifry.com/alerts/archives/000493.html
Permission to reproduce http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/

Wellman, B. (1988). "Structural analysis: From method and metaphor to theory and substance". In B. Wellman & S. D. Berkowitz (eds.), *Social Structures: A Network Approach.* Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press.

Wolak, J., Mitchell, K.J., Finkelhor, D., (2006) "Youth Internet Users at Risk for the Most Serious Online

Sexual Solicitations." *American Journal of Preventive Medicine* - June 2007 (Vol. 32, Issue 6, Pages 532-537, DOI: 10.1016/j.amepre.2007.02.001)

Notes

[1] 47 million unique US visitors each month (QuantCast, 2007b).

[2] 15 million unique US visitors a month (QuantCast, 2007a). 6th most engaging site, worldwide (Comscore world metrix April 2007). 64 million active users worldwide. www.Facebook.com

[3] Boyd, D. M., & Ellison, N. B. (2007). Social network sites: Definition, history, and scholarship.

[4] www.comscore.com

[5] Wellman, B. (1988).p. 37 Structural analysis: From method and metaphor to theory and substance.

[6] Jonah Peretti in Boyd, D. M., & Ellison, N. B. (2007). Social network sites: Definition, history, and scholarship. P158

[7] Thoreau, H. D. (1980). *Walden, or, life in the woods; and, on the duty of civil disobedience.* New York: Penguin.

[8] www.facebook.com

[9] P155 Notes on Contagious Media. Structures of Participation in Digital Culture.

[10] Donath and Boyd (2004) as referred to in Boyd D.M. & Ellison, N.B. (2007).

[11] Nishikant Kapoor, Joseph A. Konstan, Loren G. Terveen 2007

[12] Miss New Jersey was blackmailed over photos published on Facebook in April 2007, as reported on CNN, Fox News, MSNBC, ABC.

[13] Facebook requires users to publish political and religious affiliations.

[14] State of the Blogosphere, April 2007, http://www.sifry.com/alerts/archives/000493.html

[15] As of January 1, 2008 200,000 New Users join Facebook each day. www.facebook.com

[16] Schonfeld, Eric, Tech Crunch. Jan 31 2008. *Facebook Finances Leaked.*

Lots of Planets Have a North: Remodeling Second-Tier Cities and their Music.

By Tara Brabazon and Stephen Mallinder

Abstract:

Our paper asks an unspoken but fascinating question: why do particular cities become associated with their music at a specific time? Seattle, Manchester, Chicago and Liverpool are urban spaces that summon a type of rhythm, a mode of movement and a way of thinking about sound. This article probes the connection between urbanity and music, with attention placed on Perth in Western Australia. Often known as the most isolated capital city in the world, it is currently undergoing a musical boom, but with little cultural or creative industries policy support. This paper therefore initiates a study of how to connect second-tier – or non global – cities like Perth, so that lessons can be learnt from these other places of urban rhythm. We commence with an exploration of soundscapes, then move into the specificities of the second-tier city, and conclude with an affirmation of the value of sonic mobility – or intercessions - between these urban environments.

***

Rose:	Are you an alien?
The Doctor:	Yes.
Rose:	Is that alright?
The Doctor:	Yeah.
Rose:	If you are an alien, how come you sound like you're from the North?
The Doctor:	Lots of planets have a North.

Doctor Who, "Rose."[1]

Doctor Who is one of the great survival stories in popular cultural history. Like James Bond and *Star Trek*, it has survived the end of the Cold War, the decline of British power and ambivalence at American global domination. It is timely and appropriate that when *Doctor Who* reemerged in 2005, the ninth regeneration was not only trendier than Colin Baker, funnier than Tom Baker and stauncher than Peter Davidson but, unlike the other Doctors, did not summon an affluent inflection from the south-east of England. With leather jacket and new accent in tow, the Doctor could reclaim credibility and popularity, confirming that 'lots of planets have a North.'

Like the most evocative of cultural texts, *Doctor Who* not only provides an example or evidence, but a model for thinking (about) space and pop. Our goal for this *Nebula* article is to align mobility, urbanity and localism. Most significantly, we invert and shatter theories of art and challenge readers to admit embedded assumptions about urban musics. Commencing with a *Doctor Who* reference was intentional. It not only provides the title for the piece and its modality, but offers an unusual reference point to position our words in time, space and politics. Within creative industries policies, there is little time for the pretensions of 'the arts' as intrinsically bringing value and enrichment to the viewer or listener. The goal in the new economy is to facilitate the commodification of creativity through leveraging patents, copyrights and designs. This economy – often labeled after Charles Leadbeater's description of *Living on thin air* – actively seeks out and markets that which is different, new, innovative and creative. The local and the regional are granted intercessionist roles to freshening the market and development of products. That is why The Doctor's statement – 'Lots of planets have a North' – is deployed as a statement of difference and defiance, to acknowledge and celebrate a different way of living through urban spaces, and how these regions connect.

Much popular culture is complicit in compliance and acquiescence. Deviations from sameness and conformity are marked, labeled and judged. Tabloidization, the blurring of news and entertainment, simplifies the demarcations of insiders and outsiders. In such an environment, specific cities and regions are spaces for the negotiation of difference. For Doctor Who, the notion of 'the North' signals not only separation and distinction, but a thread of connectiveness between regions. Charles Landry,[2] Justin O'Connor[3] and Richard Florida,[4] using distinct methods and agendas from each other, confirm the value of cities in enabling cultural diversity. Landry suggested that "there are special reasons for thinking about the problems of cites today in terms of creativity and innovation – or lack of it. Today many of the world's cities face periods of transition largely brought about by the vigour of renewed globalization."[5] The corporate sameness of global cities initiates a search for marketed and marketable differences.[6] If creativity is important,[7] then the value of concepts, ideas, sounds and visions are more relevant than new banking outlets, corporate headquarters and innovative software platforms. The Doctor's metaphoric North now has theoretical attention, economic power and cultural currency.

Our paper casts light on these 'Norths,' the often invisible or discounted places in the global economy— urbanity and mobility are aligned with the function of popular culture. We ask why particular musics and cities are visible and popular at a specific time. Such a study is part of what Adam Brown, Justin O'Connor and Sara Cohen termed "place-based cultural policies."[8] The case study used for our work is Perth in Western Australia. Often known as the most isolated capital city in the world, it is currently undergoing a

musical boom, but with little cultural or creative industries policy support. This paper therefore initiates a study of how to connect second-tier – or non global – cities like Perth with other models for social and economic development, so that lessons can be learnt and effective policies developed. Commencing with an exploration of soundscapes, this study then moves into the specificities of the second-tier city and concludes with an affirmation of the value of sonic mobility between these urban environments. Following the Doctor, we value the metaphoric 'Norths' around the world for marking musical distinction and interceding in commodified sameness.

SuperCities

The time is right for a study of urban musics. New models are emerging that link cities spatially, politically and culturally. Will Alsop, in his vision of the North of England, constructed a 'SuperCity' straddling the M62 from Liverpool to Hull. This coast to coast zone is eighty miles long and fifteen miles wide. Alsop configured a geographically aligned super-city with motorways as the spine. He affirms that "I am local and regional. At last this duality of choice is eradicated and the life and environment outside the straight edges of this city is wild and natural."[9] Alsop, in a model geographically limited by a motorway, does not capture the 'wild' mobility of sonic media. Theories require ways to understand disorder, disconnection and movement that may not follow a gravelled path. When focusing on popular music, John Urry's realization about globalization is confirmed: it is "disordered, full of paradox and the unexpected."[10] This focus on networks not structures[11] allows a tracking of social and economic patterning, crossings, interdependencies and creativities. A test case of these arguments from Urry and Alsop is Perth in Western Australia. Perth opens out the issues of local and global intercessions, crossings, connectiveness and competitiveness of music for international scholars.

Perth is currently undergoing musical success, but the lack of international connectivity and knowledge is the primary blockage of growth. The June 2004 cover of *Australian Vogue* proclaimed that Perth was the new Paris. *Vogue* located Perth's creative boom as a matrix of popular music, fashion, design, contemporary art, photography and architecture. Unfortunately, the Western Australian State Government was conservative rather than strategic in their policy initiatives. Neither the Contemporary Music Ministerial taskforce, which reported in September 2002,[12] nor the Premier's Fashion Industry Taskforce,[13] which published its report in August 2003, validated this network of popular cultural industries and the relationship between cities. Perth has not managed this horizontal integration. Instead, the Department of Culture and the Arts ignored this alternative policy model in their 2004-7 Strategic Plan, to perpetuate "heritage funding" for the traditional Arts, and a grants-oriented approach for the rest. Three goals were put in place for the sector.

► A creative arts sector that provides scope for the creative development of individuals.

► A creative arts sector that provides opportunities for all Western Australians to experience the arts.

► A creative arts sector that is recognized as the hub of the creative industries and cultural sector.[14]

In this document, there was no mention of how spaces, places and sites create and frame popular music. Instead, creativity is individualized into 'experiences' and 'pathways.' In stressing the importance and specificity of Western Australia, there is a tendency to ignore the lessons and models of other cities. Cultural confidence easily spills into arrogance.

> It is important to learn from other places but ArtsWA must make **decisions that are appropriate to the Western Australian community and our unique context**. For this reason it is essential that a core principle for Arts WA is consideration of the Western Australian community and the wider contexts of creative activity in Western Australia. The State has a small but diverse and relatively solid arts infrastructure base with steadily growing attendance and participation rates. We want an inclusive creative culture.[15] (bold in original)

It is as if the changes to capitalism, city imaging and cultural policy have not touched Western Australia. Few international initiatives have crossed into the state. This active avoidance of alternative models for city music and funding streams is part of a desire to stress Perth's intense specificity and differentiated local conditions. This tension can create a productive relationship between global brands and local cultures, developing cultural heterogeneity.[16] Culture and Arts policy in Western Australia had focused on insularity and protectionism, rather than initiating productive comparisons and sharing knowledge. The escape from this framework is to take the challenge of trans-city relationships seriously, with attention to building an intricate and successful sonic media community and urban soundscape. Many of the arguments encircling creative industries rely on local knowledge to develop workforces and encourage consumerism.[17] Shaping city relationships is important to linking these localisms. In learning what has worked elsewhere, Perth's policy makers may be more prepared to take opportunities when presented. Before strategic plans can be developed, we must hear the sounds before we can write the policy. The intercessions of sound must be addressed before it is placed in a context.

Sounds through silence

There is no physical ability to terminate sound. We can only filter and translate. Eye lids close over eyes, but sounds continue to resonate. Sounds impress on and through the body and punctuate events without impunity. With the exception of smell, sound is the sense most closely bound to memory. Our internal translation of the soundscape that exists at any moment is reactive and unwritten, a spontaneous analysis continually adapting to the ebbs and flows of a shifting aural environment. There may be instinctual responses to sounds of danger. An explosion summons sonic chaos. Discomfort is aroused through a cry or scream. Ambience or pastoral sounds soothe through order and symmetry. Sound enables the mapping of the immediate environment in terms of order and dysfunction. Through association, a place is sensed, and a sense is placed. When this association is moulded around and on an urban topography, a city soundscape

can emerge.

There are difficulties in analyzing the sound of a city. Aural literacy lacks the sophistication of its visual counterpart. Understanding is associated with seeing and although Joachim-Ernst Berendt may argue for a "democracy of the senses,"[18] the lack of universality in language, a key component in the aural experience, means that our signifiers are visual and in an increasingly mediated world, the eye retains dominance over the ear. To redress this imbalance requires exploration of soundscapes as private and public experiences, effecting personal identity and community development in an urban context. We summon a cityscape through sound.

The first step is to identify the components of an aural topography – how we hear – and then quantify and qualify this experience. There must be contextual and historical discussion of what differentiates sound from noise. If sound itself is the actual sensation of hearing, encompassing all aspects of that experience – arbitrary, capricious, and unqualified - then noise is subjective and requires interpretation and diagnosis. Noise denotes chaos - sound without sense - but also a consequential empowering through sound, an ability to disrupt or change the status quo. The traditional definition of music confirms an expression through rhythm, harmony and melody, the systematic construction or ordering of sounds within historically-determined parameters. In a world of musique concrete, ambient Soundscapes and subsonic sound systems are a more permeable realm where the boundaries of sound, noise and music bleed, become ill-defined and non-exclusive. Music requires context. It can, through I-Pods, cell phones and walkmans, turn public into private space. In building a city image, this interface of public and personal domains translates an urban geography into a sonic representation.

If the interpretation of the visual world is restricted by physicality, then sound enables a transcendence of these corporeal boundaries. This three dimensional construction of locality through sound creates a wall of evidence for the audio realm as a sensory reinforcer. We need not see to imagine, but a visual references inevitably leads to more precise representation. Those in close proximity to an event like a car crash will see, hear and most likely smell the accident. Others some distance away may only hear the crash and use the sequential order of sounds to construct an imagined event. The visual sense infers authenticity. Aurality configures representation.

Soundscapes exist on a micro level, where the individual experience binds the aural terrain – a sonic locality, an audio snapshot which defines space through a representation of sound, some reinforcing the visual, others creating imagined landscapes. On a macro level, the physical and cultural landscape is defined through its associated sounds and we are able to map a grander, imagined aural landscape. Urban, suburban, rural – each landscape is represented through the collective senses. Although our reliance on the optical means we marginalize the sound, smell and feel of a place, to construct an identity through sound heightens our perception of a region, a three dimensional representation often overlooked.

One method to unpick the ambiguity of soundscapes is to explore if and how cities have a sound. Sound may build a marketing and tourist profile for a region. New Orleans,[19] Rio de Janeiro and London's

Notting Hill have marketed themselves through parades, carnivals and sounds. From Balinese gamelan and Moroccan Jujuka, to Chicago house music and the techno of Sheffield and Detroit, locality is captured by sound. But this is a secondary association. The convergence of the social and economic are required for a soundscape to emerge. For example, Detroit and Sheffield's techno scenes emerged from the ashes of collapsing heavy industries, auto manufacturing and steel respectively. In both cases, these cities would have exhibited an earlier aural landscape, defined in part by the sound of urban industry. Similarly, the post-industrial infrastructure of Manchester was significant in the growth of cultural industries during the 1990s, which in turn strengthened the city's popular music identity. Beyond the industries, geographical determinism has an impact. A city such as Liverpool, synonymous with the beat explosion, profited from its port facilities and the vinyl palette of 1950s rock rolling onto its shores. A soundscape is also defined through time – specifically nostalgia for an earlier time – along with space. Race-based differences are significant. In New Orleans for example, the cultural clash between European, specifically French, and African populations, produced hybridity and identifiable city sound. In Kingston Jamaica, the remnants of a colonial era offered an evocative infrastructure for the blossoming ska and reggae scene as "the Ambassador, the Palace, the Ward and the Majestic, enormous, stuccoed, wedding cakes of buildings, hangovers from the glory days of colonialism,"[20] became the location for ghetto parties. Thousands flocked to hear the massive sound systems on a nightly basis.

These specific factors – industrial, geographical and colonial - are instrumental in the development of aural associations with locality, but are only part of the pluralistic nature of how landscape and soundscape confers urban identity. Jamaica has developed a strongly identifiable synergy of sound and place. Patterns of migrancy and mobility, particularly in the United States and United Kingdom through the impact of post-war technology have fused in a politicized paradox of idyllic rural and impoverished urban surroundings. Manchester's 'sound' owed much to a sophisticated media industry and embedded night time economy which provided an evocative context for the late 1980s 'Madchester' popular music boom.

It is only when we explore the gritty textures of city soundscapes do these qualities and anomalies become apparent. If cities exclude, then there are sonic consequences. If the barriers of language mean that the visual signifiers remain dominant, then soundscapes collapse. To be heard grants vindication and authenticity. The sound of a city comprises not only environmental, but also mediated constituents. To construct a representation of an urban landscape through sound must incorporate these variables to understand the musical potential of a city, through not only what we see, but hear.

Sounding the second tier

To label a city is to reify a city. It is more complex, but ultimately more rewarding, to open out labels to the intricate popular cultural layering of a city. Jane Jacobs stated that "designing a dream city is easy; rebuilding a living one takes imagination."[21] From a sports fan to tourist, from inner city resident to office worker, city imaging morphs and changes the history of the built environment. Sound attends these shifts

and movements, and creative industry initiatives spatialize the economic and social changes. As Steven Tepper confirmed, "Automation in manufacturing has cut the demand for manual labor so young people are turning to the creative industries, which may offer an attractive lifestyle and above average economic rewards."[22] Such a linear narrative from primary to secondary and tertiary industries - facilitated by technology - is easy to present, but more complex to prove and track, particularly in popular cultural industries. At its most provocative and odd, the late Tony Wilson, founder of Factory Records and the Hacienda, along with his partner Yvette Livesey were hired as a creative consultant to regenerate Burnley. They published *Dreaming of Pennine Lancashire* in June 2005 with the goal of regenerating Blackburn, Darwen, Burnley, Hyndburn, Pendle and Rossendale. Like (too) many city planners, Wilson and Livesey cite Richard Florida.

> Almost inevitably, the ubiquitous US guru of cultural regeneration, Richard Florida, gets a mention, though Wilson and Livesey cleverly anticipate the experts' groans. 'Please don't think the idea of name-checking Richard Florida is redundant for poor old east Lancashire,' the report chides. Florida discovered that the greatest thriving most moved-to bohemian town of the modern age is Seattle, they point out, and they are parallels with PL … "It is only with this bohemian culture you create the living environment for the creative class – the only way forward for the old smokestack towns – and surely east Lancashire is the world repository of the smokestack town."[23]

Perhaps Wilson was overstretching the attractiveness of Ramsbottom to 'young creatives.' While his plan was provocatively ambitious, it is significant to remember that Wilson was awarded an honorary degree from the Open University for his work on regeneration. He branded and marketed a musical city in Manchester, led by the iconography and impetus of Factory Records and the Hacienda.

Without the theoretical punctuation of Richard Florida, others have asked why particular cities have become associated with music. Peter Hook, signed to Factory and a one time co-owner of the Hacienda with Wilson, raised doubts about the simple relationship between music and space, rather than focusing on planning and policy.

> Why the hell has Manchester got so many fantastic bands? I mean, the thing that amused me about Manchester was that they were saying there was this vanguard of bands from Manchester – the way that Manchester was going to save the world with bands like the Happy Mondays and The Charlatans, Inspiral Carpets, and I used to sit there and think, what is this crap? You look at Joy Division, New Order, The Smiths … But as to why Manchester has so many bands, I've no idea. You could almost be vague enough to say that it must be something to do with the water, because there's no other bloody reason![24]

Something significant emerges musically in cities like Manchester, and it is not in the water. Peter Hook, bass player with Joy Division and New Order, expressed the problem well. Particular places develop innovative sounds and rhythms, while others do not. Located outside the matrix of global cities

(London-Paris-Madrid-Tokyo-Sydney-New York-Auckland), there are advantages in being excluded from the main musical game. Differences develop and quirky specificities thrive. The more difficult analytical exercise is to track how second cities 'talk' to each other – the urban intercession – trading differences on the monopoly board of commodified sameness. The great music cities – Seattle, Chicago, Manchester, Sheffield, Dunedin, Austin and Liverpool – are not capital cities of their respective nations. With all the creative, critical, institutional and economic attention focused on London, Los Angeles, New York and Sydney bands, DJs and producers not resident in these centres can 'hide in the light,' developing a sound, skill base, and experience without preliminary pressure.

All cities share specific characteristics, with differences instigated through immigration, landscape and economic agendas.[25] Increasingly, as governmental policies aim to develop entrepreneurial rather than social welfare initiatives, cities are sites of consumption, not collectivised political struggle. Such attention to the marketing of place not only sells a city but aims to promote local economic development. These policy initiatives emerged in (post)industrial England, where it has been necessary to re-inscribe the landscape and permit new economic strategies to develop.[26] Sheffield, with its history locked into manufacturing and steel, moved from labour intensive older industries into digital and creative industries. Not only music production, but film making, publishing and the creative arts are part of the new Sheffield. Similarly, Manchester is a post-industrial city, matching rhetoric of the knowledge economy with a high concentration of Universities, academics and teachers,[27] and leisure facilities with successful sporting teams.[28] Germany's evocative network of cities - of Munich's sport, Hamburg's transportation, Bonn's administration, Berlin's politics, Frankfurt's finance district and Dusseldorf's music - convey the diversity and interconnectivity of urban cultures. Music has been used with great effectiveness to shift the imaging of various cities, and Perth's creative industries policy makers can learn from these examples.

Liverpool is an archetype of a beat-led recovery. Paul du Noyer's study of the city has seen the port as "more than a place where music happens. Liverpool is the reason *why* music happens."[29] This spatial determinant for musical success is always difficult to verify. The continual success of Liverpool's music even after the Merseybeat explosion in the 1960s demonstrates that specific social and economic relationships allow innovative music to develop. From Frankie Goes to Hollywood to Echo and the Bunnymen, from Orchestral Manoeuvres in the Dark to Atomic Kitten and the club Cream, the relationship between creativity and commerce has forged an environment for musical production. Ports facilitate the movement of people, goods, ideas and records.

Probably the finest book written on non global city music is Barry Shank's *Dissonant identities: the rock 'n' roll scene in Austin, Texas*.[30] It is comprehensive, ethnographic and sensitive to changing urban and rural relationships. Austin's music is characterised by a desire to work through the ambivalent meanings of Texas and being Texan. As Shank realised,

> the rock 'n' roll scene in Austin, Texas, is characterised by the productive contestation between these two forces: the fierce desire to remake oneself through musical practice, and the equally powerful struggle to affirm the value of that practice in the complexly structured late-capitalist

marketplace.[31]

What makes this study so important is that Shank adds new meanings and sites to the study of a music scene, including record stores, nightclubs, rehearsal rooms and streets. He also recognises the crucial role that student consumers play in the music industry, while confirming the absences, particularly in terms of dance music and culture.[32]

Shank's study is a reminder of the scale, scope and complexity of a city's music. It is not – to repeat – Hooks' rationale that creativity is in some cities water. Instead, it is in the clubs, streets, record stories and universities.[33] In imagining and shaping the city, it is not only a question of moulding a physical environment or a policy to a soundscape, but there is a need to mobilize and market the social and economic past. James Donald notes that "the space we experience is the material embodiment of a history of social relations."[34] In incorporating theories and models of contemporary urban landscapes, an assessment can begin in how cities best facilitate existing creativity to harness and enhance the cultural development and profile of musicians.

Hearing the spaces

> Always design something to compare the design to.[35]

<div align="right">Will Alsop</div>

The key literacy of urbanity is not only understanding the limits of space, but also the ability to negotiate through that space. Interactions with the urban landscape are determined by boundaries and spatial expectations. Movements in rhythm and people raise questions of how to research city musics. Mobility always suggests compromise. Perth, like many contemporary cities, has developed around a state of auto-mobility and auto-dependency. The enormous freeway that cuts up the suburban landscape increases the awareness of classed differences. Sheller and Urry argue that this form of mobility decentres customary notions of citizenship, being "attached to the city, located in neighborhoods and associational spaces and rooted in the places of dwelling."[36] Perth's urban landscape is structured around the car, and the city's design has adapted to this form of transport rather than the needs of pedestrians.

Perth's urban landscape can be compared to Los Angeles, whose cultural identity is tethered to the automobile and boasts half its city as being restricted to 'car only' zones. Ironically it is cities with identifiable public transport systems, such as Melbourne with trams, Chicago with the over-ground Loop and London's underground, that not only grant a cosmopolitan image but also cultural marketability. Perth has witnessed what Soja terms "urbanization of the suburbs,"[37] with the development of edge cities which are synonymous with the growth of the commodity capitalism they encourage. Sheller and Urry termed this "mall centred lives of consumerism that are popular hallmarks of this post-fordist, post-metropolitan outer

city."[38]

Musical networks move in and through such spaces. Jim Shorthose and Gerard Strange confirmed that "these independent artistic networks are composed of freelancers, the temporarily employed, sole traders and micro-businesses, and those who occupy a fluid position in relation to formal cultural economy, organizations and jobs."[39] These "portfolio careers"[40] are often part-time, flexible and based around the service sector. Creativity and mobility not only become the basis of productivity but a mask for the alienation of labour. Celebrations of the creative class are rarely caveated by the low income of many workers.

This mediated urban landscape is dominated by intersections, fly-overs, rapid response signs and billboards. This is Perth's legacy. The important variable to consider is how the city maps its creative industries and agencies to work with the existing urban structure and in tandem with the community to retain its talent and provide sustained growth for the city's future. Justin O'Connor provides a case for the development of cultural industries clusters.[41] The aim of these clusters is to revitalize the urban economy and enable the city to return functions to the urban centre and transgress the industrial affiliation of work with the city and leisure with suburbia. For O'Connor, Manchester is an example of "the classic industrial district where clusters of small firms transform inputs into unique and competitive output."[42] Such a model does not easily fit the Perth landscape which lacks the manufacturing legacy of 19th century Lancashire and the experience of rapid de-industrialization of the 1970s and 1980s Britain. His "spoke and wheel" model is based on a "satellite platform district"[43] made up of smaller clusters of cultural industries that develop along the lines of the city's existing infrastructure and patterns of urban mobility. The city – as a landscape, built environment and history – is a key resource. The value of clusters is to develop networks of collaboration and trust, while building on local knowledge.

The Perth music scene is perceived at this time through the international success of acts like Sleepy Jackson, Pendulum and Greg Packer to have global currency, but has actually received little support from the existing music infrastructure. There has even been a documentary released, titled *Something in the Water*. It is this recognition of Perth's position within the national and global economies and the ability to tap into niche markets which needs to be addressed through both local acknowledgement and a system of support to prevent a drain of creative talent. Such an issue is made more significant and indicative when comparing Perth to Pennsylvania. Patrick Jones realized that,

> a major reason cited for Pennsylvania's inability to retain young workers is that its communities lack the types of lifestyle amenities to which they are attracted. Knowledge economy workers want to live in vibrant and diverse communities with lively arts scenes that are too rarely found in Pennsylvania.[44]

Closeness to universities and touristic appeal has also been confirmed as a way to maintain young and creative workers, as has the importance of a vibrant music industry.[45] The promotion of creative industries requires city agents to be proactive in the development and tracking of creativity. How a city becomes 'creative' is not simply based on a formula that can be implemented at will and the results quantified.

The plurality of cities, through location and history, means that the identifications of causes and origins are largely retrospective. Such tracking is made more complex when monitoring the passage of migrants.

Perth has, in the recent past, undergone not only considerable population growth, but also migration from overseas music communities, which have transformed the urban cultural makeup as a counterpoint to the city's geographical isolation. Unlike Great Britain, which experienced the shift from a largely manufacturing economy to a service economy via Thatcher's rapid deindustrialization, cities like Perth have changed more slowly, but have nonetheless seen transformations. With paid employment insecure, part-time and temporary, self employment becomes viable option. Often in the music industry, casual employment is the reality.

Attention to boundaries and movement prevents urban environments being exclusive, while simultaneously injecting an important dynamism into the local economy. In order for a city's music to work effectively, it must confront the legacies and inequalities in the past and find a way to manage and mark, label and commodify specificity. The musical city must be transparent and easily negotiable. Access should not be inhibited by the grounds of class, gender or race. The creative industry clusters around music, the arts and media sectors can network and build tacit knowledge to capitalize on niche markets and global trends. Yet there must be an openness to trans-local knowledge, not rigid national structures.

Deaf to difference

Perth has not learnt from these other musical cities, tacit knowledges and the subtleties of the soundscape. The music is mobile, but the policy makers remain locked in the local. On February 26, 2005, a panel of great and good music gurus, mostly from the other states of Australia, was summoned to Perth's Monkey Bar to offer expert testimony about independent music and the 'DIY Revolution.' All were old(er) white men. There were no immigrants included in the panel, let alone indigenous contributors. The lack of diversity in the panel – and the lack of recognition that this may be a problem – offered a poignant insight into the sociology of rock management and the independent music sector.

Without shooting the sender, their message was narrow and damaging. Affirming a strong anti-corporate ethos, arguing – quite rightly – that major record labels have shareholders interested in profit, the motives and agenda of the Independent sector was not as clean as their confident opinions suggested. While stressing the great benefits of the independent companies to artists, their disrespect of the people who actually buy the music, attend the gigs and enjoy the performers seethed from the stage. While affirming democracy, equality and dialogue between label owners and performers, the demeaning of the audience was palpable. At one point, David Botica, CEO of AIR (the Association of Independent Record labels) referred to "the great unwashed" who buy records in supermarkets. The unquestioned elitism and disrespect of consumers, supposedly emerging from the democratizing initiative of independent music management, was ruthless and cutting. Emerging from a panel of white men, such commentary was even more offensive. Until Perth looks beyond Australia and national models of music, to grasp locality and mobility, such men will continue to be lauded and celebrated.

To develop city musics requires analytical subtlety in understanding the specificity of a sonic environment, while also deploying trans-local knowledge systems and comparisons. The great question remains how the conditions for creativity are fostered for economic growth and encourage diversity. The celebration of the new economy or the creativity industries rarely hints that the effort and attention required in the development of policy, planning curriculum development or creative pedagogy. Cities not only provide a context, but a gateway and a brand. Musical cities transform a landscape into a sonic, mobile and diverse soundscape. By hearing difference, by validating the intercessions of sound, there may be a chance to make a difference. If Doctor Who can move beyond the Home Counties, then perhaps finally record executives and policy makers can rediscover and align the metaphoric North in every nation, region and city.

Notes

[1] "Rose," written by Russell T. Davies and R. Shearman, *Doctor Who Volume 1*, (London: BBC, 2005)

[2] C. Landry, *The Creative City*, (London: Comedia, 2004; 2000)

[3] J. O'Connor, "A special kind of city knowledge," Paper for the Manchester Institution for Popular Culture, Manchester Metropolitan University, 2004

[4] Richard Florida referred to "geography of creativity," in *The rise of the Creative Class*, (London: Basic Books, 2002). He focused more closely on creativity and urbanity in *Cities and the Creative Class*, (New York: Routledge, 2004)

[5] Landry, p. xiii

[6] Christopher Madden, recognized the movement of arts terms into management theory in "Creativity and arts policy," *Journal of Arts Management, Law and Society*, Vol.34, No. 2, Summer 2004.

[7] We wish to note the ideological volatility of the term creativity. Christopher Madden stated that "creativity, long associated with the arts, is now a buzzword in other domains – most notably, in management theory and practice, in pop psychology, and in government innovation and creative industries policies," from "Creativity and Arts Policy," *Journal of Arts Management, Law and Society*, Vol. 34, No. 2, Summer 2004, p. 133

[8] A. Brown, J. O'Connor and S. Cohen, "Local music policies within a global music industry: cultural quarters in Manchester and Sheffield," *Geoforum*, Vol. 31, 2000, p. 437

[9] W. Alsop, "Stately pleasure domes," from Will Alsop's *SuperCity*, (Manchester: Urbis, 2005), p. 12

[10] J. Urry, *Global Complexity*, (Cambridge: Polity, 2003)

[11] This distinction is important. For Urry, structure implies "a centre, a concentration of power, vertical hierarchy and a formal or informal constitution," *ibid.*, p. 9

[12] *Making music: findings and recommendations of the Ministerial taskforce into contemporary music*, Department of Culture and the Arts, Perth, September 2002

[13] *The Premier's fashion industry taskforce report*, Department of Premier and Cabinet, Government of Western Australia, August 2003

[14] Championing Creativity, Department of Culture and the Arts, Government of Western Australia, http://www.dca.wa.gov.au/ data/assets/pdf_file/0014/8204/Championing_Creativity_2004- 2007.pdf

[15] ibid. p. 11

[16] This relationship was investigated by Craig Thompson and Zeyne Arsel in "The Starbucks Brandscape and consumers' (anticorporate) experience of glocalization," *Journal of Consumer Research*, Vol. 31, No. 3, December 2004, p. 631

[17] Justin O'Connor stressed the importance of "local, tacit know-how – a style, a look, a sound – which is not accessible globally. Thus the cultural industries based on local know-how and skills show how cities can negotiate a new accommodation with the global market, in which cultural producers sell into much larger markets but rely on a distinctive and defensible local base," from "A special kind of city knowledge," paper for the Manchester Institute for Popular Culture, Manchester Metropolitan University, 2004, p. 2

[18] J. Berendt, *The third ear*, (New York: Henry Holt, 1985), p. 32

[19] A fascinating but horrifying consequence of Katrina was the displacement of the city's musicians. Fats Domino was rescued from the city and others left for Memphis, Chicago and Detroit when confronted by the destruction of New Orleans. In terms of our current study, this tragedy also demonstrates the movement of city musics, creating not only mobility but hybridity between jazz, blues and electronica.

[20] L. Bradley, *Bass Culture*, (London: Penguin, 2000) p.18

[21] J. Jacobs, cited in I. Hassan, "Cities in mind, urban world," in M. Jaye and A. Chalmers Watts (eds.) *Literature and the urban experience*, (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 1981), p. 97

[22] S. Tepper, "Creative assets and the changing economy," *The Journal of Arts Management, Law and Society*, Vol. 32, No. 2, Summer 2002, p. xv

[23] H. Carter and T. Wilson, "Stacks of potential," *SocietyGuardian*, June 15, 2005, p. 2

[24] P. Hook from C.P. Lee's *Shake rattle and rain: popular music making in Manchester 1955-1995*, (Devon: Hardinge Simpole Publishing, Devon, 2002), p. 1

[25] To monitor how these similarities and differences are studied, please refer to the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council of Canada-funded project, 'Culture of Cities,' <http://www.yorku.ca/culture_of_cities>, May 10, 2005. Particularly, they are interested in researching the links and distinctions between Montreal, Toronto, Berlin and Dublin.

[26] Phil Hubbard researched this process for the city of Birmingham. Please refer to his 'Urban design and city regeneration: social representations of entrepreneurial landscapes,' *Urban Studies*, Vol. 33, No. 8, 1996, pp. 1441-1461

[27] Moving from Salford University along the A6 corridor into central Manchester, there are three

universities, the BBC and Urbis, along with The Lowry and the Imperial War Museum North.

[28] The sporting facilities include the City of Manchester Stadium, the National Squash Centre, the English Institute for Sports Development through to the two Old Traffords for the Lancashire County Cricket Club and the home of Manchester United.

[29] P. du Noyer, *Liverpool: wondrous place, music from Cavern to Cream*, Virgin Books, London, 2002, p. 1

[30] B. Shank, *Dissonant identities; the rock'n'roll scene in Austin, Texas*, Wesleyan University Press, Hanover, 1994

[31] *ibid.*, p. x

[32] Shank argued that disco and its derivatives never gained a strong presence in Austin because of the city's race-based history. The limited presence of an African-American culture constrained the success and relevance of disco and post-house musics.

[33] The role of universities must be noted here. Professor Geoffrey Crossick, upon being made the new warden of Goldsmiths College, stressed the importance of media studies, which Margaret Hodge, the former higher education minister, had described as 'Mickey Mouse courses.' Crossick stated that "what has always puzzled me about the whole thing is that the same people say that the creative industries are the most booming part of the economy." As the former chair of the Department for Culture, Media and Sport's task force on the creative industries, he confirmed that "The creative industries contribute more the UK's balance of trade than the pharmaceutical industry," *The Guardian*, June 14, 2005, p. 20

[34] J. Donald, *Imagining the modern city*, (Minneapolis: Minnesota Press, 1999), p. 13

[35] W. Alsop in K. Powell, *Will Alsop*, (London: Lawrence King Publishing, 2001), p. 37

[36] M. Sheller and J. Urry, "The city and the car," in M. Miles and T. Hall and I. Brouden (eds.), *The City Cultures Reader*, (London: Routledge, 2000), p. 205

[37] E. Soja, "Exopolis: the restructuring of the urban form," in M. Miles, T. Hall and I. Brouden (eds.), *The City Cultures Reader*, (London Routledge, 2000), p. 454

[38] Soja, "Exopolis," p. 457

[39] J. Shorthose and G. Strange, "The new cultural economy, the artist and the social configuration of autonomy," *Capital and Class*, Vol. 84, 2004, p. 47

[40] *ibid.*, p. 48

[41] J. O'Connor, "A special kind of city knowledge," Paper for the Institute for Popular Culture, Manchester Metropolitan University, 2004

[42] *ibid.,* p. 9

[43] *ibid.*, O'Conner, p. 9

[44] P. Jones, "Music education and the knowledge economy," *Arts Education Policy Review*, Vol. 106, No. 4, March/April 2004, p. 5

[45] Pierre Filion, Heidi Hoernig, Trudi Bunting and Gary Sands enacted a research project on the formulation of successful downtowns in the US and Canada. Please refer to "The successful few: healthy downtowns of small metropolitan regions," *American Planning Association*, Vol. 70, No. 3, Summer 2004.

Toward a Revolutionary Emirati Poetics: Ghabesh's *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin?*

By Saddik M. Gohar

Abstract

This paper critically investigates the dialectics of myth and tradition in *Beman ya Buthayn Taluthin ? / Who Will Secure a Safe Haven for Buthayn?* (2002) by the female Emirati poet Saleha Obeid Ghabesh in order to locate this poetic collection in its appropriate place within the context of the Arabic literary canon . Utilizing contemporary literary theory as analytical framework, the paper explores the poet's reconstruction of myth and tradition as aesthetic dynamics to articulate significant topics integral to the UAE community and the Arab world in an era of enormous transformations. In an attempt to interrupt the cultural mythology of a patriarchal society and encounter a world battered by humiliating defeats, the poet resurrects the Arabo-Islamic history in Andalusia to navigate contemporary issues rooted in the collective memory of the Arab nation**.** Confronting a web of decadent traditions which draw the Arab world backward and subverting politics of oppression which aim to silence Arab women during the era of gender consciousness, the poet engages intertextuality as a sophisticated technique linking the past with the present in a subtle poetic context.

Introduction

Though she is not yet a popular poet in the sense that great numbers of people read her works, one could praise Saleha Obeid Ghabesh for the thematic diversity of her poetry , her brilliant use of language, her structural inventiveness and subtle depiction of Arab dreams and frustrations as well as her exploration of revolutionary feminist issues. In addition to its feminist perspective, the poetry of the female Emirati poet is imbued with lyricism and textual complexity that resist generic categorization. Besides an engagement with social and political issues, Ghabesh's poetry is characterized by its existential concerns and universal motifs which make it appealing to those interested in promulgating historical and universal pursuits.

Since she is largely unknown in the Arabic literary canon, her poetry, particularly her anthology *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin* (2002) requires critical explication and analysis. Capturing the catastrophic history of the Arab world at present, the poet reconstructs episodes from the history of Islamic Andalusia engaging into intertextual dialogues with feminist Andalusian poetry in which narratives of exile, defeat and subordination occupy the foreground.

As a whole, Ghabesh's poetry examines reconsiderations of contemporary problems of domination and hegemony playing a conspicuously prominent role in the formation and dissemination of notions of reform on the political and feminist paradigms. Serving as a potential signpost in Emirati cultural criticism, her poetry attempts to abolish all distinctions between men and women in the Arab world as well as other binarisms that constitute a legacy of patriarchal ways of thinking. Incorporating feminist and social issues rooted in the collective consciousness of the Arab people, Ghabesh attempts to place contemporary Emirati poetry in the context of current transformations in global relationships linking local cultural discourses with the intellectual concerns and orientations originating at the central sites of western literary canons.

Therefore, one of the central features of Ghabesh's poetry is an extensive use of myth and legend adapted and recycled to incorporate themes of contemporary significance in modern Arab contexts. In her preface to *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin? / Who will Secure a Safe Haven for Buthayn?,* she establishes an analogy between herself and the Andalusian princess, Buthayna bint al-Mutamed, the central female voice in the anthology. The links between the Emirati poet and her Andalusian counterpart are intertwined to the extent that "they become one personality, one woman" (Ghabesh 2002: 5). Apparently, the Emirati poet is interested in the eventful life of her predecessor, Buthayna, because "her biography includes myth and tradition" according to Ghabesh. The life story of Buthayna, the Andalusian princess and the daughter of al-Mutamed ben Abbad, the king of Seville, a city located in Southwestern Spain, is the central inspiration for *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin?*

During the Muslim occupation of Southern Spain (Andalusia) which lasted more than seven hundred years (755-1492), Arabo-Muslim rulers established several kingdoms which were subsequently dismantled after the restoration of Spain. In the aftermath of the collapse of the Muslim empire and the loss of Andalusia, Buthayna's parents were exiled to Morocco, however, the princess and the harem in her father's palace were sold into slavery. Unaware of Buthayna's royal origin, a slave merchant from Seville bought her as a present for his son but Buthayna refused to surrender her body to him. After the revelation of her identity and noble descent, Buthayna gained the admiration of her captor who, taken with her beauty and virtues, proposed to her. Falling in love with him because of his kindness and respect for her, Buthayna accepted the engagement but refused to consummate their marriage until she could get the consent of her father, the exiled king. But since Buthayna's decision to marry the young Spaniard was considered as an enormous transgression which goes counter to the dictates of an Islamic patriarchal society, she decided to negotiate with her domineering father rather than to clash with him. Using her feminine powers of negotiation, she was able to gain the sympathy of her father who inevitably accepted her marriage to someone who belonged to the enemy camp.

Being aware of her father's fascination with eloquent poetry and being a poet herself, she sent him a captivating poem explaining her predicament and persuaded him to bless her marriage:

> Do not deny my ordeal
> I was sold out into slavery
> it is God's will that the great
> king has lost his throne
> in the era of corruption
> we were separated to taste
> the flavor of distress
> when the forces of hypocrisy
> deprived my father of his kingdom
> we were forced to leave each other
> I attempted to escape
> but I fell into captivity (cited in Ghabesh 2002: 8).[1]

The references to "the era of corruption" and "the forces of hypocrisy" allude not only to catastrophic events leading to the fall of the Arabo-Muslim dynasty in Andalusia but also to contemporary and similar circumstances threatening to disintegrate the Arab nation. After an exploration of her own ordeal resulting from the collapse of her father's kingdom in Seville, Buthayna appeals to her parents to accept her marriage from the son of the Spanish slave merchant because she fell in love with him due to his sense of morality and good manners: "Dear father, I hope you bless our marriage / since he adores me / Dear royal mother, the descendant of kings / I hope you wish us happiness and good luck" (cited in Ghabesh 2002 : 9). According to the Emirati poet, Buthayna, who was sold out into slavery, "was able to win the battle for freedom and life" (Ghabesh 2002: 9). Moreover, Ghabesh reveals her personal admiration of Buthayna because she insisted on marrying the man she loved without violating the moral codes of her family and society.

The encounter with Buthayna's story, particularly her strength to convince her parents of her marriage from someone who belongs to the hostile tribe or the enemy state makes a clear shift in Ghabesh's poetic orientation. In other words, the crux of *Beman Ya Bathayn Taluthin?* centers around a climatic incident – the Emirati poet's identification with Buthayna's narrative which had a profound impact upon her inner transformation. Functioning as a kind of metonymy for Ghabesh, Buthayna's story forced her to confront the repressive constructions of a contemporary male-oriented society with narcissus and hostile attitudes toward women. In her attempt to transcend the intersecting sites of oppression that Arab women experience, she challenges politics of sexual subjugation and discrimination based on race and class. Regardless of her condemnation of a patriarchal and phallocentric system, her attempt to change reality seems to be dedicated by an ever-respectful, non-violent feminine desire for a dialogue with the other which does not seek to appropriate or obliterate him. However, her preoccupation with the complexities of power relations in contemporary Arab contexts makes her poetry rich and challenging. Therefore, an appropriation of western feminist theories carried over into analysis of Arabic literature may lead to enormous evaluation

of Ghabesh's poetics.

For example, the critic, Debra Castillo, in her discussion of feminist literature, argues: "as far as I'am concerned, a work is feminist insofar as it attempts to explain the mechanics of cruelty, oppression and violence through a story that is developed in a world in which men and women exist" (Castillo 1992: 189). Obviously, the story of Buthayna with her parents and her experience of slavery constitutes a point of departure for the Emirati poet, preoccupied with a construction of feminist poetics able to confront current domestic challenges and international transformations sweeping the Arab world. In spite of belonging to different backgrounds and histories, Ghabesh and Buthayna share common experiences which undoubtedly yield a more grounded, more incisive feminine implications and signifiers. In other words, there are common ties, which bind Buthayna and the Emirati poet together in relation to their feminine heritage, but they also have in common the shared history of subordination. Exploring the power of Buthayna as a symbol of female rebellion against patriarchal authority, Ghabesh , in a parallel process, probes a culture that seeks to mute her banishing her outside human history.

Engaging into dialogues with Buthayna, the Emirati poet is able to hear her voice, speak to her and the voice answers in return. The moment of epiphany in *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin?* is Ghabesh's realization that Arab women will inevitably be able to gain their freedom if they follow the example of Buthayna: refusing to become part of the historical ghetto – the harem mentality perpetuated by a patriarchal culture. In this context, Buthayna's voice becomes the voice of the oppressed women in the Arab world functioning as a trope, a refuge and creating a tone of familiarity and intimacy which gives Ghabesh the authority to link her own history with the ancient / feminist Andalusian tradition. Like Buthayna, Ghabesh's existential anguish is originated in the dialectics between her desire to be released from a patriarchal culture and her fear from the consequences of revolt against a tribal tradition which subjugates the female for a long time. Encouraged by Buthayna's treatment of her ordeal, Ghabesh questions the patriarchal / tribal assumptions which shaped her life penetrating into the core of a tradition that seeks to banish the female subaltern outside the realm of humanity.

Intertextuality, Tradition and Trans-Cultural Literature

The use of the Andalusian heritage and mythology in Ghabesh's poetry brings to the forefront the issue of intertextuality as an aspect of a transcultural literature that transgresses linguistic and cultural boundaries and disciplinary barriers. Explicitly , the term intertextuality was introduced for the first time in 1929 by Mikhael Bakhtin, in his book *Problems of Dostoevsky's Poetics*, which contains a collection of essays. The concept was developed in 1981 in Bakhtin's study *The Dialogic Imagination* where he argues that the functional text is a hybrid entity, not a single whole, it is a composite amalgamation of a variety of formulae (Bakhtin 1981: 76). Bakhtin's argument in *The Dialogic Imagination* advances the theory of intertextuality underlying the existence of a dialogue between the writer and early writers not just between texts as subsequent theorists such as Roland Barthes seemed to think. At the core of Bakhtin's theory lies

an equation between a writer and other writers, a text and other texts in addition to a kind of human participation integral to the dialogues taking place between writers.

Historically , it is relevant to argue that T.S. Eliot was a precursor of the theory of intertextuality. As an advocate of allusiveness and interexuality, Eliot, in "Tradition and Individual Talent", underlines the temporal relationship of one writer with other writers and of one text with others. Eliot argues that the literary heritage of nations forms an organic whole and no single poet is able to make a complete meaning alone because his / her genius is the result of other works: "the most individual parts of work may be those in which the dead poets, his [her] ancestors, assert their immortality most vigorously" (Eliot 1972: 71). Therefore, poets should work within tradition described by Eliot in "The Function of Criticism" as paradigms or "systems in relation to which, individual works of individual artists have their significance" (Eliot 1972: 77).

From a theoretical perspective, intertextuality designates vast and undefined discursive spaces and it is a way to "dissipate the many ambiguities and errors such as those brought alone in the wake of the notion of influence" (Guillen 1993: 244). In the same context , Jay Clayton and Eric Rothstein point out that in modern critical canons, the premise of influence contingent upon the author or authorial intentions and background is substituted by the concept of intertextuality (Clayton & Rothstein 1991: 3). In addition to the aforementioned argument , intertextuality is a two-sided issue and the intertextual explication of a contemporary text with references to an old one should illuminate both texts because the knowledge of the old text supplements the understanding of its contemporary counterpart. Thus, prior knowledge of both texts is central for the reader in order to create analogies and to bring into focus parallel connections and common issues. Therefore, it is convenient to compare a text, for explicatory purposes, with other texts by the same author or other authors from the present or the past taking into consideration inherent affinities and intertextual comparabilities. On this basis , Jonathan Culler identifies intertextuality as a literary technique dealing with specific analogies and establishing linkages between texts:

> Intertextuality is less a name for a work's relation to particular prior texts than a designation of its participation in the discursive space of a culture. Study of intertextuality is not the investigation of sources and influences as traditionally conceived, it casts its net wider to include anonymous discursive practices, codes whose origins are lost, that make possible the signifying practice of later texts" (Culler 1981: 103).

In a related context, Roland Barthes identifies the literary text as network of "multiple writings" which come from a variety of sources and discourses already in circulation in some form or other. To him, the writer is a synthesizer who deliberately reworks and echoes other texts because "the text is a tissue of quotations drawn from the innumerable centers of culture" (Barthes 1977: 146). Moreover, an intertextual study of two texts or more in terms of their allusive connections may not always lead to a full understanding. Thus, the domain of intertextuality extends beyond the limits of time, place, acquaintance, allusions and influence. The intertextual closeness between a text and another may be determined by their exploration of similar issues, projection of identical motifs, portrayal of similar characters, depiction of parallel

situations and treatment of common problems. As expression of resembling themes, the texts, approached from an intertextual perspective, may be close or remote in time and place and the authors may or may not have alluded to or influenced by or even heard about each other. According to Paul Ricour,

> each text is free to enter into relation with all the other texts which come to take the place of circumstantial reality referred to by living speech. This relation of text to text engenders the quasi- world of texts of literature (Ricour 1981: 149).

The Use of Andalusian Narratives as Intertext in *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin?*

Since texts resist simple clear-cut interpretations, Ghabesh's poetic discourse in *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin*? is revelation of intersections of motifs, narratives and myths integral to the Islamic literary tradition in Andulasia (ancient Spain). In her anthology, Ghabesh aesthetically transforms Andalusian history into a contemporary poetic construct incorporating Andalusian literature as intertext to explore political and social issues of great significance. An intertextual reading of Ghabesh's poetry provides an entry into her appropriation of Andalusian cultural heritage as a vehicle to express the dilemma of contemporary Arab history. Reflecting a range of trans-textual relationships with Andulasian culture and highlighting significant thematic parallels which link the past with the present, Ghabesh creates a hybridized poetics deeply rooted in classical traditions. In her attempt to reshape Andalusian historical narratives into a revolutionary dynamics, the Emirati poet attempts to develop a counter feminized mechanism to subvert a decadent patriarchal culture which drags the Arab world backward toward the Stone Age. In her feminist poetry , Ghabesh attributes contemporary deterioration and recurrent defeats integral to modern Arab history to the same hegemonic system which gives birth to the Arab patriarchal tradition.

In Ghabesh's opening poem "Do not deny that I was sold out into slavery / La tunkiro anny sobeit" , the poet evokes the themes of female subordination and sexual slavery linking the past with the present in a unique poetic structure. The title is explicitly quoted from Buthayna's poem to her father, the ex-king of Seville when she appeals to him to approve her marriage from a man who descends from European origin. The analogy between Buthayna's story and the argument of the female persona , in Ghabesh's aforementioned poem , reveals common concerns about women's freedom and human rights. The Emirati poet's incorporation of the Andalusian narrative functions as a cry of anger in the face of a repressive tradition and a submissive society which attempt to marginalize the female subaltern. In this context, the Andulasian legend is reshaped to serve as a call for reform and social change in the Arab world. Subsequently, Ghabesh's poem becomes a cry within a cry against a decadent culture which robs women of their innocence and little dreams. Using myths and symbols acquired from Andulasian history, the poet enhances the central features of the poem by incorporating imagery and metaphors of anxiety and sorrow:

> Taken as a captive
> as if I were part of a language[2]

inconceivable to the passersby
whose statutes are formed
by the flames of an arid fire
and a storm dying on our distress
taken as a captive
as if I were a fading night
approaching sunrise but
my appearance is denied
by the rising morning
forcing me to regress into my cloak
scolding me:
"this morning is not for you" (Ghabesh 2002: 14).

Utilizing a complex pattern of legends and symbols borrowed from Andalusian history, Ghabesh expresses her vision of female enslavement and displacement through allusive references which enrich the thematic range of the poem. The recurring references to aridity , death , distress , captivity and enslavement motifs in addition to themes of denial and regression underline the extreme pain and suffering inflicted on women in repressive societies :

Here I buried the tears
of my patience dispersing
the leaves of promises
that scorn my fidelity
I was gradually turned into
an ice statute, colonized
by the frost of my naïve expectations (14).

The female persona in the above-cited lines describes an experience of great agony in which the female body is colonized by a masculine structure and her humanity is violated by a patriarchal tradition until she is transformed into a statute of ice . In a poem comprising allusions and references to Andalusian narratives of oppression and revolt and standing as a testimony of contemporary patriarchal hegemony, the poet transforms history into a feminist construct interrelated with other tales of female persecution:

The Andalusian nights are making a confession
but there is no one to hear
all the maids and servants are gone
departing the kingdom of al-Mutamed
accompanying him to his Moroccan exile
surrounding his defeated throne
setting it in order
and filling his Diaspora palace

with wounded songs which
turn into tears in Buthayna's eyes (15)

Engaging themes of defeat, exile and exodus, the poet apparently points out that the Arab rulers did not draw moral lessons from their ancient history in Spain or elsewhere :" the Andalusian nights are making a confession / but there is no one to hear". The fall of the Muslim dynasty in Andalusia , accelerated by Arab-Arab wars and conspiracies , is considered as a turning point in Arabo-Islamic history. Therefore, the explicit references to "the Andalusian nights", the "defeated throne", the "Diaspora palace" and "the wounded songs" not only recall the collapse of the Muslim empire in Andalusia but also hint at further losses at present : 'All hearts turn into wooden soldiers /safeguarding the palace of al- Mutamed / the Andalusian nights make a confession / in languages written with hybrid letters /and glorified by the advocates of treason' (15).

Evoking the loss of Andalusia and the exodus of the Arabs from Spain in the fifteenth century , the Emirati poet predicts the emergence of more catastrophes at present as long as the Arab region is dominated by a repressive / patriarchal tradition which ignores the female subaltern traditionally considered as a second class citizen . Using images of humiliation and defeat as a metaphoric equivalence of contemporary Arab history, the poet links the tragic consequences of female oppression and subordination in the Arab world with other aspects of backwardness and defeat on the political paradigm. For example , the recurrent allusions to the political corruption associated with the Arab kingdoms in Andalusia bring to the forefront the dictatorial / oppressive policies advocated by contemporary Arab regimes. While the Arab-Arab conflicts in ancient Spain brought about the fall of the Arab dynasties in Andalusia , contemporary Arab policies of oppression and the rising dictatorial regimes , in the era of post-colonization, were responsible for Arab defeats and the loss of Palestinian territories. Apparently, Ghabesh incorporates Andalusian history to invoke new assumptions using a poetic language which cuts across myth and history.

Nevertheless, the strength of her poetry lies in the way in which she manages to push aside unnecessary details removing the arbitrary and the accidental. Confronted by a society battered by humiliation and defeats and a culture mutilated by patriarchal constructs, she attempts to restore a world out of ruins. Castigating a world at odds with the modern concepts of equality, freedom and democracy, the poet wants the current way of life radically charged, if not completely destroyed. This process of destruction of male-oriented traditions which marginalize the female subaltern involves the use of poetry as a weapon of resistance, a premise which dominates the poetic text of Ghabesh's anthology. In this context, the Emirati poet emerges as a politico-feminist poet whose textual polemic, outlined in the paper, is an analogy of her creative appropriation of Andalusian history. Unlike parasitic appropriations, performed by other poets, her literary project offers insights into the present and the future of a feminist poetics in UAE, the Gulf region and the Arab world.

Incorporating Andalusian heritage, Ghabesh takes the title of her poem "What you Might do my Father / Fa-asak ya Abati" from Buthayna's verses of appeal to her father in which she begs him to bless her marriage to the man she loves. In the poem, Ghabesh's female persona, twice marginalized on account

of her sex and her social status, grapples with concepts and constructs implicated in the patriarchal and hegemonic power relations denouncing a tradition which seeks to mute her in the era of gender and race consciousness. Confronting hegemonic structures which attempt to isolate Arab women by assigning them conventional feminine traits such as silence and weakness, she purports to explore the limitations and dangers of a reactionary culture which aims to obliterate the female identity. Identifying herself with Buthayna, the Emirati poet (or her female persona) says :

> The tears of Buthayna recognized me
> when I entered the door
> the tears reveal the secrets of my silence
> like Buthyana I am scared
> of the well-dressed people
> who set the trap for me
> I am scared of the necklace of illusion
> you put around my neck
> scared of the sudden interest in me when
> you gave me as a gift
> to a very old man whose body is ploughed
> by coldness and frost
> Father, I thought you have known me! (17)

Obviously 'the tears of Buthayna' and the persona in the poem become the tears of all oppressed women in societies which obliterate female identities. The references to the female persona's fear of 'the necklace of illusion' and the indications implied in 'the sudden interest in me' are testimonies of a marriage bargain in which the father accepts to give his young daughter ' as a gift / to a very old man / whose body is ploughed / by coldness and frost' . Lamenting the unjust treatment of girls in conservative Arab communities , the poet castigates conventional marriage traditions which totally ignore the female . Describing marriage as a kind of trap and denouncing a society which forces girls to marry against their will giving them as gifts to old men or sacrificing them as scapegoats on the altar of a decadent tradition, Ghabesh contrasts the tale of female oppression in the Arab world with the narrative of resistance and revolt embedded in Buthayna's story.

After her address to her father, in the aforementioned poem, Ghabesh "or her persona" engages herself into a one-sided dialogue with Buthayna: "I thought he knows me, Buthayna / like the birds which know you / when you walk on the Andalusian coast" (18). Apparently, a juxtaposition is established between the tolerant behavior of Buthayna's father[3], in the Andalusian myth and the patriarchal / hegemonic attitude of contemporary Arab parents toward their daughters who are forced to marry against their will:

> You lost your father, Buthayna
> and he lost you, the notebook
> which he reads to the city

you are the best word in his alphabet
until your features are lost in alien contexts
the pulpits of Seville are waiting anxiously
for the return of al-Mutamed
who may mention your name
in the coming sermon (19)

As a carrier of a repressive tradition and a symbol of rebellion against patriarchal hegemonic structures , Buthayna is resurrected from the past in order to enable the Emirati poet to probe contemporary female predicaments : "but he is unaware / that you were sold in auction / he does not know that you throw / your name inside the furnace of fear / He is still unaware that the girl has no genealogy (20).

In the preceding lines the 'he' apparently refers to a contemporary father figure haunted by a patriarchal / tribal tradition that aims to crush the soul and the body of the female. Here , the voice of Buthayna and that of Ghabesh (or her persona) merge together constructing a cry of anger against the subordination of their biological and literary femininity by hegemonic cultures.[4] Since Buthayna's story reproduces the same patriarchal hegemony that Ghabesh denounces in her poetry, the latter's narrative of victimization becomes an extension of the former's in a ritualistic manner reminiscent of Shehrazade's stories in *A Thousand Nights and One Night.* Therefore, the space created by the coordinates of the textual relationship between Buthayna and Ghabesh, identified and analyzed above, provides more insight into Ghabesh's exploration of the dynamic relation between self and other. This view is contingent upon the Emirati poet's entanglement with the Islamic history in Andalusia within the praxis of Buthayna's narrative.

Conclusion

The feminist French critic, Hélén Cixous[5] underlines the role of language and feminine writing as constructs for subverting patriarchal structures of domination in the areas of language, politics and society. In her feminist / critical studies, she attempts to introduce alternative discourses to patriarchal logo-centrism which reduces women to positions of subordination. Like Cixous, Ghabesh, through her poetry, attempts to dismantle an apparatus of suppression rooted in patriarchal ideologies which aim to mute the female subaltern by assigning her a status of inferiority. In an attempt to undermine cultural and ideological hegemonies which seek to marginalize Arab women, the Emirati poet promulgates a feminine poetics perpetuating Andalusian heritage and subverting significant elements of local religious and cultural history.

In "Prior to the Final Fall / Qabl al-suqut al-Akhir", Ghabesh refers to her encounter with a man in the evening: "the evening will be under my disposal / and the meeting at the edge of fear is mine / I am another Buthayna / perfume springs from me / as well as love and Diaspora / at a time when the tribe gives up trembling / the river can never abandon a chaste body" (56). The references to anti-feminist tribal mentality, rooted in Arabic traditions, and the association of the poet with Buthayna underline a history of female

oppression which extends from the Atlantic Ocean to the Persian Gulf. Like Buthayna, the Emirati poet, through her female personas, expresses agony and fear as a result of being involved in a new experience in a patriarchal society: "I am scared of the captivity of my soul / I took the initiative of coming to his prison / on the doorstep I left my crown / I entered his house as a servant / trembling out of coldness / after my confession he liberated me / then he orders me / to recite his song" (58). The fearful experience of the Emirati poet's persona and the allusions to prisons and captivity of the soul are indications of major social problems encountering women in the contemporary Arab society which forces them to surrender to an oppressive masculine tradition: 'he orders me / to recite his song'. Living in an internal diaspora, the poet laments life in an alienated society where "stories are broken" and her hands are bleeding "in exile". Witnessing "the fading lights of the candles / before the final fall" (67) , the female subaltern has no option except to "set her tent in order / closing the door and remain there / waiting for the season of departure" (59).

In *A Map of Misreading,* Harold Bloom considers the attempt to evade earlier writing, produced by an author's predecessors , as a basic motivation in literary production. In this context, Bloom illustrates that in order "to live, the poet must misinterpret the father by the crucial act of misprision, which is the rewriting of the father" (Bloom 1975: 19). In *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin?* Ghabesh, unlike male poets who reconstruct the texts of their forebears in order to dismantle them, rewrites her female predecessor integrating her poetic narrative into the contemporary literary canon. Ignoring Bloom's call for contemporary poets to "differentiate themselves into strength by trooping or turning from the presence of other poets" (Bloom 1975: 80), Ghabesh reveals no sign of anxiety, toward her Andalusian forebear violating Bloom's paradigm of literary influence. In addition to her adaptation of the Andalusian narrative to explore contemporary socio-political issues, the Emirati poet does not perform a textual dismemberment of Buthayna , her female Andalusian predecessor, but she allows her to recur in the new contextual corpus.

In other words, Ghabesh, in *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin?* does not imply a privileged position for her own poetic discourse simply because Buthayna, the Andalusian princess or the dead narrator, reads Ghabesh as much as Ghabesh reads her. Apparently, the major inspiration and the guiding light which come to the Emirati poet from the history of Andalusia in general and from the story of Butayna in particular form a poetic structure for her anthology linking the fall of Seville and Grenada with contemporary collapses and catastrophes on different fronts in the Arab world. Ghabesh, in her anthology, explicitly associates the loss of Arab glory in ancient Spain and in contemporary history to the domination of decadent patriarchal traditions which subjugate Arab women. Struggling to save an entire history from oblivion, Ghabesh resurrects Andalusian myth linking the miserable end of al-Mutamed, king of Seville, with the potential destiny of contemporary Arab rulers engaged in Arab-Arab conflicts and guided by a masculine mentality which breeds policies of oppression leading to recurrent defeats. In other words, Ghabesh courageously interrupts contemporary patriarchal practices which confiscate female freedom disseminating her attitudes toward current issues of great importance in the social and political arenas.

Due to her enthusiasm for Andalusian history, Ghabesh's poetry borders on exploiting or colonizing Buthayna's narrative to fulfill ideological purposes. In this sense, Ghabesh's modern alternative discourse

becomes a story within a story and a new text is created and perpetuated as the Emirati poet deploys her feminist vision using another woman's narrative. Through her engagement with Buthayna's legend, a woman's voice come to the Emirati poet from remote destination giving her poetry renewed vigor and sparking in the readers an interest in Andalusian history. Entering the text of the Emirati poet in several guises, Buthayna and her story are transformed into significant indicators and signifiers at the disposal of Ghabesh's poetic neologism and creativity. Functioning ultimately as a guarantee of Ghabesh's own voice, the story of Buthayna is reproduced in intellectual and political terms to deal with local and contemporary matters. Thus, Ghabesh's experience of reading Andalusian literature becomes 'a catalyst', to use T.S. Eliot's term, prompting the Emirati poet to compose her own anthology in all its revolutionary and feminist implications and in its provocative and subversive treatment of a male-oriented tradition. In order to awaken the Arab people from "the long sleep of history", to use the words of Ali Ahmad Said (Adonis), she created an anguished portrayal of a nation on the verge of catastrophe. In this context, *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin*? becomes an appeal or a call for social and political reform in an era of desolation and collapse.

Works Cited

Bakhtin, Mikhael. *The Dialogic Imagination: Four Essays*, ed. Michael Holquist, tr. Caryl Emerson and Michael Holquist. Austin, Texas: Texas University Press, 1981.

Barthes, Roland. *Image, Music, Text,* tr. Stephen Heath. London: Fontana, 1977.

Bloom, Harold. *A Map of Misreading.* Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1975.

Castillo, Debra A. *Talking Back: Toward a Latin American Feminist Literary Criticism.* Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1992.

Clayton, Jay and Eric Rothstein, ed. *Influence and Intertextuality in Literary History*. Madison: The University of Wisconsin Press, 1991.

Culler, Jonathan. *The Pursuit of Signs: Semiotics, Literature, Deconstruction*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1981.

Eliot, T.S. "The Function of Criticism", in *Twentieth Century Literary Criticism*, ed. David Lodge. London: Longman, 1972. PP. 77-84.

_____. "Tradition and Individual Talent", in *Twentieth Century Literary Criticism*, ed. David Lodge. London: Longman, 1972. PP. 71-77.

Ghabesh, Saleha. *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin? / Who Will Secure a Safe Haven for Buthayn?* Sharijah, UAE: Culture and Media Department Press, 2002.

Guillen, Claudio. *The Challenge of Comparative Literature*, tr. Cola Franzen. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1993.

Ricour, Paul. *Hermeneutics and the Human Sciences: Essays on Language, Action and Interpretation*, ed. J.B. Thomson. London: Cambridge University Press, 1981.

Notes

[1] All translations from Arabic sources including *Beman Ya Buthayn Taluthin ?* are done by the author of the article.

[2] Historically there are controversial arguments which consider the Arabic language as anti-feminist and masculine.

[3] While the poet appreciates al-Mutamed's treatment of his daughter's marriage issue ,she criticizes his policies which participate in the fall of his kingdom in Andalusia.

[4] It is relevant to argue that the term "feminine" in Ghabesh's anthology does not always imply a biological determinism but it transcends it.

[5] For further details see Helen Cixous . *Coming to Writing and Other Essays* , ed. Deborah Jenson , tr. Sarah Cornell, Debora Jenson , Anne Liddle, Susan Sellers. Cambridge : Harvard University Press, 1991.

Al-Awda: the Theme of Return in Contemporary Arabic Literature: a Case-Study of Samira 'Azam.

By Nejmeh Khalil-Habib

The Palestinian Question and its political and cultural consequences concern intellectuals, politicians and creative writers all over the Arab world, both in surrounding and faraway countries. This makes the Palestinian cause a prominent theme in contemporary Arabic literature.

Although many previous studies have focused on issues related to the Palestinian experience, discussing such themes as heroism, humanism, woman's role in the conflict, the uprising ("Al-Intifada") or the peace process, no previous study has dealt with the important and recurring theme of the "Return" (Al-Awada). My aim in this paper is to show how Arabic fiction has dealt with this national experience, how it depicted those who live the dream of "Return" and those who physically returned to Palestine either after the 1967 war or after the Oslo Accords.

The concept of "Return" throughout this literature manifests itself in various ways including the spiritual return (as manifested in dreams and aspirations); the literal, physical return; an individual's return (a "Return" on the basis of family reunions); the "Return" as a result of the occupation of Gaza and the West Bank after the war of 1967; and the "Return" as a result of the peace process after the "Oslo Accords." I have limited myself in this paper to the study of the pattern of return in Samira Azzams short stories, hoping to shed some light on this neglected motif in Arab literature.

Whether exile happens voluntarily or under oppressive circumstances, the dream of returning home stays alive in the mind of the exiled person. It flares or fades from person to person and from one circumstance to another; however, the concept of "return" ceases to be about its basic meaning, but comes to be seen as a means of resistance and challenging oppression. Throughout the centuries we have seen many literary works reflect the theme of Return; Odysseus fought and challenged gods for the sake of returning back home. He had chosen homeland over the glory of the divine. In his poem "The Return of Soddom" Khalil Hawi criticises traditions and backward social values, by depicting the returning character of Soddom as raising the city to the ground using the fire that burns and purifies that he begat at the mountain of vision.

Adonis in his poem "Falcon Transformations" uses the motif or Return by telling the story of the Falcon who returns from exile to Damascus and who then transforms into a god capable of granting life and spreading wisdom and knowledge.. We also see many exile and return stories in the religious rhetoric of yearning for the promised land that was employed to serve the establishment of the Israeli state.

To first and second generation diaspora Palestinians the dream of "Return" (Al-Awda) is deeply implanted in their collective memory. It is rooted in the Palestinian conscience like a faith that could not be denied, because denying it would mean uprooting the lynchpin upon which modern Palestinian history and identity depends. As Fawaz Turky asserts, the right and dream of Return is the rock upon which our nation was established and the social balance that unites the nation in this wretched world.[1] With this dream in mind refugees in camps were capable of resisting all the allure of merging and domestication and keep seeing their situation as temporary. In the West where most of Palestinians are naturalized, they are still in connection with their people in other exiles, and they still celebrate their national holidays. For many of those who did not emigrate and became Israeli citizens many continue to refer to the counties and places by the names they had prior to Israeli colonisation.. Even after the Oslo Accords, where Palestinians agreed to recognize Israel, many continued to feel that the whole country was theirs and that their agreement came from a perception that Palestine is the mother of the child (Israel). Danny Rubenstein, an Israeli writer, expressed his amazement towards the insistence of the Palestinians to stay attached to their long erased homes, and how that the country to them is not just Palestine but the exact village from whence each came (not any other village, even if it were to be only two kilometres away). In relation to this strong attachment he observed that "Every people in the world live in a place, except Palestinians, the place lives in them."[2]

Concept of "Return" in Samira 'Azzam literature …

To start with, Samira 'Azzam was born in Akka 1926 to a middle class family. She began writing at an early age under the pen name Fatat Al-Sahel. She worked as a senior teacher in Akka before Al-Naqba. In exile she worked as a broadcaster, translator and an editor in Iraq, Lebanon and Cyprus. In 1959 she was deported from Iraq and settled in Beirut for the rest of her short life. She played an influential role in the Palestenian political movement. In the sixties, Azzam together with Shafiq el- Hout established secret cells known as Jabhat Tahrir Falastine Tariq al-Awda (Palestinian Liberation Front, Road to Return) at a time when it was extremely dangerous to work in Palestinian politics. She died of a coronary arrest a few weeks after the Arab Israeli war in 1967. She died in her car, on her way to Jordon to readapt the cells of her organization which were confused and distraught after the swift Arab defeat in the '67 war. Those who know Samira well (the speaker is one of them), know that she didn't die of illness, but of the heavy burden that the June war left in her soul.

Samira 'Azzam left behind her five collections of short stories:

- *Tiny Matters* **"اشياء صغيرة"**(1954)

- *The Great Shadow* "الظل الكبير"   (1956)

- *... And Other Stories* "... وقصص أخرى"   (1960)

- *Time and Man* "الساعة والانسان"   (1963)

- *Joy Comes from the West Window* "العيد من النافذة العربية"   (1971)

In addition to several other short stories which had appeared independently of her anthologies in reputable Arabic magazines

Though few researchers have written about Samira Azzam, two distinct disciplines of interpretation of her work have appeared. The first sees Azzam as a purely Palestinian revolutionary writer; her writing in its entirety revolved around, was informed and inspired by the people around her and their common as well as their individual tragedies. The others saw that Azzam was incapable of feeling and expressing the suffering of Palestinian refugees because she was not living under economic constraints. She was an editor and a broadcaster in The Middle East radio station and as such she was perceived to be living an easy life and her concerns were seen as feminist and hence marginal to the Palestinian struggle.

Azzam's literature is never more riddled with bitterness and disappointment than in her early writing. Since the Palestinian problem in its greater part is a humanitarian tragedy we can easily detect the effect of real events on Azzam's literature as she draws on the struggle for survival in both the real and literary worlds. Nevertheless, Azzam's literature was never uniformly melancholy and despairing, for in the later years, a new spirit was beginning to emerge in her work, derived from the passion and hope instilled in her throughout the sixties, due to the emergence of an organized Palestinian liberation movement

In her last collection of short stories "*Al-Id min Al- Nafitha Al-Gharbiah*"[3] *Joy Comes From the Western Window*" 'Azzam chose to write about "The Return." Al-Awda in 26 short texts named "Wijdaniyat Falastiniah" "Palestinian compassions". In these texts she literarily documented the geographical and social map of Palestine: the spring with its blossoming orange trees, the olive season, the old traditional mosque, the church, the Easter candles, the daily life of people in the city, the symbolic key of return, the gate of Mandelbum, the swallows nests, the religious and social carnivals and others. All these textual landmarks are clearly related to the motif of Al-Awda, from the Olive trees to the Orange groves, the keys that symbolise the return to the lost homes and movement of people in the city all of these relate to a memory of social life that has been lost and that the Palestinian imagination seeks to preserve if not one day restore. Most of her stories in this collection end in a direct statement inciting the reader to undertake the endeavour of returning, or simply to prophesy its occurrence.

In contrast to what we experience in earlier writings, the ideology in her latter works is clear and self evident. Azzam may have realised the need for politically oriented literature after she attended a conference on the 15th of May 1965, organized by Palestinians intellectuals and activists in exile and which discussed

the Palestinian cause and strategies for "Return". 'Azzam was among the 2400 members who attended the conference and she was elected to be a representative of Palestinian women.

Away from the direct sentence that ends most of the texts, the texts are prolific, eloquent and fervent.

In the first text Palestine is recalled in a poetic style that inspires colours, motion and fragrance. It seeks to create in the reader the astonishment and the thrill which is inevitable in a good piece of poetry:

"You ask me how it was (our spring). And I say as it wasn't in any other place….our spring comes to you carried on clouds of orange fragrance, white flints (buds) respire around the orchards…its fragrance penetrates to you through the sills of the windows, as if you are sleeping on a pillow of perfume…necklaces over the necks of girls and bracelets around their arms…. Don't ask me how it was our spring but ask me which spring is comparable to ours…."

"تسألني كيف كان (ربيعنا) فأقول مثل ما لا يكون ربيع في مكان...ربيعنا يأتيك محمولاً على غمامات من أرج البرتقال، قداح أبيض يتنفس في حنايا البيارات. . .يتسرب اليك عطره من خصائص النوافذ فكأنك تنام على مخدة من أرج. . .عقود حول أعناق الصبايا، اساور حول زنودهن. . .لا تسلني كيف كان ربيعنا، بل سلني أي ربيع يطاول ربيع البرتقال"

(93)

The text continues in spontaneous flows of passion then moves to depict the rituals of the orange season: hands give to boxes, boxes carried to boats, hands give, hands take. It could be trade but with the involvement of oranges it becomes recreation for eye, heart and pocket. The text ends propagating the "Return": "and for he who asks about our spring which was, and the spring that will be, the spring will return to the orchard and the orchard will return as summary of the seasons' produce."

In the texted titled with number three we read a description of Akka and its historical mosque. A father proud of his city tells his son about the mosque and the stolen bowl of one of its basins. The narrator then becomes a grandfather and he tells his grandson the story of the lost bowl which was smuggled by one of Napoleon's soldiers. When the boy reacted towards the story by saying "I will smuggle and take another bowl," the grandfather corrected him saying: "you don't smuggle, you have the right and who owns the right doesn't smuggle. No my son…but you must enter it with your companions by force….The country is yours and the water spring is for you and your mates to drink from its fresh water. So if you drink the healthy water, go and search for the basin which has no bowl and remember that I had told you a story that was worth telling"

يقول الاب وهو يمسح على رأس الصغير: "لا يا ابني . . .بل تدخلها ورفاقك عنوة. . .فالبلدة بلدتك والسبيل لك ولإخوانك ترتوون من نداوة مائه فإذا شربت ماء العافية، فابحث عن الحوض ذي الطاسة الناقصة وتذكر انني حكيت لك حكاية تستحق ان تروى، وأن تستعاد. ."

(98)

In the twelfth text we read through a picture hanged on the wall a description for a coastal city which implies Akka (the writer's city): "His city from its eastern gate….the sweetest of cities when it had the originality of history and before the echo broke over its gate which is decorated with iron nails. The shore stretches with its white sands and parallel to it a black iron vein connects his city with neighbouring countries. Then the gate and behind it the roofed khan (open market) and on both sides stand the shops and the salesmen endeavouring to sell their products. And the market crowded by sellers and buyers together with their pack animals…their voices continue to murmur until this moment in his ears, from over the eastern gate, from over the stretched wall where the waves of history broke. There stands high Al-Jazzar minaret and smaller minarets and the tower of the church with the clock in the middle.

This photo stands as a substitute to the homeland. Its owner uses it to teach his children all the meanings that exile "ghurba" had hidden. The owner wanted it like a mascot "t'aweetha" to prevent his children from forgetting their country. His guest wanted it to act as a miniature homeland. Through it he sees his past illuminated. He wants to possess it, but the owner refuses to give it away. He hanged it in the tent, and after he had got a house he hanged it in the house.

"I will not sell it for the money of the earth …(he said)…but I will give it to you as a present when we get back the land"

"when the land returns to us …when everything moves in the picture and the dye transforms into real matter and the cells of the hunt…when miracle pours its spirit in the earth and the stones, and when the blood of his people passes in the veins of the trees and earn their meaning and humanity from the spark of truth not from fake dresses….

"لا ابيعها بمال الارض (قال). . . بل أهديكها حين تعود لنا الارض ..
"حين تعود لنا الارض. . حين تتحرك كل الاشياء في الصورة ويتحول الصباغ الى مادة حقيقية وخلايا صيد. . وتصب المعجزة روحها
في الارض والحجر والشجر فتجري في شرايينها جميعاً دماء شعبه وتكتسب معناها وانسانيتها من ألق الحقيقة لا من ثوب الزيف. ."

(113)

Azzam uses symbolism and through it gives a human face to the Palestinian struggle and introduces her idea of the Return in innovative and figurative language that does not sacrifice the aesthetic for the sake of the political which is the main requirement of a successful short story.

We see in the fourth text that the tree feels what humans feel. The tree knows its real owner and refuses the stranger. She was stripped of her leaves when she could no longer see the children playing under her branches. She also refused to die. She stayed in an autumn state all around the circle of time. And when she was asked why she never flourished or died as is the case with normal trees, she said: "I pledged not to make a promise but for their eyes, those who were distanced by the will of time. I pledged not to feed but the hand which one day, had given me my life."

أقسمت إلا ينعقد وعدي إلا لعيونهم، هؤلاء الذين باعدت بيني وبينهم ايام، فما أطعم إلا اليد التي جعلتني يوماً موصولة بأسباب الحياة. .
‟

(99)

But the promise came when the resistance intensified and the tree started to come back to life as if it was saying: "They will return, and I will be again a tree, and I will return as a tree possessing all the blessings of trees in the garden—the spring."

‟سيعودون، وسأعود شجرة لها كرامات الشجر في الحديقة الربيع‟

(99)

The story in the two texts 5 & 6 symbolize the three stages that the Palestinian cause passed through. They interpret the writer's political thoughts. The fisherman who was struck by waves and storms and thrown helpless on a faraway shore like dead sea birds, is a symbol of the Palestinian who emigrated from his/her country humble and humiliated. And he who recovered from his coma and fixed his drag-net and waited till the storm stopped, is the symbol of the Palestinians who started to organize themselves in political groups and work to revolutionize their Arabic surrounding in order to start a revolution and prove to the world that they are sincere and defiant. The wife and the children who await the return of the fisherman from his struggle symbolise the refugees who are waiting for a Palestinian resistance movement that can return Palestine to them. Such a movement will cast the crows out and bring them closer to fulfilling the promise of Return: "move these hovering crows away. The promise of return will come on a white wing… Will return, the fisherman will return. The wife and the children say: "Will return our man will return…." The shore says while drinking the swaying waves: "will return the fisherman will return… "because there are hearts on the shore and a boat connected with love to the shore knows well that the trip of water is ebb and flow. Ebb and flow, and with the flow the fisherman will come back and the shore will be happy and the wife and the children will be happy…"

التي ستعيد لهم فلسطينهم فتبعد الغربان وتأتيهم بالبشارة: ‟ابعدوا هذه الغربان المحومة. . فبشرى الاوبة ستأتي على جناح أبيض، سيعود الصياد سيعود. . تقول الزوجة والاولاد سيعود رجلنا سيعود. . يقول الشاطئ وهو يشرب الموج المترنح، سيعود الصياد سيعود. . لأن قلوباً على الشاطئ، وزورقاً متصل الشوق بالشاطئ يعلم جيداً ان رحلة المياه جزر ومد، جزر ومد، ومع المد سيعود الصياد ويفرح الشاطئ وتفرح الزوجة والاطفال.‟

(103)

Social life is depicted in many of her stories: one of these recalls a Christian Palestinian ritual where Muslims contribute in its ceremony: "Easter was the feast for everyone الكل and the blessings of the church mediator شفيع fell like morning dew over both Muslims and Christians."

The memory raises through recalling an old house near the church contains candles hanged in different

sizes decorated with gold-water and prepared for the children to carry them on Palm- Sunday. The poetic scenery broke out when the owner of that house moaned over the one thousand candles that she left behind after she had prepared them to be carried that Easter. But Al-Naqba happened and left the city without celebration or celebrators. When she was asked if she still thinking that her one thousand candles still waiting her return, she said that she is ready to do new ones and give them for free for prayers. The text ends in a reporting sentence assuring that the time of moaning and weeping has ended and the time of action, which will bring about 'The Return Al-'Awda" has started: "Wipe your tear my brother, it is of no value…before you is a country waiting. . .tears will not bring it back and words do not help even when they are sincere and beautiful. Palestine is yearning for your endeavour, for your struggle and your faith, Palestine yearns for your sacrifice and your giving . . . so work for her"

"امسح هذه الدمعة يا أخي فهي لم تعد تفيد. . . إن امامك بلداً ينتظرك. . الدموع لن تعيده والكلام لا يفيده لو انه احياناً صادق وجميل. فلسطين تحن الى عملك الى جهدك الى كفاحك وإيمانك، فلسطين تحن الى بَذْلِكَ وعطائك. . .فاعمل من أجلها."

(96)

Similarly to this, another story depicts big processions from all neighbouring villages and cities to visit Jerusalem Al-Quds in order to visit the tomb of the prophet Moses, regardless of their religion: "With the beginning of the Spring. When earth finishes off a new labour. . . and every inch of it is red by windflower. . . Our people used to celebrate the visit to Prophet Moses in processions whose beginnings you could see, but whose eds seemed to go on forever."

مع بواكير الربيع. . حين تنتهي الارض من مخاض جديد. . فإذا كل شبر فيها أحمر بالشقائق. . كان قومنا يحتفلون بزيارة قبر النبي موسى في مواكب ترى اولها ولا ترى آخرها. .

Samira Azzam recurrently wrote about the theme of Return, Al-Awda, without falling into repetition in spite of dealing with a limited subject. Even though she was dragged into romanticism due to the requirements of the subject such as yearning and nostalgic feelings, her romanticism was of that kind which did not venture deeply into experimentalism and alienation. It was a Romanticism which was deeply connected to reality. Despite the pressure of the ideological, the texts continued to reflect an aesthetic value that did not degenerate into poor language or exaggerated melodrama. Instead, Azzam employed powerful narrative techniques and rhetorical strategies such as symbolism, humanitarianism and common folktales, الحكاية الشعبية where language is not only a conveyer of literal meaning but is also a living beautiful being.

These texts were loyal to their collective title. In them the writer revealed her own thoughts and reflections as well as the collective Palestinian consciousness in relation to Palestine. She revealed both a summary of old memories and feelings of a pre- Nakba Palestine as well as collective hopes and dreams experienced in her day. Her stories were loyal to their historical condition, revealing an era which saw the dawn of Palestinian resistance where the need to concentrate all energies (including creative writings) to revolutionize the Palestinian condition and energize it with the hope of Return was both urgent and imminent. If her writings from this collection appear optimistic and incommensurate with today's reality, that is

because at the time of their writing the Palestinian plight had not yet experienced the bitter circumstances that depressed expectations such as the defeat of '67 war or the Israeli invasion of Beirut in 1982, or the reflections of the gulf war of 1991 or repercussions that followed the incidents of September 11, 2001.

Notes

[1] Turki, Fawaz. *Exile's Return: The Making of the Palestinian American*, New York: Free Press, Toronto: Maxwell Macmillan, Canada, New York: Maxwell Macmillan International, 1994, p: 33)

[2] Danny Rubenstein. *The People of Nowhere: The Palestinian Vision of Home*, translated by Ina Friedman, New York ,Times Books, 1991, p: 7, 90 and 120

[3] Samira 'Azam, *Al-Id min Al- Nafitha Al-Gharbiah, 2nd edition, Beirut, Dar-Alawda, 1982*

Maps in Michael Ondaatje's
The English Patient.

By Ahmad M.S. Abu Baker

> The ends of the earth are never the points on a map that colonists push against, enlarging their sphere of influence. On one side servants and slaves and tides of power and correspondence with the Geographical Society. On the other the first step by a white man across a great river, the first sight (by a white eye) of a mountain that has been there forever. (p.141)

Introduction

The English Patient is a novel which richly encapsulates the past within its folds. The novel refers to Almásy's book of Herodotus *The Histories* which, the narrator notes, is "twice its original thickness" (pp.94-95). Almásy "added to [it], cutting and gluing in pages from other books or writing in his own observations—so they all are cradled within the text of Herodotus" (p.16). It was "his commonplace book" which contained "other fragments— maps, diary entries, writings in many languages, paragraphs cut out of other books" (p.96). Ondaatje's novel is similar in its structure to Almásy's book. He takes "fragments" and "paragraphs cut out of other books" and includes them in his novel. The novel is so rich with intertextuality including references to portraits, statues, myths, Christian imagery, and desert images. Ondaatje's novel is swollen with these different images just like Almásy's common place book is swollen to twice its original thickness.

In one scene, Hana fixes the steps in a staircase in the villa. "The staircase had lost its lower steps during the fire that was set before the soldiers left." She brought "twenty books and nailed them to the floor and then onto each other, in this way rebuilding the two lowest steps" (p.13). Hana's use of the books to fix the stairs parallels the readers' and critics' attempt to "nail" all the different books and images Ondaatje refers to in his novel to reach, as if climbing a staircase, into the 'room' where knowledge is stored. Ondaatje leaves clues to the thematic importance of some references to help his readers dig, like archaeologists, into the history of this reference or that. For instance, while the book of *Kim* lay on Hana's lap, "she realized that … she had been looking at the porosity of the paper, the *crease* at the corner of page 17 which *someone has folded as a mark*"(p.7, my italics). The importance of this book is revealed later, upon the arrival of Kip.

In *The English Patient* the emphasis on the importance of maps is evident. People, books, faith, and works of art are all reduced to maps, to their skeletal structure. This reduction is a form of deconstruction similar to the deconstruction of bombs in the novel. Almásy is considered a traitor for giving the Germans the desert maps. His 'treason' justifies the novel's preoccupation with maps. The gravity of his 'crime' is evident in the following analysis which highlights the importance of maps.

Maps, Colonization, and Identity

Maps, as a form of knowledge, give power to those who have them. Almásy claims that his ability to draw maps motivated the Bedouins to save him. He explains that "[t]he bedouin were keeping me alive for a reason. I was useful, you see …. I am a man who can recognize an unnamed town by its skeletal shape on a map" (p.18). The Bedouins try to make use of Almásy's vast reservoir of information. "For some he draws maps that go beyond their own boundaries and for other tribes too he explains the mechanics of guns" (p.22). Almásy claims that he has "information like a sea" in him, and that he "knew maps of the sea floor, *maps that depict weaknesses in the shield of the earth*, charts painted on skin that contain the various routes of the Crusades" (p.18, my italics). These maps have the power of great destruction since they depict "weaknesses in the shield of earth". These "weaknesses" would be exploited to create a destructive earthquake or to erupt a volcano in the enemy's land.

Heble observes Ondaatje based his character of Almásy on that of a real person. "Almásy's slippery identity, [is] an analogue to the 'English' patient's in the novel" (Tötösy, p.145). Tötösy argues that "Almásy's fictional position, that is, his indeterminacy, overlaps his 'real' position of historical marginality and otherness" (Tötösy, p.148). Almásy's knowledge of maps is his 'compass'. He only needs "the name of a small bridge, a local custom, a cell of this historical animal, and the map of the world would slide into place" (p.19). He boasts, "[g]ive me a map and I'll build you a city. Give me a pencil and I will draw you a room in South Cairo, desert charts on the wall" (p.145). Indeed, maps give him great navigational abilities. Hence, he relies on maps, even ancient ones, while crossing the desert (p.167). David Roxborough points out that when "[c]onsidering the theme of mapmaking and orientation in the novel, Isaiah 40:3 is especially relevant: 'The voice of him that crieth in the wilderness, Prepare ye the way of the Lord, make straight in the desert a highway for our God'" (Roxborough 1999).

Almásy's knowledge made him a very dangerous traitor when he joined the Germans. His vast knowledge worried the Allies. Foucault explains that "power and knowledge directly imply one another … there is no power relation without the correlative constitution of a field of knowledge, nor any knowledge that does not presuppose and constitute at the same time power relations" (Foucault 1977:27). Caravaggio claims that Almásy "knew every water hole and had helped map the Sand Sea. He knew all about the desert. He knew all about dialects". The Germans relied on Almásy's knowledge in 1941. Almásy "became a guide for spies, taking them across the desert into Cairo" (p.163). His knowledge of the desert, especially of the location of water holes, means life or death to those who want to cross it. His knowledge of the dialects

guaranteed a safe cover for the spies among the Bedouins.

Almásy and other explorers give lectures at the Geographical Society in London about their expeditions. These explorations are supposedly conducted for scientific purposes. However, they are performed for military and colonial purposes. The introduction of longitude and latitude lines reduced Earth to "measured boxes". According to Anderson, explorers, surveyors and soldiers have the task of "filling in" these boxes, a matter which generates an "alignment of map and power" (Anderson 1991:173). Simpson considers mapmaking as a type of "the imperial arts, where by territory, property, empire are imagined, inscribed, maintained" (Simpson 1994:225). Further, maps are an exclusive discourse, a "paradigm which both administrative and military operations worked within and served" (Anderson 1991:173-74). "One names the land in order to obtain a certain control over it through the framing operation of language" (Penner 2000). Hence, mapmaking suggests a future military invasion of a geographical area that is being mapped to facilitate the movement of the invading troops and to highlight the strategic points of defence/attack for these troops. Consequently, Almásy wonders, "[t]his country—had I charted it and turned it into a place of war?" (p.260).

The colonisers constantly gather information about the geography of the land and the characteristics of the people who live in it. This knowledge guarantees the 'smooth' dominance of the coloniser, and it functions to alienate the colonised in their own country by changing its geographical and even ecological identity. Edward W. Said warns that "[i]mperialism after all is an act of geographical violence through which virtually every space in the world is explored, charted, and finally brought under control." He notes that for "the native, the history of his or her colonial servitude is inaugurated by the loss to an outsider of the local place, whose concrete geographical identity must thereafter be searched for and somehow restored (Eagleton *et al.* 1990:77).

Almásy uses an 1890 edition of Herodotus' *Histories* as a "commonplace book" in which he keeps "other fragments—maps, diary entries, writings in many languages, paragraphs cut out of other books" (p.96). This book is his "only connection with the world of cities". It is "his guidebook, ancient and modern, of supposed lies" (p.246). Herodotus's *Histories* "becomes the metaphoric bridge across time and space that replaces simple historicist conceptions of time" (Walder 1998:203-4). Simpson claims that the "marvelous discourse generating the *History* serves to bridge the explicitly colonial divide of metropoly and periphery, and to gloss problems of truth and falsehood in ways that only intensify the difficulty of distinguishing one from another" (Simpson 1994:222). According to Stephen Batchelor, the origin of the enmity between East and West is found in *Herodotus* and is due to "the epic conflict between Hellenes and Persians, giving rise to the mythical contrast between heroic, liberty, loving and dynamic west and the despotic, stagnant and passive East" (Clarke 1997:4). Clarke's claim renders *Herodotus* a focal point, a 'centre', or a vortex in which all history, especially that of East and West, is condensed. It also invokes the colonial crusades, which are depicted on maps that reveal "the various routes of the Crusades" (p.18). Further, it invokes wars as old as those of Hellenes and Persians which are fought for imperial reasons. The book itself is a proof that history repeats itself, and that the present is an echo of the past.

Almásy and other explorers use literary legends and Herodotus' *Histories* to explore reality. Almásy imagines that "he had walked under the millimetre of haze just above the inked fibres of a map, that pure zone between distances and legend between nature and storyteller. Sandford called it geomorphology" (p.246). The use of an ancient book of history in these explorations testifies to the strength of knowledge that outlives its own time. Herodotus' book remains, according to Almásy, useful even in modern times not just for scholarly study but for colonial exploration and exploitation of the natural resources of other countries. The explorers of the desert are "men of all nations". They are described as "sunburned, exhausted men, who, like Conrad's sailors, are not too comfortable with the etiquette of taxis, the quick, flat wit of bus conductors". They "cling" to their old maps and lecture notes (p.133). Further, they have entered into their own heart of darkness by going to the desert. Their experiences in the desert makes them, like Conrad's Marlowe, wise, sad, and uncomfortable with the city way of life.

The desert erases people's identities. Almásy loses his white skin, a race marker, when he falls into the desert. "All pilots who fall into the desert—none of them come back with identification" (pp.28-29). To other Europeans, he resembles one of the "mad desert prophets" (p.251). Katharine, too, loses her race marker (her blue eyes) when she dies in the desert. "Only the eye blue removed, made *anonymous*, a *naked map where nothing is depicted*" (p.261, my italics). The desert strips them of any form of identification. It makes them like its own nature, without defining contours and without race markers. Tom Penner remarks that a "desire for erasure is present throughout the English patient's narrative" (Penner 2000). Simpson suggests that "[i]dentity, nationality, and acts themselves all provide an occasion for torture, for a rewriting of the body by way of pain" (Simpson 1994:230). Hence, Caravaggio's body was "rewritten" after the discovery of his identity by cutting off his thumbs. Caravaggio "had been trained to invent double agents or phantoms who would take on flesh" (p.117). Therefore, he is trying to "invent" a skin for the English patient. The "desire for erasure" foreshadows the ultimate erasure, that of the nuclear bombing of Hiroshima and Nagasaki which is a wiping out of a nation. Simpson notes that "the adumbrations and irradiations of this apocalypse, those shadows seared onto ground, align nuclear 'photography' as a killing inscription with imperial, racist methods of repression and erasure" (Simpson, p.230). Further, David Williams claims that Almásy tries to "atone for his earlier mistake in charting the desert, or erasing the past" (Penner 2000).

The characters in the novel live in a desert both metaphorically and/or literally. The metaphorical desert is implied in the reference to Stephen Crane's poem (p.97). All the characters are living in their own metaphorical deserts trying to cope with their traumatic war experiences. The description of the places Kip and his fellow sappers walk through seems to echo that of the desert with its anonymity. "Every river they came to was bridgeless, as if its name had been erased, as if the sky were starless, homes doorless" (p.129). See the introduction for more details on the effects of war on the characters. Almásy, however, experiences both types of deserts. Hall claims that when people search for their identity they "tend to isolate themselves … as if they are running to the desert." They can also "make their homes the deserts they run into". Hall suggests that:

> [T]he desert is thought of as nothingness waiting to become something, if only for a while;

meaninglessness waiting to be given meaning if only a passing one; space without contours, ready to accept any contour offered if only until other contours are offered; space not scarred with past furrows, yet fertile with expectations of sharp blades; virgin land yet to be ploughed and tilled; the land of the perceptual beginning the place-no-place whose name and identity is not-yet." (Hall 1997:3)

Almásy has a desire to return to a 'pure' state like that of the desert in which his 'self' is not marked by nationality, race, and other social frames which limit, label and frame him.

Almásy's love for the desert reveals his wish to live in similar conditions. He states that:

> We die containing a richness of lovers and tribes, tastes we have swallowed, bodies we have plunged into and swum up as if rivers of wisdom, characters we have climbed into as if trees, fears we have hidden in as if caves. I wish for all this to be marked on my body when I am dead. I believe in such cartography—*to be marked by nature, not just to label ourselves on a map* … We are *communal* histories, communal books …. *All I desired was to walk upon such an earth that had no maps*. (p.261, my italics)

It is a strange wish for a mapmaker to live on "an earth that had no maps". The desert reduces people to their common humanity. Its "cartography" is the 'true' form of labelling to Almásy, who is against the racist labelling of others. This "labelling" echoes Madan Sarup's process of labelling which affects the way people think of others (Sarup 1996:14). Rufus Cook notes that "[i]n contrast to Katharine, the English patient regards distinctions of race and class as 'walls' or 'barriers' (155), as a source of distrust and conflict" (Cook 1999:43). The English patient "seems to transcend time, place, and ethnic origin". He becomes "a synonym for absence or anonymity" since "he has no defining substance of his own, no containing or delimiting skin (117)", and this allows him to assume "one new cultural identity after another" (Cook, p.46). Ondaatje constructs "a fictional individual, who is inbetween and peripheral". Tötösy also refers to "Almásy's rejection of homogeneity, national self-referentiality and its exclusionary results" (Tötösy 1994:235). Almásy's opposition to other forms of labelling stems from his realisation that sciences including Anthropology and Ethnology are colonial practices used to legitimise the colonisation of races on the basis of their 'natural' or 'genetic' inferiority.

A map is a form of order, control, and deconstruction. Almásy sees everything in the shape of maps. This could be related to his profession as a mapmaker, but it is also related to the importance of maps. He "rides the boat of morphine. It races in him, imploding time and geography the way maps compress the world onto a two-dimensional sheet of paper" (p.161). Even works of art do not escape being mapped. For instance, the map which shows the path Kim and the lama take in Kipling's *Kim* (p.167). This map helps Almásy control his understanding of *Kim*. Missing something of the plot does not obstruct or limit his understanding because he is "familiar with the map of the story" (pp.94-95). Other references to maps include "the great maps of art" (p.70), "the various maps of fate" (p.272), and "mapped … sadness" (p.270). Rufus Cook notes the "the need to 'map' … some aspect of reality, and thus to identify some

'original pattern' (193) underlying 'the external world of accident and succession'" (Cook 1999:35). He explains that works of art help the characters "define their identities, their purposes, their relationships with others" (Cook, p.36). He adds that "[t]he characters struggle to 'map' or 'choreograph' their environment; they want to understand 'how the pieces fit'". "Outside 'great maps of art' (70) there is no order, no security, nothing that can define or delimit the self, or keep it from slipping away into another time, place, or set of cultural terms" (Cook, p.44).

Maps play an important role in Kip's life. To him, they mean the difference between life and death. He uses them in deconstructing bombs and mines which he reduces to their skeletal shape. They represent an order without which anarchy and "deluge" would follow. After the death of Lord Suffolk, "Kip had suddenly a map of responsibility". Maps give those who have them power—a matter that echoes Foucault's knowledge/power binary. Hence, Kip feels uncomfortable with his newly acquired power because he was "never interested in the choreography of power" (p.194). He is accustomed to being invisible and having such power means becoming visible.

The loss of maps could cause disasters, even Armageddon. The narrator refers to a "deluge" that sweeps away "free will, the desire to be elegant, fame, the right to worship Plato as well as Christ." He also refers to "bonfires—the burning of wigs, books, animal hides, maps" (p.57). This "deluge" sweeps away everything and denies restoring order by destroying maps. Further, following the nuclear bombing of Japan, Kip imagines "the streets of Asia full of fire. It rolls across cities like a burst map" (p.284). Kip tries to rationalise the extreme power of the colonisers. To him, knowledge is what gave them the upper hand. He informs the English patient that "[y]our fragile white island … with customs and manners and books and perfects and reason somehow converted the rest of the world." It is knowledge, especially knowledge of maps, which made the white race stand "for precise behaviour".

The statements which Kip makes about the global effect of the British echo those of Clarke who remarks on the West's "systematic" process of "imposing its religions, its values, and its legal and political systems on Eastern nations" (Clarke 1997:7, my italics). His words also echo Said's who maintains that "a white middle-class Westerner believes it his human prerogative not only to *manage* the nonwhite world but also to *own* it, just because by definition 'it' is *not* quite as human as 'we' are" (Said 1987:108, my italics). Kip's questions highlight and link knowledge and power:

> Was it just ships that gave you such power? Was it, as my brother said, because you had *the histories and printing presses*? … And Indian soldiers wasted their lives as heroes so they could be *pukkah*. You had wars like cricket. How did you fool us into this? (p.283, first two italics mine)

The English "had the histories and printing presses". Hence, they have a power, like that of Almásy, which is a concomitant of knowledge. The colonisers knew the first rule of colonisation: "*know* thy enemy". The need for knowledge justifies the studies in Anthropology and Ethnology for colonial purposes.

The colonisers' possession of the "histories and the printing presses" leads them to regard themselves as "custodian[s] of the values of civilisation and history, [with the mission of] bringing light to the colonised's ignominious darkness" (Memmi 1974:74-6). This "mission" must be carried out regardless of what the colonised races think of it. Most colonisers believe that the colonised do not know what is good for them. Hence, when the colonised resist to adopt the colonisers' values and religion, they are bombarded, as in the "incomprehensible, firing into a continent" in Conrad's *Heart of Darkness* (Kimbrough 1971:14). In Conrad's novel, "thunder and lightning" (Memmi, p.57), which reflect the enlightenment the colonisers supposedly bring to the colonised, are transformed into cannons and fires.

Similarly, in Ondaatje's novel they are transformed into the nuclear bombing of Japan. Said explains that "[a]pparently benign Orientalising ethnocentrism becomes bloody, repressive ethnocentrism, violent positing action of 'the West' which works to assert its plenitude through caricature, suppression, or *obliteration* of the other" (Said 1978:180-2, my italics). Imperialism and capitalism also necessitate finding new markets and guarding them militarily. The colonised races are the consumers of these new markets, and they have to be guarded from competitors by all means. The nuclear bombing of Japan invokes Said who maintains that Europe's "role in the non-European world was to rule, instruct, legislate, develop, and at the proper times, to discipline, war against, and occasionally *exterminate* non-Europeans" (Eagleton *et al.* 1990:72, my italics).

Further, Kip's questions suggest that history is written by the strong. Historians can/have depict(ed) the colonised races negatively. The power of the printing presses helps them promote the stereotypes and myths the colonisers generate about the subject races. It also helps them promote a discourse aimed at legitimising to the world the inhuman practices colonisation inflicts on the colonised races. In addition, the association between war and "cricket" suggests that the colonisers enjoy these wars as if they are games. It also implies the frequency of these wars. In both cases, the value of the life of the colonised races is undermined substantially. Kip's words demonstrate to what lengths the colonised might go, sacrificing their life for the colonisers in the hope of being admitted into their camp.

In *The English Patient* all wars prove to be the same. Ondaatje links the Medieval wars with those fought in Italy in 1943-44. The same towns "had been battled over since the eighth century", and "if you dug deep beneath the tank ruts, you found bloodaxe and spear" (p.69). To Ondaatje, past events remain 'alive', and history repeats itself. The idea of modern wars being similar to past ones is echoed in Field Marshal Kesselring's idea of "pouring hot oil from battlements" (p.69). The expertise of Medieval scholars is also used though they "kept forgetting the invention of the airplane" (p.69). Further, the references to "the stone pulpit where Hercules slays the Hydra" and to "the Tree of Good and Evil inserted into the mouth of the dead Adam" convey the effect that modern war fair are echoes of past events.

Furthermore, the English patient tells the interrogators that "the Germans have barracked themselves into villas and convents and they are brilliantly defended. It's an old story—the Crusaders made the same mistake against the Saracens. And like them you now need the fortress towns" (p.96). J. Hillis Miller describes the novel as a "pattern of eddying repetition", and Rufus Cook maintains that it is "constantly

reduplicating some incident from an earlier page" (Miller 39 in Cook 1999). Hence, "meaning or being or identity is always deferred or displaced" (Cook 1999:37). In addition, Cook explains that "[b]y breaking through this 'time-defeating' narrative mode of experience, the English patient escapes the constrictions of a phenomenal existence. He can then immerse himself in the atemporal, archetypal world of Homer, Herodotus, and Kipling, and in the non-sequential, ceremonial time of Bedouin ritual and myth" (Cook, p.48) Brian Johnson suggests that "Ondaatje sees the past under the surface of things", and that his "fiction deciphers identity and bleeds through borders." Johnson also claims that Ondaatje "writes with the compassion of a literary peacekeeper, exploring the aftermath of violence in narratives that telescope back through time" (Johnson 2000). *The English Patient* presents the reader with the danger of colonial sciences, such as mapmaking, and the concomitant power they give to the colonisers. After all, were it not for the importance of maps, Almásy would not be labelled as a 'traitor'.

Conclusion

Ondaatje introduces the Indian Kip as a revolutionary version of Kipling's Kim. Like Kim, Kip begins as a devoted colonised who serves the British Empire. Kim remains the devoted servant of the empire and works against his own people, whereas Kip rebels against it after the nuclear bombing of Japan and casts away his 'colonised shell'. He evolves from the 'cocoon' of colonisation and flies away like a 'butterfly', back into the country he was born in. Ondaatje depicts the racism which Kip was subjected to and allows his reader to view the 'Other' point of view, unlike Rudyard Kipling, for instance, who does not touch upon such issues. Indeed, in the final analysis, Almásy's 'crime' of giving the Nazis the maps of the desert is not so grave. The Nazis are abhorred for their racism, but what they did is very small when compared to the scale of what the Allies' nuclear bombs did to the 'brown' races. Kip and Caravaggio believe that such a bomb would not have been dropped on a white nation. The bombing becomes an embodiment of imperial racism, which is much stronger than that of the Nazis.

Almásy's stay with the Bedouins allows him to 'erase' his identity, his sense of a nation, and he 'sinks' into anonymity. Nationness and nationality are tantamount to sins in Ondaatje's work. They are reasons for conflict and for wars, and they stop people from assimilating. Almásy becomes another Kip; he devoted his life to chart the desert for the Royal Society thus turning it into a war field. However, like Kip, he has a turning point. He becomes the English patient who refuses to admit his identity and who wishes to live on a land that has no maps. This image is emphasised by the reference to Caravaggio's painting of David with the head of Goliath. "Youth judging age at the end of its outstretched hand" (p.116). The English patient sees in Kip his former state as a devoted servant of the Empire. He can also see the potentiality of Kip's revolution against the Empire.

The English Patient presents the reader with the danger of colonial sciences, such as mapmaking, and the concomitant power they give to the colonisers. After all, were it not for the importance of maps, Almásy would not be labelled as a 'traitor'. The novel concludes with Kip learning that it does not matter how

close one gets to the colonisers, for one remains treated as an outsider/'Other'. Kip resembles Turkey to a certain degree, which has been trying to be admitted into the European Union for so many years now but its request is still denied. The novel leaves us to "swallow [our] history lesson" (p.285). Eventually, in Ondaatje's novel "all that remains is a capsule from the past" (p.33).

Works Cited

Clarke, J. J. *Oriental Enlightenment- The Encounter Between Asian and Western Thought*. London: Routledge, 1997.

Cook, Rufus. "Being and Representation in Michael Ondaatje's *The English Patient*." *ARIEL: A Review of International English Literature* Vol. 30, No. 4. October 1999.

Eagleton, Terry, Fredric Jameson, Edward Said. *Nationalism, Colonialism, and Literature*. Intro. Seamus Deane. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1990.

Foucault, M. *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. London: Tavistock, 1977.

Hall, Stuart, and Paul du Gay (eds.) *Questions of Cultural Identity*. London: Sage Publications Ltd.1997.

Johnson, Brian D. "Michael Ondaatje." *Mclean's*, Internet Explorer Vol 113, Issue 51 (pp.66-67), Dec 18, 2000.

Memmi, Albert. *The Colonizer and The Colonized*. 1965. rpt. London: Souvenir Press, 1974.

Ondaatje, Michael. *The English Patient*. London: Picador, 1993.

Penner, Tom. "Foucault, Ondaatje, and the 'Eternally Dying' Author in *The English Patient." Print Media Foreign-Title: Literature canadienne*, Internet Explorer Issue 165 (pp.78-93), Summer 2000.

Said, Edward. *Orientalism.* London: Penguin, 1987.

Simpson, D. Mark. "Minefield Readings: The postcolonial *English Patient*." *ECW: Essays on Canadian Writing* Issue 53, Summer, 1994.

Walder, Dennis. *Post-colonial Literatures in English -History, Language, Theory*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishers Ltd., 1998.

No Ceremony for Older Women: Some Observations on the 2008 Academy Awards Broadcast.

By Robert Goff

Part 1: Rerunning History

> *...on April 17, (1972) the former movie actor and then governor of California, Ronald Reagan, told reporters that although Chaplin may have been a "genius" filmmaker, American officials acted correctly in 1952 when they revoked his reentry permit.[1]*

A feeling of déjà vu came on me as I watched this year's broadcast of the Academy Awards hosted by Jon Stewart. The spectacular opening sequence with its animated special effects ride through downtown Los Angeles reminded me of a similar CGI- dominated opening ride two years ago when, as it happened, Jon Stewart made his first appearance as host. The gargantuan glitzy stage set of the Kodak Theatre seemed unchanged from last year, although the out-of-scale impersonality of contemporary set design has become standard for recent award shows and it is difficult to distinguish among them. Jack Nicholson, with his sunglasses and Cheshire cat grin, was seated yet again in the front row of the Kodak Theater and the camera, as usual, kept cutting to him. As prime time TV had been awash in reruns for the three long months of the writers' strike, I was at first almost convinced that panicked producers of the Academy Awards show, with little time to prepare for this year's event as the strike ended, had decided to run a previous broadcast at the last moment. This year's Academy Awards show, however, turned out not to be a rerun although it continued to seem like one throughout the broadcast. This was partly because it was the eightieth anniversary of the ceremony and the producers' main idea for celebrating this occasion was to bombard the viewer with myriad clips from previous shows, including several very familiar moments from the last few years.

Ellen DeGeneres from last year's broadcast was seen once again vacuuming the front row and Jon Stewart appeared in bed with George Clooney as the dream sequence from the opening of the 2006 ceremony was repeated. Early into the broadcast, George Clooney in person came out to officially commemorate the eightieth anniversary by introducing a montage of edited clips. The montage opened with a newsreel of Shirley Temple from the 1930s and ended with Charlie Chaplin thanking the Academy for his special

Oscar in 1972 but in between came a chaotic assortment of rapidly edited visuals from past ceremonies. If the clips had been more carefully chosen, arranged in a meaningful order, with each "highlight" lasting more than a second or two of screen time, the montage might have prompted some reflection, however superficial, on aspects of the history of the ceremony. Instead, the editing made the montage almost incoherent and the viewer was reduced to passively registering recognition of famous faces as they relentlessly flashed onto the TV screen. It was basically a frenetic slide show with very brief video clips alternating with a series of still photographs of stars accepting awards or several one-second clips freeze-framing into stills. Images of famous stars of the past, such as John Wayne and Katherine Hepburn, were mixed in with shots of contemporary stars, such as Halle Berry and Kevin Spacey, to form a rather meaningless iconography of Hollywood stardom in which the past became interchangeable with the present. Extremely brief clips of big production numbers and comedy routines from past ceremonies were also part of the image overload and flashed by on the screen just as rapidly.

A sublime performance, such as septuagenarian Stanley Donen gracefully dancing with his lifetime achievement Oscar, was reduced to a second or two of what must have seemed to an uninformed viewer a bad comedy routine. Without hearing his acceptance speech, a shot of the late Jack Palance doing press-ups registered as just another hyper- kinetic visual. A glimpse of the streaker over the shoulder of David Niven was not even funny although Niven's response at the time had been. A sound bite of his ad-lib, "Isn't it fascinating to think that probably the only laugh that man will ever get in his life is by stripping off his clothes and showing his shortcomings?"[2] would have been, I assume, far too long for this montage. More clips from previous award ceremonies continued to be shown relentlessly throughout the evening. Each segment of the broadcast usually ended with a short montage of "highlights" from previous broadcasts and, occasionally, some new film footage of previous Oscar winners, such as Barbra Streisand, Michael Douglas and Elton John, reminiscing about past triumphs was shown. The evening's homage to the history of the Academy Awards, with its countless montages of clips, was neither informative nor engaging. Instead, it became a meaningless visual spectacle, like the CGI display that opened the evening's broadcast.

The opening montage focused on the journey of a truck carrying the Oscar statues to the theater—a more extended trip of a space ship opened the Academy Awards broadcast in 2006, but it was obvious the same animators must have been behind it. Here is what I wrote of the opening two years earlier:

> *I find the Academy Award ceremony an increasingly telling indicator of postmodern trends in American society—and, in turn, an influential promoter of these trends. The simulated is replacing the authentic, style is becoming far more important than substance and history is reduced to what has been captured on film. The digital special effects of the opening sequence—an eerie journey through fantasy landscapes of real and imaginary buildings populated by Hollywood stars in famous roles—set the tone of the evening. It was an ingenious CGI extravaganza, suggesting what it must feel like walking around Las Vegas or Universal studio's theme park after taking a peyote button, but it was hardly an invitation to a live event. The random juxtaposition of animated cut-out figures from famous movies past and present, all*

mingling with comic book heroes and movie monsters and the occasional overheard utterance
of a line of movie dialogue, was more of a nightmarish vision of theme park America than
some kind of tribute to Hollywood as a dream factory.[3]

The ceremony, now as then, could be something more than a postmodern spectacle. Rather than over-loading the viewer with images without context and expecting that frenetic glimpses of stars past and present somehow expressed eighty years of a culturally significant ceremony, the Academy could have acknowledged a few of the realities of its own history and celebrated some of the real achievements of its members. Shirley Temple, who received a "juvenile" Oscar in 1935, also turns eighty this year. This year's ceremony would have been the perfect occasion to give her a lifetime achievement Oscar, especially in a year when a woman is running for president. Shirley Temple Black had appointments in the Nixon, Ford and Bush senior administrations and her deep involvement in Republican politics (she unsuccessfully ran for Congress in 1967) is a reminder that "liberal Hollywood" is also the home to many conservatives.[4] On the other hand, it would also have been an occasion to look back at how liberals and radicals in the indus-try were once ostracized in Hollywood. Instead of merely showing a gracious Charlie Chaplin telling the audience in 1972 that they are wonderful, the host could also have explained that the liberal Chaplin had just returned after being expelled from the country and Hollywood for twenty years.

Part II: Film Families

The Bardems are a legendary acting dynasty, sort of the Barrymores of Spain, although actors
here are not quite treated as royalty. La Bardem, as she is often called, is also a proud mom
and a pistol of a woman whose well-lived life has been one of adversity, trail-blazing, politics
and superstition.[5]

The Academy Awards ceremony has often included some interesting tributes and in the years since 1982, when I first started watching, the television broadcasts have occasionally provided me glimpses--beyond the spectacle and the hype--of the real workings and achievements of the film industry in the United States, and in film industries in other parts of the world. The 2008 ceremony was no exception. The most informative part of the show is often the lifetime achievement award. This year's award went to a male production designer, rather than to Shirley Temple Black. The choice of Robert F. Boyle for this award turned out to be a moving reminder of actual Hollywood history during the evening. Introduced by Nicole Kidman, the ninety-eight-year-old had started out in Hollywood on a Hitchcock film in the 1940s and went on to win an Oscar for his design of *North by Northwest*. His speech looked back on a very long career, including first being hired by legendary art director, Hans Dreier, who headed design at Paramount. He paid concise tribute to directors he had worked with: "To Norman Jewison who made moviemaking fun and much laughter while dealing with real subjects. And to Don Siegel, who cut to the chase and gave us truth."[6] He had previously been nominated for his work on Jewison's *Fiddler on the Roof* and Siegel's *The Shootist*.[7] With his frail body dwarfed by the giant Oscar statues on the stage behind him, one wished he

had been asked to give some suggestions for improving the sets at the Kodak Theater.

The craft of production design was again praised later in the evening when Robert Elswit, who won for Best Cinematography on *There Will Be Blood*, complimented the film's production designer, Jack Fisk: "John Toll won this a number of years ago [and] said [of] the production designer on his movie, that 50% of it belonged to him. Well, 80% belongs to Jack Fisk and his production crew." Fisk was actually nominated this year for *There Will Be Blood* but lost to the designer of *Sweeney Todd*. I observed that Fisk sat in the audience next to his wife, Sissy Spacek, and I was reminded of the less publicized marriages within Hollywood. Francis McDormand was also shown eagerly cheering her husband Joel Coen and his brother Ethan as they picked up the major awards of the evening. (The very high-profile marriage of Michael Douglas and Catherine Zeta-Jones was highlighted during the evening with film of them talking about their respective Oscar wins.)

Ruby Dee, who is four years older than Shirley Temple, was nominated for best supporting actress for her role in *American Gangster* and I was reminded not only of one of the longest marriages in the entertainment world (her husband of fifty-seven years, Ossie Davis died a few years ago) but of one of the longest female careers on stage, television and in film.[8] It was a pity that she did not win for best supporting actress. Both Davis and Dee were very active in the civil rights movement. The evening abounded in reminders of the connections between politics and Hollywood, and especially political women in Hollywood. Robert Boyle had spoken of his marriage to Bess Taffel, a screenwriter who died in 2000; their children and grandchildren were shown in the theater box reserved for the family of special award honorees. But he didn't mention that his wife had refused to name names during the investigation of communist influence in Hollywood and was blacklisted in 1951, thereupon ending her career as a screenwriter.[9]

The Academy Awards ceremony has still not honored those who were blacklisted in the 1940s and 1950s, although it has honored those who named names--and there were protests at the ceremony when Elia Kazan received a lifetime achievement award in 1999. One blacklisted screenwriter, Bernard Gordon, was mentioned during the evening in the montage of the people in the film industry who had died in the past year. Gordon, who has written at length about being blacklisted, had organized the protests against Kazan in 1999.[10] It is unconscionable that the mention of his death has been the only time that the Academy has acknowledged Gordon.[11]

While the blacklist period continued to go unnoted in this pseudo-historical anniversary ceremony, winners from outside the Hollywood community, however, were eager to mention other political aspects of the industry's history. Reflecting a rare knowledge of Hollywood ancestry during the evening, Stefan Ruzowitzky, the Austrian director of the Best Foreign Language Film, *The Counterfeiters*, paid tribute to the Austrian influence in Hollywood: "There have been some great Austrian filmmakers working here. Thinking of Billy Wilder, Fred Zinnemann, Otto Preminger, most of them had to leave my country because of the Nazis, so it sort of makes sense that the first Austrian movie to win an Oscar is about the Nazis' crimes."

Viewers were given a glimpse of the background of another country's film industry when Javier Bardem won for Best Supporting Actor for his role in *No Country for Old Men*. The actor comes from several generations of actors and had brought his mother, Pilar Bardem, who is a leading actress in Spain, as a guest. He dedicated his Oscar to her in Spanish. Jon Stewart, later jokingly boasting of his own high school Spanish, gave an absurd translation. I later found a more approximate translation and Bardem's speech turned out to be an impassioned dedication: "Mom, this is for you, for your grandparents, for your parents, Rafael and Matilde, for the comedians of Spain who, like you, have brought dignity and pride to our profession. This is for Spain and this is for all of you." His grandparents, Rafael Bardem and Matilde Munoz Sanpedro, were actors in the Spanish film industry from the 1940s. His late uncle, Juan Antonio Bardem, was an important director in post-WWII Spain and his mother, as well as being a renowned Spanish actress, is also politically outspoken. I learned that she, along with her son, had opposed the Spanish government's decision to send troops to Iraq in 2003.[12]

Part III: Dedications to Fathers and to Males who Rock

To my husband Matthew Syrett, who took care of our children and held down a full-time job so that we could make this film.

Cynthia Wade accepting an Academy Award for Best Documentary Short Subject, 2008

No winners but Bardem thanked their mothers with such pride and emotion during the evening. Fathers and men in general seemed to be the ones mentioned in the more passionate acceptance speeches. Earlier in the evening, Christopher Rouse, who won for Best Editor on *The Bourne Ultimatum*, acknowledged his father, Russell, who won an Oscar in 1959 as the writer of *Pillow Talk*. The Best Actress award was given to a young French woman who played Édith Piaf in *La Vie en Rose*. Marion Cotillard, who deservedly won for a memorable portrayal of the famous singer, was completely overcome with surprise and did not really know what to say. I'm not sure if she had prepared a speech and forgot it or hadn't bothered to prepare one at all. She could only babble on about her director while revealing that she had already picked up the language of American show business: "Oh -- thank you so much. Olivier, what you did to me, Maestro Olivier Dahan, you rocked my life. You truly rocked my life." It would have been appropriate to mention Piaf but she ended up thanking the angels in Los Angeles. There was something, nevertheless, charming and guileless about her speech.

La Vie en Rose was not the most political of films of the last year and it glossed over Piaf's collaboration with the Vichy regime during WWII. *Michael Clayton* was more political although its sexual politics seemed questionable, as the leading female role was a ruthless professional woman. However, this role won a Best Supporting Actress award for a British actress. Tilda Swinton seemed as amazed as Cotillard that she had won. Her hastily improvised speech was one of the oddest of the evening. Perhaps she had had too many pre-Oscar cocktails, but her attempts at humor seemed to me to be insulting to the people

she mentioned. After comparing the bald head and buttocks of the statue to her American agent, she concluded with a riff on her costar: "and George Clooney, you know, the seriousness and the dedication to your art, seeing you climb into that rubber bat suit from 'Batman & Robin,' the one with the nipples, every morning under your costume, on the set, off the set, hanging upside-down at lunch, you rock, man." I'm not sure what Clooney made of this but it came across as patronizing, unfunny, and downright strange for an acceptance speech.

It was no surprise to anyone that Daniel Day-Lewis won the Best Actor award for his role in *There Will Be Blood*. It also seemed probable that Day-Lewis himself was very sure of winning as his responses showed all the signs of his legendary acting preparations. His performance on stage came across as carefully rehearsed as he knelt before last year's nominated Queen,[13] Helen Mirren, and received his honorary "knighthood." As a poet's son, his speech fell to a rather baroque turn of phrase ending with praise for his director: "My deepest thanks to the members of the Academy for whacking me with the handsomest bludgeon in town. I'm looking at this gorgeous thing you've given me and I'm thinking back to the first devilish whisper of an idea that came to him and everything since and it seems to me that this sprang like a golden sapling out of the mad, beautiful head of Paul Thomas Anderson." In an evening when the biggest winners were the laconic Coen Brothers, I suppose the audience felt grateful for this colorful outpouring of well-crafted Irish blarney.

It continued to be a night for honoring fathers. As well as fulsomely praising his young male director, Day-Lewis was intent on acknowledging his patriarchal lineage and dedicated the award not only to his poet father but to his grandfather, Sir Michael Balcon, a great producer in the British film industry. He thanked his wife, Rebecca Miller, but he neglected to point out she is a film director. He also did not mention his mother, Jill Balcon, who was an actress in the British film industry. Day-Lewis concluded with these words, "I've been thinking a lot about fathers and sons in the course of this, and I'd like to accept this in the memory of my grandfather, Michael Balcon, my father, Cecil Day-Lewis, and my three fine boys, Gabriel, Ronan and Cashel."

Alex Gibney, the director of the Best Documentary Feature, had a more political message when he mentioned *his* father: "This is dedicated to two people who are no longer with us, Dilawar, the young Afghan taxi driver, and my father, a navy interrogator who urged me to make this film because of his fury about what was being done to the rule of law. Let's hope we can turn this country around, move away from the dark side and back to the light. Thank you very much." Gibney's film, *Taxi to the Dark Side*, was obviously critical of the present administration and it seemed appropriate that the director got to make a brief political statement. In contrast to last year's ceremony when Al Gore won for *An Inconvenient Truth* and received an enthusiastic reception, the Academy's treatment of the Best Documentary Feature category this year was subdued and somewhat rushed. Tom Hanks read out the nominations but only very brief scenes of the five documentaries were shown and there were no shots of the directors in the auditorium. Michael Moore had been nominated for *Sicko,* a documentary about health care that included a visit by the filmmaker to Cuba, but there was no sign of him throughout the evening. He has become an important celebrity and had previously won the Best Documentary award in 2003. I guessed that a producer had

believed his claim that he was bringing Castro, who had recently announced his retirement, as his guest for the evening and ordered the camera operators to avoid Moore altogether. The satirical filmmaker joked that he might allow Castro to deliver his acceptance speech, "As long as he keeps it under five hours. I'm telling you, that's got to be a ratings grabber."[14]

Tom Hanks had first come on stage to present the nominations for Best Documentary Short Subject. He had seemed much more enthusiastic in this earlier role, although, as a major star and Oscar winner, Hanks would not normally be expected to introduce such a minor Academy Award. However, he was on stage to add his status—and also probably because of the association of his role in *Saving Private Ryan*-- to talking by live satellite link with the military personnel in an important outpost of the American empire, Iraq. He introduced the televised connection to "Camp Victory" in Baghdad by speaking to an officer in charge of a group of soldiers. Onscreen, a number of men and one woman serving in the military were lined up to introduce themselves and read the nominations for Best Documentary Short Subject. As each service person read out the nomination, we were shown reaction shots of the nominees in the auditorium, who seemed surprised and amused by the situation. The winning film short was *Freeheld*, a film about a female police detective in New Jersey who, after being diagnosed with cancer, fights to have her pension transferred to her female companion. I'm not sure what the military in Baghdad thought about the theme of gay rights in this Oscar-winning film or, if they were still listening in, about the nominations for Best Documentary Feature, which also included the film, *No End in Sight*, a critical examination of decision-making in the early months of the U.S. occupation of Iraq.

Audiences were certainly being given contradictory political messages with both the presentation and acceptance of these two awards for documentaries. The Academy was clearly aligning itself with current U.S. foreign policy by connecting the broadcast of the award ceremony to Camp Victory in Iraq. The producers of the show also seemed to be deliberately marginalizing any criticisms of the present administration with its perfunctory treatment of the nominees for Best Documentary Feature. Yet it was clear that the members who nominated and voted for the winners in both documentary categories must have had more critical and progressive views than the members running the show. Whether there were any advance provisions for censoring the speeches of the winners, they at least got the opportunity to make some brief critical remarks, as with Gibney's comments mentioned above. And one of the two young female filmmakers who accepted for Best Documentary Short Subject said this: "It was Lieutenant Laurel Hester's dying wish that her fight for [*sic*] against discrimination would make a difference for all the same sex couples across the country that face discrimination every day. Discrimination that I don't face as a married woman." She went on to dedicate the award to her husband, as quoted in the epigraph to this section. It was unique during the evening to hear a dedication to a male that at the same time implied a feminist sense of gender equality.

Part IV: No Ceremony for Older Women

With older women relegated to asexual motherhood, unattractiveness, genderlessness, or the grotesque, the female cinematic sexual body remains young, pure and fecund for the male voyeuristic gaze and as female role model.[15]

It became clearer as the evening wore on that younger women, like the two filmmakers who won for Best Documentary Short Subject and upcoming stars like Marion Cotillard, were the most likely to win, so I guessed that a twenty-nine-year-old ex-exotic dancer had a real good chance of winning that night. With a name like Diablo Cody and a fashion style similar to that of Cher, she could hardly fail in Hollywood. She won for the best original screenplay for *Juno,* a very successful comedy film about a pregnant teen-ager wanting to give up her baby for adoption. Her walk on stage with a dress cut dangerously close to the crotch was one of the most suspenseful moments of the evening. She had previously published a memoir called *Candy Girl: A Year in the Life of an Unlikely Stripper,* but *Juno* was her first screenplay. Cody had good words in her acceptance speech for screenwriters who probably needed the boost coming out of the strike: "This is for the writers, and I want to thank all the writers. I especially want to thank my fellow nominees because I worship you guys and I'm learning from you every day, so thank you very much." I'm sure she endeared herself to many of her fellow screenwriters although Joe Eszterhas, the famous screen-writer of *Showgirls,* a big budget movie about strippers, and *Basic Instinct*, along with its sequel, might have been given pause by his rising younger rival's remarks. One of his books on Hollywood demonstrates he keeps a close watch on the Academy Awards ceremony.[16]

Joe Eszterhas might not have been the only one worried about young up and coming talent during the evening. Seasoned Hollywood songwriters failed to win against newcomers. Three songs from the Disney film, *Enchanted,* dominated the best song category but the well-established songwriters Alan Menken and Stephen Schwartz lost to the young writers and performers of the song from *Once*. (Both the older song-writers, however, had previously won for the music for other Disney films.) [17] There were some interesting gender dynamics when songwriters Glen Hansard and Marketa Irglova came on stage to accept the award. I'm sure they were both excited and surprised but Hansard managed to do all the talking and Irglova was drowned out by the music. To be fair, this had happened a few other times during the night when there were several winners accepting the award. To me, Hansard's unthinking behavior on stage came across as a form of entitlement, typical in male chauvinism. Jon Stewart, I think, saw Hansard's behavior as stemming from youthful excitement and only jokingly accused him of arrogance. Stewart, after the next commercial break, brought back Irglova and gave her time on stage to make a speech. That was a nice gesture on Stewart's part but it nevertheless suggested that a more chivalrous male was helping out a passive and powerless woman.

Last year, I noted that many of the nominated films were about children. This year, the title, *No Country for Old Men,* was continually being announced throughout the broadcast as the film was nominated in several different award categories. Although this particular film is not exactly about old men, old age was a significant theme in several of the nominated films and a number of older members of the film community

appeared throughout the broadcast. As mentioned, Marion Cotillard won the Best Actress award for her remarkable impersonation of Édith Piaf in *La Vie En Rose*. The film cuts back and forth between scenes of the renowned French singer as a young woman and ones of Piaf in her later years, when she is pictured as a prematurely aging and sickly woman. The images from these last years provide one of the most convincing portraits of bodily decline and aging in any film I've seen (the film also won for Best Makeup but I believe Cotillard's performance did not rely on this alone). I was even more impressed by *Away from Her*. Of all the nominated films, this was the one most focused on aging. (*The Savages*, nominated for Best Original Screenplay and Best Actress awards, is more about sibling relations than about the plight of an old and mentally incapacitated parent.) However, Sarah Polley's *Away from Her* lost to the Coen brothers in the Best Adapted Screenplay category and Julie Christie, in the leading role of a woman with Alzheimer's disease, also failed to win in the Best Actress category. However, as well as giving an award to the nonagenarian Robert Boyle, the Academy also acknowledged Ruby Dee and Hal Holbrook. Holbrook is the oldest male actor ever nominated for an Academy Award and Dee is the second oldest actress nominated (Gloria Stuart, who was nominated for *Titanic* has the distinction of being the oldest).[18]

Despite the worthy nominations mentioned above, I have sometimes suspected that chronological tokenism plays a role in the nomination process, rather than a committed policy of assessing all performances of merit equally, regardless of the age of the actors. A combination of sexism and ageism tends to make young, female nominees, as noted above, more likely to win than older women. Ageist humor, moreover, has frequently been expressed during the awards ceremony in regards to older actresses. I'm not sure why Judi Dench has become the most recent target of ageist jokes but for the last few years the hosts have taken pot shots at her. Dench became the subject of several ageist jokes by Ellen DeGeneres throughout the ceremony last year. This year, two new comic actors, Jonah Hill and Seth Rogan, pretended to be Judi Dench and Halle Berry in their announcement of an award and, of course, they fought over who would play Berry. It was a lame sketch and one of the award recipients actually had the best line when he asked "Do I get to kiss Halle Berry?" The implication of the sketch was that Dench was old and ugly.

Perhaps it was Dench's appearance in last year's *Scenes from a Scandal*, for which she got nominated for Best Actress but did not win, that has associated the actress with the familiar stereotype of older women lacking attractiveness. She was also nominated in 2001 for Best Actress in another brave performance as Iris Murdoch, the novelist diagnosed with Alzheimer's disease, in the film *Iris*. Dench and Christie follow in a tradition of British actresses tackling roles about mentally unstable older characters. The renowned Dame Edith Evans was nominated for Best Actress in her late seventies for her role as an older women suffering from hallucinations in the 1967 film, *The Whisperers*. It seems significant that playing such roles has never actually led to winning Oscars.

Older actresses, on the whole, are much more courageous than men in taking on less glamorous or unflattering roles in films. Older male actors tend to play loveable old codgers, such as the roles played by Jack Nicholson and Morgan Freeman in the recent *The Bucket List*. Christie's performance in *Away from Her* is very daring and probably more nuanced and skilled than her performance in 1965's *Darling*, for which she won the Best Actress Oscar. Sarah Polley's film was surprisingly subtle, even Bergmanesque, in its

probing examination of a marriage and the pains and joys of old age. Ingmar Bergman, of course, sadly died during the last year and his death was noted in the evening's montage of recent deaths (apparently, his passing did not warrant a special tribute. Michelangelo Antonioni, who died within a week of Bergman, also did not receive any tribute beyond a mention in the montage). I was reminded of the Swedish director's gift in getting remarkable performances from actresses. Bergman coaxed a great performance from the aging Ingrid Bergman in *Autumn Sonata*. As with the nominations for *Away from Her*, the actress and the director's screenplay for the film were both nominated for Oscars in 1978. Neither won, but Ingrid Bergman won Oscars for other, inferior, films such as *Murder on the Orient Express*.

Like last year's Best Picture, *The Departed,* the Coen brothers' *No Country for Old Men* had several large roles for male stars but no significant parts for women. Along with Bardem, both Josh Brolin and Tommy Lee Jones had important roles. However, Kelly McDonald, who plays Brolin's character's downtrodden wife, has a lesser part than those of the above-mentioned male actors; and Tess Harper, who plays the little-seen wife of Jones, mainly listens to her husband telling stories. The part of the one very old woman in the film—the role of McDonald's character's mother-- came close to caricature.

Before the award for Best Director was announced, a montage of clips of previous winners of the award was shown. Viewers could actually learn something from this montage as it showed a succession of male directors receiving awards. Watching these clips provided a strong visual reminder that no female director has ever won this award, and also that very few women have even been nominated for Best Director—I only spotted Jane Campion, nominated for *The Piano*, in the audience before Spielberg was shown accepting for *Schindler's List*.

Part V: Conclusion: a Ceremony for One Older Man?

> *We live in a time where fictitious election results give us a fictitious president. We are now fighting a war for fictitious reasons.*

> **Michael Moore, accepting an Academy award in 2003[19]**

The montage of award-winning male directors of the past culminated in a clip from last year's ceremony when Steven Speilberg, George Lucas, and Francis Ford Coppola gave the Best Director award to Martin Scorsese. Last year I commented, "Termed 'movie brats' in the 1970s, these four directors, along with (Clint) Eastwood, who was also very visible during the evening, now constitute the contemporary Hollywood establishment."[20] Scorsese, as last year's winner, presented the award this year to Joel and Ethan Coen for *No Country for Old Men*. If the Coen Brothers have enjoyed a reputation as quirky independent directors, the number of awards they won during the evening for their latest film confirms that this team is now a serious branch of the Hollywood establishment. From a younger generation than the "movie brats," the Coens first emerged in the 1980s. Since then, their films have increasingly commanded

bigger budgets and major stars. Tommy Lee Jones starred in the evening's award-winning film and George Clooney has appeared in some of their earlier films and is also starring in their next film. I thought they summed it up well when Ethan Coen said, "…we're very thankful to all of you out there for letting us continue to play in our corner of the sandbox…"

I complained in my commentary on last year's broadcast that Scorsese's *The Departed* was very violent and that the script overloaded with sexist and racist language. The language of *No Country for Old Men* is more subdued but the film also has many violent scenes and Javier Bardem's award-winning role is of either an evil spirit or psychopathic killer. Last year's commentary connected the Scorsese film to life in America today: "The success of the bleak vision of *The Departed* probably reflects a culture that continues to tolerate a macho government that is mired in a senseless war, uses 'extraordinary rendition' and torture against its enemies, and is insensitive towards other nations."[21] The Coens' film is as bleak as Scorsese's vision of Boston's gang warfare. As David Denby put it, "Civilization, it seems, has come to an end, petering out in the yellow-brown fields of West Texas."[22] The stories told by Tommy Lee Jones suggest some moral weight to counter the decline but *New Yorker* critic Denby was not convinced: "If you consider how little the sheriff bestirs himself, his philosophical resignation, however beautifully spoken by Tommy Lee Jones, feels self-pitying, even fake."[23]

At some point in the evening, Jack Nicholson had introduced a montage marking the eightieth anniversary of the Best Picture award. The montage of the seventy-nine best pictures revealed that many of the winning films, in retrospect, had actually not been the best, and I'm sure a list of the films released for any given year would probably reveal better films that were either nominated and did not win or films that had been completely ignored by the Academy. *Crash* (the Best Picture of 2006*)*, *The Departed* and *No Country for Old Men* are three well-crafted films, but none of them broke out of the typical mold of the majority of past Best Pictures. The three films heavily depended on star performances, genre conventions, and the strong evocation of the sensations of either sex or violence, or both. *Crash* might have had more characters and plot lines than usual, but it relied on crime film conventions, as well as Hollywood clichés about urban life. I was not only skeptical, like David Denby, of the sincerity behind the script of the Coens' film but unconvinced that *No Country for Old Men*—along with the two previous Best Picture winners-- had anything meaningful to say about our society. All three were merely successful vehicles for updating tired Hollywood conventions in the crime genre. The amoral stance of all three films and their fascination with violence, nevertheless, reflect the political culture of contemporary America where real violence and torture in Iraq is tolerated and the consequences of militarism are ignored.

Throughout the evening, Jon Stewart's wisecracks reminded viewers that it is an election year. One joke touched upon how science fiction conventions have sometimes portrayed the presidency. He joked, "Normally, when a black man or woman is president an asteroid is about to hit the statue of Liberty." A reaction shot after this line showed Spike Lee and Wesley Snipes in the audience exchanging smiles. (They were both unaccountably dressed in flamboyant outfits, as though they had come off the set of an African-American version of *Guys and Dolls*. As there were so few black nominees this year, I wondered if they wanted to draw attention to themselves). There could indeed be either an African American or a woman

elected president this year and perhaps this would prove that some liberal Hollywood screenwriters of the past were not writing fantasy. Stewart went on to make a silly joke about Barack Obama's name that does not bear repeating. One of his jokes about Hilary Clinton happened to invoke *Away from Her*. Stewart described the film as being about "a woman who forgets her husband" and went on to suggest it was Hilary Clinton's "feel-good movie of the year." To me, these jokes trivialize both politics and the culture of film but I suppose they were in keeping with the usual clever patter of late night television comedians and Stewart's own comedy show. Another political joke referenced the candidate from the opposing party. The comedian stated, "Oscar is eighty, which makes him now automatically the front runner for the Republican nomination."

Leaving aside any ageist implications, the latter joke suggested to me that the Academy Award ceremony is quite likely to steer the country more in the direction of voting for John McCain than whoever becomes the Democratic candidate, especially if large numbers of Americans have been watching their Best Picture winners the last few years. Canadians are exposed to U.S. movies but their citizens are probably more skeptical of their messages. *Away from Her* is a Canadian film and at one point Julie Christie's character expresses hostility towards Hollywood, "We don't go much to the movies any more. All those multi-plexes showing the same American garbage." This line probably didn't help Christie's chances in the Best Actress category. Another of her lines, however, makes a simple but resounding point, especially as the film implies that it expressed one of the last moments of sanity experienced by this character. The screen shows American soldiers in Iraq, and the voice of President Bush is heard talking about freedom. Fiona, played by Julie Christie, is silently watching television in a nursing home but suddenly and distinctly says, "How could they forget Vietnam?"

Notes

[1] Maland, Charles J. *Chaplin and American Culture.* Princeton, Princeton University Press: 1989, p. 344

[2] Quoted in Steve Pond *The Big Show: High Times and Dirty Dealing Backstage at the Academy Awards.* New York, Faber & Faber: 2005, p.27

[3] Goff, Robert, "March of the Pimps: Reflections on the 2006 Academy Award Ceremony." Unpublished manuscript

[4] For information on this child star and her later political career see Patsy Guy Hammontree*, Shirley Temple Black: A Bio-Biography*. Westport CT, Greenwood Press:1998.

[5] *Los Angeles Times* article: http://www.latimes.com/entertainment/la-et-bardem22feb22,0,5186625.story

[6] Transcripts of the 2008 Academy Awards speeches can be found on *The Oscars* website, http://oscar.com/

[7] On the work of Boyle and Drier, see Charles Affron and Mirella Jona Affron, *Sets in Motion: Art Direction and Film Narrative.* New Brunswick, Rutgers University Press: 1995.

[8] See Ossie Davis and Ruby Dee, *With Ossie and Ruby: In This Life Together.* New York, William Morrow: 1998.

[9] See an interview with Bess Taffel in Patrick McGilligan and Paul Buhle, *Tender Comrades: A Backstory of the Hollywood Blacklist.* New York, St. Martin Griffin: 1997.

[10] See Damien Bona, *Inside Oscar 2*. New York, Ballantine Books: 2002. pp. 243-244.

[11] See Bernard Gordon, *Hollwood Exile or How I Learned to Love the Blacklist.* Austin, University of Texas Press:1999, and *The Gordon File: A Screenwriter Recalls Twenty Years of FBI Surveillance.* Austin, University of Texas Press: 2004. An interview with Gordon is also in McGilligan and Buhle.

[12] See *Los Angeles Times*, http://www.latimes.com/entertainment/la-et-bardem22feb22,0,5186625.story

[13] Helen Mirren won the Best Actress Oscar in 2007 for her role as Elizabeth II in *The Queen*.

[14] Fox News online: http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,331557,00.html

[15] Elizabeth W. Markson, "The Female Aging Body Through Film" in *Aging Bodies: Images and Everyday Experience*, edited by Christopher A. Faircloth. New York, Altimira Press: 2003, p. 91.

[16] See Joe Eszterhas*, The Devil's Guide to Hollywood: The Screen Writer as God*. New York, St. Martin Griffin: 2007.

[17] Strangely, it appeared that if nominees were nominated more than once for awards, then they did not win at all. Roger Deakins was nominated for best cinematography for two films but he did not win. Cate Blanchett, who had nominations for both best actress and best supporting actress, also did not win.

[18] Information on the history of the ceremony can be found on the databases at the Academy of Motion Pictures Arts and Sciences' website, http://www.oscars.org/

[19] *American Rhetoric* on-line speech bank: http://www.americanrhetoric.com/speeches/michaelmo oreos-caracceptance.htm

[20] Goff, Robert, "Convenient Truths: A Commentary on the 2007 Academy Awards Ceremony as a Global Event*." Nebula* 4.2. June 2007

[21] Ibid.

[22] Denby, David, "Killing Joke: The Coen Brothers' Twists and Turns." *The New Yorker*, February 25, 2008. p. 76.

[23] Ibid.

Confucius On Music Education.

By Ji Yue

In the Western world, when one talks of the history of music education, typically she traces it back to the Renaissance. However, in East Asia, there is a completely different view: Confucius, who lived twenty-five centuries ago[1] and was a grand master of music education. Essentially he had told us everything we need for music education. In this article, we collect a number of his sayings on music education to demonstrate this point.

Importance of Music Education

The most famous saying of Confucius on music education might be: "To educate somebody, you should start from poems, emphasize on ceremonies, and finish with music."[2]

In other words, one cannot expect to become educated without learning music. If you are familiar with the culture of ancient Chinese society, you can easily see from this saying how highly regarded music education was, because the "finish" of something is usually associated with greater significance than other parts. In fact, Confucius always taught his students the "six arts"[3] the most crucial knowledge and skills in ancient China. These six arts were (in decreasing order of importance): ceremonies, music, shooting, driving, writing, and mathematics.[4] Music was second only to ceremonies. Note that the ancient Chinese societies are called "society of ceremonies", because they were based on ceremonies, just as the Western societies are based on laws. Hence, the above statement of Confucius has put music education in a position with great importance.

Objects of Music Education

Given the importance of music education, naturally one would think of this question: Who should receive music education? Confucius's answer to this question was: "There should be no discrimination against anybody in education."[5] "I never refused to teach anybody paying the tuition with at least *Shu Xiu*."[6]

Indeed, Confucius never refused to teach students, including those from poor, lower-class families. A good example was Yan Yuan, who grew up in a poor family and never improved his financial situation throughout his short life.[7] Although Yan Yuan had such a financial hardship, Confucius accepted him as a student and soon recognized him as his best student.[8] Confucius loved him so much that he claimed to be "killed" by the news that Yan Yuan died.[9]

There were many other students of Confucius who were from even poorer families. Zeng Shen "often had no food for days" and "had no money to buy clothes for years."[10] Zhong Gong "was a slave's son"; his home was "too small to have any furniture."[11] Confucius never discriminated against them or allowed anybody to discriminate against them because of their financial status.

Similarly, Confucius also taught Gong Ye Chang, who was a prisoner, and Zai Yu, who was "completely worthless like a spoiled wood."[12] Therefore, by his own educational practice Confucius had told us that there should not be any discrimination based on social status, or moral standards, or anything else.

Contents of Music Education

Confucius insisted that we should teach good music. Of course, then there is a question of what is good music. We can learn this from his comments on various pieces of music of his age. The music he liked most was probably *Shao*. After listening to *Shao*, he was intoxicated so much that "forgot the taste of meat for months."[13] He loved it because it "has both a good connotation and an artistic beauty."[14] Consequently, the standard for good music should be two fold: first, its connotation must be of sufficient merit; second, its beauty must be sensible.

Confucius stressed that music without good connotation should be excluded from the curriculum: "Once the music of Zheng is popular, corruptions will be everywhere."[15] Here Zheng was a kingdom in Confucius's age, whose territory covered part of today's Henan Province of China. Its music was famous for being sexually suggestive.[16] Certainly, being sexually suggestive is not a negative property by the standard of modern (western) society. However, by the standard of Confucius's age, it was a sign of bad connotation of music. Therefore, Confucius requested people to "stay away from the music of Zheng," and believed that would be beneficial for all kindoms.[17]

Confucius strongly promoted beautiful music in his own educational practice. While it was impossible to give a definition for beautiful music, he illustrated to us what kind of music he thought was beautiful. In his opinion, a piece of music was beautiful if it had "a magnificent beginning." Furthermore, beautiful music could be "harmonic", "clear", and "smoothly continuous."[18] Hence, music with these properties should be taught to students. His aesthetic standard for music had influenced China in the following two millenniums. In the Qing dynasty (1616 A.D.—1911 A.D.), the official curriculum of music still covered *Shao* as a highly important piece.[19]

Methodology of Music Education

Confucius also told us many effective ways to teach music. For instance, he emphasized that it was extremely important to motivate students. He said that a teacher "should not teach a student anything before he becomes strongly interested in it." The reason is that, once a student gets motivated, he can "understand three times more than what was taught."[20] Consequently, the effect of teaching would be much more significant.

Also, he suggested that teaching of new contents should be based on review of old contents. He said that one could become a (successful) teacher after mastering this skill.[21] He loved this approach of teaching because it could bring happiness to students.[22]

Confucius recognized that teaching must not be uniform for all students; in stead, it should be tailored for each individual student. There is a famous story in the Chapter *Xian Jin* of *Lun Yu*: Two students, Zi Lu and Ran You, asked Confucius exactly the same question, but the answers they got were completely different. A third student, Gong Xi Hua, asked Confucius why there was such a huge difference between the two answers. Confucius replied that his answers were based on the different characteristics of these two students.

Confucius realized that teaching should be a gradual, step-by-step procedure. He never pushed his students too much in his instructions. In teaching, he always led students patiently. The progress he made was not necessarily fast, but always steady.[23]

Confucius also realized that teaching and learning must be consistent with practice. He even said that "it would be a shame to talk of anything beyond one's own practice."[24] He himself followed this rule faithfully. One example was that, as a music teacher, he composed music for all the three hundred and five poems in *Shi Jing*, the first poem collection in the history of China.[25]

In summary, Confucius was not only a great philosopher, but also a great music teacher. He left with us many insightful comments on music education. Specifically, he articulated about the importance of music education. He requested that music education should be open to all people, without any discrimination based on financial status, social status, or anything else. He told us that we should teach good music, and showed us what kind of music was good. To teach good music, we could use a lot of effective approaches invented by him.

In most parts of today's world, music education is viewed from a Western position. The goal of this article is to provide an alternative view based on the Eastern Asian culture. We believe that, in an age of globalization, music education should be viewed from different angles, using the value systems of different cultures. We hope this article will be a first step towards this goal.

Notes

1. Most people believe Confucius was born in 551 B.C. and died in 479 B.C. (Feng 1948, Wang1964). However, some believe he was actually born in 550 B.C. (see Wu 2002).

2. See the Chapter *Tai Bo* of *Lun Yu*. Interested readers can refer to, e.g., Yang 2006.

3. See the Chapter *Biography of Confucius* of *Shi Ji*: "Confucius taught students poems, writing, ceremonies, music, etc. There were about three thousand students in total. Seventy-two of them learned all the six arts." Interested readers can refer to, e.g., Sima 1988.

4. The definition of "six arts" is from the Chapter *Bao Shi* of *Zhou Li*. Interested readers can refer to, e.g., Sun 1987.

5. See the Chapter *Wei Ling Gong* of *Lun Yu*.

6. This statement is from the Chapter *Shu Er* of *Lun Yu*. Here *Shu Xiu* refers to a type of dried meat. It was often used as a valuable gift in the age of Confucius.

7. According to the Chapter *Yong Ye* of *Lun Yu*, Yan Yuan "eats a bowl of food, drinks a ladle of water, and lives in a shabby house". In the Chapter *Xian Jin* of *Lun Yu*, Yan Yuan died but his family was too poor to buy an external coffin (Guo) for him. In the age of Confucius and Yan Yuan, a dead body was normally placed in two layers of coffins, one internal called "Guan" and one external called "Guo". Only really poor people were buried with just an internal coffin.

8. According to the Chapter *Yong Ye* of *Lun Yu*, Yan Yuan "remains perfect for months", but other students of Confucius "at best is so once a day."

9. See the Chapter *Xian Jin* of *Lun Yu*.

10. See the Chapter *Rang Wang* of *Zhuang Zi*. Here *Zhuang Zi* is Chinese classic widely believed to be written by the great philosopher Zhuang Zhou (369 B.C. – 286 B.C.). Interested readers can refer to Chen 1983.

11. See the Chapter *Fei Shi Er Zi* of *Xun Zi*. Here *Xun Zi* is Chinese classic written by the great philosopher Xun Kuang (313 B.C. – 238 B.C.). Readers can refer to Wang 1954.

12. See the Chapter *Gong Ye Chang* of *Lun Yu*.

13. See the Chapter *Shu Er* of *Lun Yu*.

14. See the Chapter *Ba Yi* of *Lun Yu*. In comparison, Confucius thought another piece of music, *Wu*, did not have a sufficiently good connotation, although it was very beautiful.

15. See the Chapter *Wei Ling Gong* of *Lun Yu*.

16. In the Chapter *Li Yue* of *Bai Hu Tong*, Ban Gu (born in 32 A.D., died in 92 A.D.) explained that "the people of Zheng made music to seduce the opposite sex, and thus the music of Zheng is all erotic." Readers can refer to Chen 1994.

17. See the Chapter *Wei Ling Gong* of *Lun Yu*. This was part of Confucius's answer to Yan Yuan's question.

18. See the Chapter *Ba Yi* of *Lun Yu*.

19. See the Chapter *Yue Zhi* of *Qing Shi Gao*. Here *Qing Shi Gao* was an official history of the Qing Dynasty, edited by the Institute for Qing History (IQH) and first published in 1927. Readers can refer to IQH 1977. Nevertheless, note that the *Shao* taught in the Qing Dynasty might be different from the original version.

20. See the Chapter *Shu Er* of *Lun Yu*.

21. See the Chapter *Wei Zheng* of *Lun Yu*.

22. See the Chapter *Xue Er* of *Lun Yu*. Confucius made an analogy, saying that the happiness obtained this way was just like meeting an old friend coming from far away.

23. This observation was made by his students. See the Chapter *Zi Han* of *Lun Yu*.

24. See the Chapter *Xian Wen* of *Lun Yu*.

25. *Shi Jing* was a collection of poems authorized in the 11th – 6th centuries B.C., and compiled by the officers of Zhou dynasty. The fact that Confucius composed music for all the three hundred and five poems in Shi Jing was recorded in the Chapter *Biography of Confucius* of *Shi Ji*.

References

Chen, Guying 1983, *A Modern Interpretation of Zhuang Zi*. Zhonghua Book Company.

Chen, Li 1994, *An Interpretation of Bai Hu Tong*, Zhonghua Book Company.

Feng, Youlan 1948, *A Short History of Chinese Philosophy*. Collier-Macmilan.

IQH (Institute for Qing History) 1977, *Qing Shi Gao*. First published in 1927. Reprinted in 1977 by Zhonghua Book Company.

Sima, Qian 1988, *Shi Ji*. Originally written in 90 B.C. Reprinted in 1988 by Yuelu Book Company.

Sun, Yirang 1987, *Notes on Zhou Li*. Zhonghua Book Company.

Wang, Li 1964, *Ancient Chinese*. Zhonghua Book Company.

Wang, Xianqian 1954, *Collected Interpretations of Xun Zi*. Zhonghua Book Company.

Wu, Lixing 2002, A Revisit of the Birth and Death Times of Confucius. *Research in Social Sciences (She Ke Zong Heng)*, Vol. 2002, No. 1.

Yang, Junbo 2006, *Translations and Interpretations of Lun Yu* (Simplified Chinese Version), Zhonghua Book Company.

An Historical Analysis of United States Newspapers' Bias in Reporting the Al-Aqsa Intifada.

By Yashar Keramati

With the new Palestinian-Israeli peace negotiations in Annapolis underway as I write this, I felt it would be beneficial to revisit the reactions and events which were induced by the last negotiations: the Oslo Peace Accords of 1993. It was quickly learnt that the Accords were almost completely unfruitful and were a serious reason behind creating the build up and backlash to what is now known as the Second Intifada or Al-Aqsa intifada which started on September 28th, 2000. The Accords raised the hopes of the occupied Palestinians while the realities on the ground consistently worsened. Thus, logically, many fear that if Annapolis fails it could lead to a third Intifada. Therefore, it is of historical importance and relevance to study the American media's portrayal of, and reaction to, the Second Intifada. Not only would such an examination aid in better understanding the new negotiations in Annapolis, but also it would assist in better understanding the U.S. media's position in relation to this Middle East conflict since the U.S. has much sway and leverage in the region. By thoroughly analyzing numerous primary and secondary sources from the day of the uprising to a month after it began, this essay will attempt to prove that the American media's portrayal of Al-Aqsa Intifada were often skewed and factually inaccurate in favor of Israel, regularly showing bias against Palestine.

Background

The Oslo Peace Accords came in reaction to the Israeli occupation of Palestine which took place after the Six Day War. In 1967, Israel invaded Palestine and placed it under military Occupation. Quickly thereafter, the military occupation took another turn for the worse, bringing in Israeli settlers who built homes and communities on the newly occupied Palestinian land. With such a move came other annexations, such as water sources as well as infrastructure. Check points, fortress like neighborhoods, and military outposts steadily increased throughout the years, creating many social, economic, and political woes for the people of Palestine, sometimes leading to violent backlash. The Al-Aqsa Intifada was an example of a violent

backlash.

The proverbial straw that broke the camel's back came on September 28th, 2000 when Ariel Sharon visited the Temple Mount, a holy site for both Jews and Muslims. The Palestinians' outrage was hardly due to Sharon's religious affiliation. Rather, it was because the visit asserted, once again, Israeli claims to occupied Palestinian lands, this time in the form of a claim to a Holy site by Israel's leader. All in all, the visit acted as a catalyst for a reaction to 33 years of occupation. With peace negotiations seemingly being not much more than political rhetoric and examples of hypocrisy, Palestinians from all walks of life engaged in their second uprising in less than two decades. The following will analyze how mainstream U.S. media portrayed the uprising, providing historical evidence which proves inaccuracy and bias were widespread in the coverage of Al-Aqsa. Under analysis are the United States' three biggest and most widely circulated newspapers: *USA Today*, *NY Times*, and the *LA Times*.

Sharon's Visit

The first major newspaper to report on Sharon's politically sensitive visit was the *LA Times*. On September 29th the headline read "Sharon's Temple Mount Foray Highlights Bitter Issue; Mideast: Visit by right-wing Israeli politicians sparks rioting. Dozens of troops, Palestinians are hurt"[1]. The title of the article alone seems to not only prioritize the harm done to Israeli troops, but in fact also omits the fact that Palestinians were actually killed during the event. While the *LA Times* chose to neglect important details regarding the outbreak, the Israeli human rights group B'Tselem provided detailed facts and figures regarding the day's events. The organization's widely circulated and easily accessed findings showed that on September 29th, five non-combatant Palestinian residents of Jerusalem were killed by Israeli forces. They even went as far to say who the victims were: Bilal 'Ali Khalil 'Afaneh, 25, Yihya Muhammad Hassan Faraj, 35, Nizar Ibrahim a-Shweiqi, 18, Haitham 'Umran 'Awaida a-Skafi, 45, and Osama Muhammad Adam Jadeh, 22[2]. Furthermore, the *LA Times* article chose to concentrate on Israeli celebrations of Sharon's visit rather than Palestinians' displeasure. The article concluded that that "In the waiting crowd below Temple Mount, Jews who came to support Sharon chanted: 'This is Jewish land! Get out!' And some hailed Sharon: 'King of Israel!'" Also omitted by the *LA Times* are Palestinian views and reactions to Sharon's provocative visit. This omission combined with the inclusion of the celebrating Israelis portrays Sharon as a hero. Whether Sharon was or not is a matter of opinion. What is a fact and not an opinion, however, is the blatant bias presented here.

On October 4th, less than a week later, the *LA Times* continued to divert attention from the source of the violence, that being the illegal occupation, and once again used wording and arguments which laid blame on the Palestinians, drawing a picture of Al-Aqsa as a mere spontaneous occurrence. The headline of the front page of the *LA Times* on the 4th read "Palestinian Rioting: A Fury Born of Control; Mideast: Arafat's actions and his people's pent-up anger are both factors". Instead of concentrating on the settlements, occupation, or Israeli expansion as major reasons for the uprising, the *LA Times* simply stated that it was Yasser

Arafat's obligation to control the Palestinian people. The *LA Times* even went as far as to act a venue for Israeli Foreign Minister, Shlomo Ben-Ami, to assert that the Palestinian uprising was unjustified and that it was up to Arafat to shut it down. No analysis was given to repressive Israeli policy which brought the uprising to the forefront. Rather, the *LA Times'* final statements for the day were:

> Palestinian and some Israeli analysts say that viewing the violence as the result of one man's machinations is simplistic and allows Israelis to dismiss or ignore the real anger and hatred that lie below the surface. That view doesn't take into consideration the complex ways Arafat plays Palestinian organizations against each other, rewarding some, punishing others, always to emerge with the most power.[3]

If the true source of the violence is to be ignored, as it unacceptably was in this article, and concentration was to be put on individual players which are involved in or responsible for the event, then the *LA Times* would still be guilty of, if nothing else, giving unequal coverage and analysis to the meddling of Arial Sharon at the time. All emphasis was on Arafat. Sharon, whose visit ignited the Al-Aqsa Intifada, not only escaped condemnation, but also received much less press coverage for his actions and capabilities to bring the violence to an end. A fair assessment of all major political players' contribution to the Second Intifada would have seriously taken into consideration the expansion of settlements under Sharon's guidance as Minister of Housing Construction for 1990-1992 as well as Minister of National Infrastructure from 1996-1998.[4] After all, the settlements were a focal point of Palestinian unrest, and under Sharon's guidance and initiative the illegal settlements' population grew from 227,500 to 258,400 from 1990-1992 and from 332,500 to 350,267 from 1996-1998[5]. Of course, such relevant facts were fully disregarded in the American coverage of the uprising.

Coverage of the Hostilities

During the Al-Aqsa Intifada American newspapers often provided details regarding casualties in what would be, at best, considered biased against Palestinians. While the statistics regarding the number of people dead were often flawed, what was even more flawed was the explanation given regarding the deaths, easily leading to a shift of blame towards the occupied people of Palestine. For example, on October 2nd, the front page of USA Today had a story titled "29 Slain During Middle East Clashes". Had the coverage ended there, USA Today would have not been guilty of any inaccuracies. However, the article went on to say "In Nablus, three Palestinians were killed when the Israeli army deployed helicopter gunships and moved tanks into position after Palestinian security forces attacked a small Israeli outpost in the center of the city.[6]" The wording of this article clearly skews the action-reaction relationship in the conflict. Even if USA Today is given the benefit of the doubt in the sense that they are correct in stating that the Palestinians were the first to engage in hostilities in this incident, the newspaper still fails to state that the Palestinian violence was a whole is in reaction to Israeli foreign policy in regards to Palestine. Their violence was a reaction to decades of occupation, and more recently, a tasteless visit of conquest by Sharon. However,

USA Today's wording portrays Israeli killings as a legitimate act of self defense in reaction to unjustified and spontaneous Palestinian aggression. With any conflict which witnesses more than one side being violent, it is crucial to distinguish between who is acting and who is reacting. Such a distinction plays an important role in determining who takes majority of the blame in a confrontation. Logically, reactions are more justifiable, if proportionate, than the initial action. Thus, it is easy to see why USA Today's perhaps seemingly minor errors in wording details is of rather grave importance in the larger picture of American's perception of the conflict.

The article goes on to display similar bias when it says "In the Gaza Strip, where a 12-year-old was shot to death Saturday, three more people died after Palestinian police opened fire with automatic weapons and Israeli security forces responded with anti- tank missiles." Once again, the paper is asserting that Palestinians were first to ignite tensions and thus they are responsible for the 12 year olds' fate. Israel, on the other hand, according to the news paper, was simply and justifiably reacting to Palestinian hostilities. Moreover, honest coverage would highlight the background information leading to the hostilities, such as provocation by the Israeli leader or Israel's treatment of Palestinians over the past decades as a whole. Neutral coverage would simply state that in a gun battle, a 12 year old was shot. Unfair and bias coverage, as exemplified by USA Today in this article, disorients the action- reaction roles of the players involved and attempts to justify unjust killings by painting it to be a legitimate act of self-defense and an unfortunate occurrence due to a reasonable reaction. A closer look at the articles wording and knowledge of even the most basic background of the conflict proves otherwise.

One day later, on October 3rd, seven Palestinians, three of whom were 18, 15, and 12 years old, were killed by Israeli forces[7]. On this day, USA Today did not report on the new killings of these Palestinians at all which is of concern. Rather, USA Today's article was about how non-fatal clashes had taken place within Israel between Israeli civilians and police[8]. Such omission of an important issue is prejudice and furthers bias. Had information been published on Israeli killings of children, American public opinion would surely be affected. Prejudice via omission is still prejudice.

USA Today's other article for the 3rd titled "Who'll quell Mideast Riots" went as far as to say that Palestinians "provided the fuel" for the conflict[9]. But it was the concluding remarks of this article which were most factually inaccurate. At the end of the article it was written "The Arafat-led Palestinians could lose their best chance ever for a generous settlement." The "generous settlement" refers to the Oslo Accords of 1993. Perhaps the first indicator that USA Today was wrong in celebrating the Accord was that after seven years the Accord had still not been implemented. Furthermore, the statement is written in a way as to portray Israel as a benevolent and generous nation which is giving Palestinians a handout out of kindness. This is incorrect on two fronts. First, whatever was said would be given back the Palestinians was at one point illegally taken from them by Israel, such as the land where the settlements were built. Secondly, Israel never ended up giving anything to Palestine anyway. Finally, USA Today neglected, even after seven years, that even if the Oslo plans and promises were delivered, they were far from being a generous gift. The Oslo Peace Accords, at best, promised that Israel would return to Palestine only ninety percent of the land that it had occupied, maintaining military outposts and settlements through out Palestine[10]. This is not

generous. If one has 100 dollars and someone steals it and gives back 90 dollars decades later, it would be foolish to call it a Samaritan act. Furthermore, 90% is not freedom. 90% is not sovereignty. Prisoners may have 90% of the area in a prison but the prison keepers who have the other 10% have all the power and control. Most importantly, it must be remembered that regardless of all of this, nothing was given back to the Palestinians by the year 2000. In fact, more was taken from them when regarding the figures already given regarding settler growth and expansion. Regardless of all this, USA Today portrays Israel as a compassionate nation in this matter.

The New York Times, while more discreet, did not shy away from painting Palestinians as the aggressors either. On the 16th of October it printed an article titled "Whose Holy Land? Gaza; Palestinian Militias: Motley but Armed". The article begins by asserting that "Palestinian militia known as the Tanzim, increasingly visible in street demonstrations and gun battles, will perhaps determine whether the battles with Israel continue or come to a halt."[11] By claiming that the Palestinian fighters would "determine whether the battles with Israel continue or come to a halt" the article hinted at the idea that the continuation of the conflict was the decision made by the Palestinians. Therefore, through this line of rhetoric, Palestinians were responsible for the fighting which was occurring. The NY Times fails, like the other papers, to take into account how a change in Israeli policy regarding the occupation would might have brought the violence to an end. The article also happened to select to interview a Palestinian who was extreme in his views instead of a moderate. The interviewee, Yasid Abu Abed, was quoted saying "The only thing I am getting ready is my coffin", "When I saw the Israeli helicopters attack our headquarters I felt proud", and "I will strap explosives on my body and blow myself up to attack the Israelis if it is required". Such statements perpetuate the stereotype that Palestinians are extremists and terrorists who do not value life. Abed is not a significant Palestinian figure. He is not known, nor is he an authority figure or leader. He is just another militant from the Palestinian side who happens to fall into one extreme. Instead of choosing a moderate to interview, the NY Times chose Abed. This was not fair.

However, this is not to say that extremists do not exist within Palestine. They undoubtedly do. But they exist in Israel as well. The NY Times illustrated otherwise by only covering the actions of Palestinian extremists and fundamentalists in the form of suicide bombers but never published any articles on the same type of people on the Israeli side; that being the heavily armed and ideological settlers. On October 27th the NY Times ran an article titled "Suicide Attack in Gaza Strip Increases Tension in Mideast"[12]. From the beginning one can detect the ostracizing nature of the article. What is of great irony is that this uneven-handed observation of a suicide bombing actually did not harm anyone except the suicide bomber, as no others were injured nor killed in the incident. The legitimate reasoning and just motivation of running such an article was thus hard to see. The article never analyzed what reasons a 24 year-old would have for taking his life. It does not analyze the underlining suffering and oppression that would force a human being to commit such an act. Simply put, it shows this self-harming incident as an event harmful to others which is factually inaccurate. Instead of illustrating the incident as an act of desperation or as a signal that there were some obvious social ills driving individuals to commit such actions, the NY Times portrays the incident as one of pure madness and hatred, further strengthening anti- Palestinian sentiments with its audience. The least that could have been done to make such an analysis more even-handed was

covering the crimes against humanity committed by settlers during the Al-Aqsa Intifada which was never done by the American media source under analysis. Palestinian victims of Israeli extremist acts remained unnamed, unheard of, and unknown. For example, during the rare yet highly publicized suicide bombing following the first month after the breakout of the Second Intifada, the major American media sources at hand never mentioned that, for example, Mustafa Mahmoud Mussa 'Alian, a resident of Aksar Refugee Camp, was stoned to death by Israeli settlers on October 14th, 2000 while working as a taxi driver[13]. No act of Israeli extremism made it through the filter of mainstream American newspapers, but Palestinian ones consistently made the front page. There was asymmetry in reporting. It was an asymmetry which was unacceptable and unjust.

What also brought the credibility of the article into question was its exceptional downplay of the Israeli settlements which were a major cause of the conflict. The article stated that there were "200,000 or so Israeli settlers in the West Bank and Gaza". However, internationally studied, accepted and neutral sources put the actual number of settlers in 2000 at 371,904[14], almost double the figures documented by the NY Times. Such factual inaccuracies are unacceptable coming from such a powerful, widely circulated and trusted source of information.

Similarly, USA Today embarked on the same path. On October 18th, when it published

> "As [Ahmed Yassin] spoke, hundreds of Palestinian police and youths, shouting "Revenge, revenge" and "Children of the Jews, our bullets will find you," carried the flag-draped body of a Palestinian policeman through Gaza's streets."[15]

While it is undeniable that such occurrences did take place, USA Today did not accurately reflect that such extremism existed in both camps. For example, racist and supremacist Israeli settler movements such as Gush Emunim maintained a consistent campaign of spreading racial hate towards Palestinians during the Al-Aqsa Intifada, claiming that all Palestinians must be purged from all of the land, making room for the "chosen people"[16]. Gush Emunim openly claimed that Palestinians must be disposed of from the land of the chosen people at any cost, which had a disturbingly similar tone to that of the Nazi movement. However, during the month long period after the uprising started, the three largest American newspapers put heavy emphasis on Palestinian extremism while never once mentioning the Gush Emunim movement and its practices in their publications.

Blaming the PLO

Article called "Unrest part of PLO scheme" published on October 26th in USA Today displayed its most blatant favoritism towards Israel. An exert reads:

> "Ariel Sharon's visit was used as a pretext for premeditated violence, in a long-established

Palestinian strategy to control Jerusalem and further delegitimize Israel. In recent months, Israeli intelligence warned of evidence of preparation in the Palestinian authority for a major confrontation. Indeed, the PLO's No.2, Nabil Shaath, had said that as long as Israel continued to concede, there would be quiet, but "as soon as they say no" over Jerusalem, the heavily armed Palestinians would resume their uprising."

Factual inaccuracies were abundant in this article. Firstly, "premeditated violence" was unlikely to have taken place due to the organization of the Palestinian people. The people of Palestine were not politically homogenous and thus a theory of premeditated uprising failed to address how people from different political standpoints, religions, sexes, and ages all rallied behind the Al-Aqsa Intifada throughout occupied Palestine. Therefore, the logical explanation for the mass uprising must be that years of oppression brought the Palestinian people to a boiling point as was the case in the first Intifada in 1987. Furthermore, as it was learned during the Oslo Peace Accords, Yasser Arafat did not have the great control over the Palestinian people which America and Israel said he did because during the Oslo Accords alone many of his own people protested against his cooperation with America and Israel. Thus, given the decades of harsh oppression that all Palestinians faced under occupation, mass and largely independent mobilization after a major provocation is not at all infeasible. USA Today, however, described the situation as one which was planned by the PLO in advance and one in which the PLO had the power to control. USA Today did not address how the end of oppressive Israeli practices as well as provocative political conquests by Israeli leaders may very well have done away with all major violence.

The final part of the article made yet another misleading claim, asserting that Palestinians are heavily armed. It is common knowledge that most Palestinians involved in the uprising turned to stones and other easily found objects as weapons. Molotov cocktails were sometimes used. Few had AK-47s as well as the highly inaccurate and ineffective homemade rockets. Conversely, the article failed to mentions to what degree Israel was armed. Ironically enough, Israel was the only nuclear power in the region. According to nuclear-whistler blower Mordechai Vanunu, at the time Israel possessed "over 200" nuclear bombs in 1986[17]. Furthermore, the American-armed Israeli army was one of the most powerful armies in the world. With an average $3 billion[18] allowance from the US to spend on arms, the Israeli military was easily the strongest military power in the Middle East during the Al-Aqsa Intifada. In reality, the rock throwing Palestinians were confronting a regional superpower. Relative to Israel, the Palestinian's arsenal was nothing. None of this was highlighted or considered by the newspaper.

The same article goes onto say

"The PLO leader expected that whichever way Israel reacted, he'd win. Either Israel would reassert its claim to Jerusalem and the PLO would start an uprising claiming Israel as aggressor, or Israel would let the challenge stand and let the PLO establish its de facto control over Jerusalem."

The wording in the article is also interesting in that it writes "claiming Israel as aggressor". Many would in

fact have argued that occupation was aggression, and thus no "claims" needed to be made about whether or not Israeli was being an aggressor. The "claim" was rather a fact. The wording brought Israeli aggression out of the spotlight and into doubt. Conversely, it turned the Palestinians into the aggressors. Therefore, the wording is not only unjust and unreasonable, but also misleading. Furthermore, the article was written in a way which made the uninformed reader believe that both Israel and Palestine had equal claims to Jerusalem when in fact that land was taken by Israel in 1967 through its illegal expansion and occupation. Therefore, in fact, a "de facto" control of Jerusalem by Palestinians was not evenhanded enough. It can rationally be argued that Palestine deserved to have the land that Israel had taken away from it returned and not merely have to have de facto control over it. The way that this article was written though painted Jerusalem as an "up-for-debate" issue, with both Israel and Palestine having equally legitimate claim to it. Finally, it is important to point out that in the year 2000 and throughout the whole conflict Israel maintained control over the area in question here.

The next day, on October 4th, the one sided commentary of USA Today continued. This was in an article titled "Israeli Peace Steps on Equality". It indiscreetly hinted that the PLO was an, anti-Semitic organization, rife with a culture of religious intolerance. It was written

> "Years ago, Israel gave religious custody of the mosques built on the Temple Mount to the Muslim Waqf, the organization that administers Islamic property, displaying both respect and Israel's willingness to share. In tragic contrast, Palestine Liberation Organization leader Yasser Arafat's response to yet further compromises offered by Israeli Prime Minister Ehud Barak is that Israel have no control at all. By their callous denigration of the Jewish religion, the Waqf's behavior is quite of a piece with bigotry in declarations by Arafat and other Palestinian officials that the Temple Mount and Western Wall, what remains of the Temple, are not Jewish holy sites at all and should therefore not be shared."[19]

The article once again builds-up Israel's reputation, classifying it as a kind and giving nation. Quickly thereafter, it juxtaposed Israel with the seemingly intolerant and ethnocentric PLO. This was done by the newspaper unfairly; attempting to mix politics with religion, concurring that a policy against Israel is a policy against Judaism. However, the PLO's policy were not opposed to Judaism but rather opposed to Zionist expansion and domination. Before the Six Day War of 1967, the Temple Mount was under Palestinian control as it fell into their land. After the occupation, however, Israel annexed this land too. The USA Today article speaks of control and discrimination which is quite ironic as in the year 2000 Israel controlled who could or could not enter the area, more often than not barring Palestinians for 'security reasons'. Furthermore, as far as respect for the holly sites went, USA Today failed to mention that four short years back, in 1996, Israel, against both Muslim and Christian protest, dug a tunnel under the area to promote Israel's tourism industry[20]. This was, of course, met with outrage from people of many faiths as well as the faithless who respected others' religions.

On October 25th, almost a month in to the Al-Aqsa Intifada, USA Today went on to critique Palestinian leadership and Palestinian radio for spreading propaganda and thus fueling conflict. The article stated:

> "Despite Israeli demands that it stop inciting the public, the Voice of Palestine radio, controlled by Yasser Arafat's Palestinian Authority, is delivering a daily diet of news, commentary and propaganda aimed at rallying the Palestinian masses into a confrontation with Israel."[21]

The wording of this political article was very uneven-handed and was subject to scrutiny for the sake of fairness. In the first paragraph of the article above, it was said that the radio station was spreading "propaganda" and "calling the masses into confrontation with Israel" in a way which demonized the Palestinian uprising. "Propaganda", in this case, was a loaded word. While it is logical to assume that Voice of Palestine appealed to the Palestinians people to stand and fight for their rights against an illegal occupation, that is not to say that it was feeding the population harmful information which is what the wording in this USA Today article hinted at. Furthermore, the word "confrontation" is attempting to achieve the same demonizing effect. USA Today could have just as easily stated, for example, "calling the masses to fight against the occupation" which is a perfectly accurate statement. There is nothing wrong with such a statement. In fact, those who stand for justice encourage the distribution of such broadcasts. Historically, it has been the case that the weak in asymmetrical battles for freedom have appealed to the masses for support and unity. Such broadcasts have asked the people to immediately stand against the oppressor. For example, via the African National Congress's radio station during apartheid, Walter Sisulu, a hero of the struggle, announced of the airwaves

> "In the face of violence, men struggling for freedom have had to meet violence with violence. How can it be otherwise in South Africa? Changes must come. Changes for the better, but not without sacrifice. Your sacrifice. My sacrifice. We face tremendous odds. We know that. But our unity, our determination, our sacrifice, our organization are our weapons. We must succeed! We will succeed!"[22]

Undoubtedly, the apartheid government of Charles Swartz at the time condemned such broadcasts. The U.S. which at the time maintained that the ANC was a terrorist organization at that time called such broadcasts propaganda and wrong. However, there are few who can argue against the acceptable and just nature of such calls to actions like the one made by Sisulu as doing so would be an acceptance of apartheid. The case of Voice of Palestine is the same. In both cases the less powerful and dominated group was fighting against an unjust authority. Rationality, political awareness and an admiration for justice and equality celebrate such broadcasts. However, those from the opposing side quickly tried to categorize such announcements as counterproductive, unjust, and as propaganda. This is what USA Today did on October 24th.

Furthermore, while USA Today routinely criticized Palestinians' actions and institutions on the outset of the Al-Aqsa Intifada, it at no point called into question the policies of Israeli institutions and policies which perpetuated violence. For example, the Israeli government armed its settlers with military machines guns[23]. There have been countless incidents of settler attacks on Palestinians. Arming settlers is thus promoting violence and B'Tselem has a detailed history to show how, when, and who the armed settlers have killed[24]. However, the major American media sources do not condemn nor inquire into such matters, once

again showing bias. Furthermore, USA Today failed to question Israeli radio stations. The primary source of violence from the Israeli camp was the Israeli Defense Source. The IDF had its own nationwide radio station which broadcasted nationally around the clock[25]. USA Today, at no point, brought into question the announcements made by the IDF which attempted to justify Israeli military action.

The American media also outright omitted important events which took place during the Intifada which showed Israel in an unfavorable way others in the world showed both sides of the conflict. The most famous example of such an event was the Israeli military's killing of the 12 year-old Palestinian civilian, Muhammad al-Dura, on September 30th, 2000. Muhammad will go down in history as did the man who stood in front of the tank in Tiananmen Square. Muhammad al-Dura quickly became an international figure reflecting upon the Al-Aqsa Intifada when the French television station France 2 captured and aired footage of the 12 year-old trying to find shelter in his father's arms, hiding behind a cement block. Both he and his father, both unarmed and not participating in hostilities, were captured on film being shot to death by an Israeli sniper[26]. The international media immediately provided information on the incident. Newspapers in Asia, Europe, and Africa printed frames from the incident in their most widely circulated newspapers upon the incident's occurrence[27]. Understandably, the typical reaction to Muhammad's fate was one of condemnation of the Israeli "error". However, an extensive search has shown that only the smallest of America's three largest newspapers ever printed the boy's name in their paper; the LA Times. Even here, the LA Times did not even provide a photograph of the incident which was the international standard. It also did not print the article until 3 days after it happened, unlike other international newspapers, and when it did it print the article it printed it tucked away on page 16 with no mention on the front page, clearly not giving it much attention. Even in this sole incident that Muhammed was mentioned within the big three newspapers, the LA Times went onto to provide the Israeli army's attempted justification for the seemingly blatantly unjustified killing publishing that "Maj. Gen. Yom-tov Samia, head of military forces in the southern region that includes Gaza, told Israeli radio… he was sure Rami and his father, Jamal, 'were there not just by accident.'"[28] If the Israeli army was thus provided with a wide-reaching mechanism to attempt to sway the American public, it was only fair to provide testimonies from eye witnesses, for example from the camera man who shot the footage, Talal Abu Rahma, reflecting upon a view divergent from the Israeli army's. Conveniently, this was not done.

Conclusion

In the month following the outbreak of the Al-Aqsa uprising, the three biggest and most powerful American newspapers clearly showed bias in favor of the Israeli position. Palestinians were disadvantaged by the American is a few different ways. At times the information given about them was inaccurate. Other times the media contrasted Palestinian action with the great reflections given to Israel. Sometimes information which would have been beneficial to the image of the Palestinian side was completely disregarded. It was also not rare to find factual inaccuracies or skewed presentations of the Palestinian side. The uneven nature of the coverage and its content in the American media was disturbing. The most powerful country

in the world, where public opinion had the potential of determining other nations' foreign policy due to an unmatched influence and paternalistic power, was often given inaccurate and bias information. Furthermore, given the wide circulation and built-up credibility of the three newspapers, it was especially dangerous that the information was sometimes inaccurate because the readers trust in these primary sources made the reporting go largely unquestioned, allowing bias to go unnoticed. With Annapolis underway, it would be detrimental to the peace movement to see same mistakes in reporting repeated again.

Bibliography

Broadcast on ANC Radio by W. M. Sisulu. "26 June 1963" African National Congress. http://www.anc.org.za/ancdocs/history/ug/rf630626.html. Accessed on November 27th, 2000

Hedges, Chris. "Whose Holly Land? Gaza; Palestinian Militias: Motley but Armed" *New York Times*. October 26th, 2000. World Section.

"Israel: Security vs. peace." *Commonweal* 123, no. 14. 1996: 5-7.

Jabr, Samah and Betsy Mayfield. "On Living and Letting Live." *Washington Report on Middle East Affairs* 19. no. 9. 2000: 9-15.

Joel Simon. "Should a Broadcast Station Be a Military Target?" *Columbia Journalism Review* 39. no. 5. 2001: 68.

Kelly, Jack. "Hammas Leader Refuses to Accept Cease-Fire Agreement" *USA Tody*. October 18, 2000. News Section.

May - June 2007 Settlement Report. "Israeli Settler Population 1972-2006" Foundation for Middle East Peace. http://www.fmep.org/settlement_info/stats_data/settler_populations/Israeli_settler_po pulation_in_occupied_territories.html. Accessed on November 23rd, 2007.

May - June 2007 Settlement Report. "Israeli Settler Population 1972-2006" Foundation for Middle East Peace. http://www.fmep.org/settlement_info/stats_data/settler_populations/Israeli_settler_po pulation_in_occupied_territories.html. Accessed on November 22nd, 2007.

Mcneal, Va. "29 Slain During Mid East Clashes" *USA Today*, October 2nd, 2000, News Section.

Mclean, Va. "Israeli Peace Steps on Equality" *USA Today*. October 4th, 2000. News Section.

Mclean, Va. "Palestinian radio: All the news that fits the cause Israel says the broadcasts are nothing but

lies and propaganda. Listeners say the station is the only information source they can trust." *USA Today*. October 25th, 2000. News Section.

Mclean, Va. "Who'll Quell Mideast Riots?" *USA Today*. October 3rd, 2000. News Section.

Mclean, Va. "Widening unrest crosses the Israeli border 'Great damage' to hopes for deal as death toll rises" *USA Today*. October 3rd, 2000. News Section.

Morris, Nomi and Eric Silver, "The tunnel that started the battle" *Maclean's* 109. no. 41. 1996: 32-34.

Poller, Nidra. "Myth, Fact, and the al-Dura Affair." *Commentary* 120. no. 2. 2005: 28-30.

Prusher, Ilene R. "What the Oslo deal left out hinders Middle East peace process." *Christian Science Monitor* 89, no. 74. 1997: 1-5.

Sammonds, Neil. "Nuclear secrets." *Middle East.* 2002: 22.

"Shooting Error" *New Republic* 226, no. 12/13. 2002: 11-15.

Sontag, Deborah. "Suicide Attack in Gaza Strip Increases Tension in Mideast" *New York Times*. October 27th, 2000. World Section.

Statistics. "Palestinians killed by Israeli Civilians in the Occupied Territories" B'Tselem. http://www.btselem.org/english/statistics/Casualties_Data.asp?Category=3 Accessed on November 25th, 2007.

Statistics. "Palestinians killed by Israeli security forces in the Occupied Territories" B'Tselem. http://www.btselem.org/English/Statistics/Casualties_Data.asp?Category=1. Accessed on November 20th, 2007.

Sternhell, Zeev. "Blood and Soil." *Index on Censorship* 33, no. 4. 2004: 178-180.

Thomas, Mark. "Instead of dropping the bombs themselves, the US military should get Interflora to deliver them." *New Statesman* 130, no. 4562. 2001: 17-19.

Wilkison, Tracy. "Father-Son Image Shocks, Sickens Both Sides" *USA Today*. October, 2nd, 2000. News Section.

Wilkison, Tracy. "Palestinian Rioting: A Fury Born of Control; Mideast: Arafat's actions and his people's pent-up anger are both factors." *LA Times*. October 4th, 2000. World News Section.

Wilkison, Tracy. "Sharon's Temple Mount Foray Highlights Bitter Issue; Mideast: Visit by right-wing Israeli politicians sparks rioting. Dozens of troops, Palestinians are hurt." *LA Time*. September 29, 2000.

World News Section.

Notes

[1] Tracy Wilkison, "Sharon's Temple Mount Foray Highlights Bitter Issue; Mideast: Visit by right-wing Israeli politicians sparks rioting. Dozens of troops, Palestinians are hurt." *LA Time*, September 29, 2000, World News Section.

[2] Statistics, "Palestinians killed by Israeli security forces in the Occupied Territories" B'Tselem, http://www.btselem.org/English/Statistics/Casualties_Data.asp?Category=1.

[3] Tracy Wilkison, Palestinian Rioting: A Fury Born of Control; Mideast: Arafat's actions and his people's pent- up anger are both factors." *LA Times*, October 4th, 2000, World News Section.

[4] "Israel: Security vs. peace." *Commonweal* 123, no. 14 (1996): 5.

[5] May - June 2007 Settlement Report, "Israeli Settler Population 1972-2006" Foundation for Middle East Peace, http://www.fmep.org/settlement_info/stats_data/settler_populations/Israeli_settler_population_in_occupied_ter ritories.html.

[6] Va Mcneal, "29 Slain During Mid East Clashes" *USA Today*, October 2nd, 2000, News Section.

[7] Statistics, "Palestinians killed by Israeli security forces in the Occupied Territories" B'Tselem, http://www.btselem.org/English/Statistics/Casualties_Data.asp?Category=1

[8] Va Mclean, "Widening unrest crosses the Israeli border 'Great damage' to hopes for deal as death toll rises" *USA Today*, October 3rd, 2000, News Section.

[9] Va Mclean, "Who'll Quell Mideast Riots?" *USA Today*, October 3rd, 2000, News Section.

[10] Ilene R. Prusher, "What the Oslo deal left out hinders Middle East peace process." *Christian Science Monitor* 89, no. 74 (1997): 1.

[11] Chris Hedges, "Whose Holly Land? Gaza; Palestinian Militias: Motley but Armed" *New York Times*, October 26th, 2000, World Section.

[12] Deborah Sontag, "Suicide Attack in Gaza Strip Increases Tension in Mideast" *New York Times*, October 27th, 2000, World Section.

[13] Statistics, "Palestinians killed by Israeli Civilians in the Occupied Territories" B'Tselem, http://www.btselem.org/english/statistics/Casualties_Data.asp?Category=3

[14] May - June 2007 Settlement Report, "Israeli Settler Population 1972-2006" Foundation for Middle East Peace, http://www.fmep.org/settlement_info/stats_data/settler_populations/Israeli_settler_population_in_occupied_ter ritories.html.

[15] Jack Kelly, "Hammas Leader Refuses to Accept Cease-Fire Agreement" *USA Today*, October 18, 2000, News Section.

[16] Zeev Sternhell, "Blood and Soil." *Index on Censorship* 33, no. 4 (2004): 178.

[17] Neil Sammonds, "Nuclear secrets." *Middle East* (2002): 22.

[18] Mark Thomas, "Instead of dropping the bombs themselves, the US military should get Interflora to deliver them." *New Statesman* 130, no. 4562 (2001): 17.

[19] Va Mclean, "Israeli Peace Steps on Equality" *USA Today*, October 4th, 2000, News Section.

[20] Nomi Morris and Eric Silver, "The tunnel that started the battle" *Maclean's* 109, no. 41 (1996): 32.

[21] Va Mclean, "Palestinian radio: All the news that fits the cause Israel says the broadcasts are nothing but lies and propaganda. Listeners say the station is the only information source they can trust." *USA Today,* October 25th, 2000, News Section.

[22] Broadcast on ANC Radio by W. M. Sisulu, "26 June 1963" African National Congress, http://www.anc.org.za/ancdocs/history/ug/rf630626.html.

[23] Samah Jabr and Betsy Mayfield, "On Living and Letting Live." *Washington Report on Middle East Affairs* 19, no. 9 (2000): 9.

[24] Statistics, "Palestinians killed by Israeli Civilians in the Occupied Territories" B'Tselem, http://www.btselem.org/english/statistics/Casualties_Data.asp?Category=3

[25] Joel Simon, "Should a Broadcast Station Be a Military Target?" *Columbia Journalism Review* 39, no. 5 (2001): 68.

[26] Nidra Poller, "Myth, Fact, and the al-Dura Affair." *Commentary* 120, no. 2 (2005): 30.

[27] "Shooting Error" *New Republic* 226, no. 12/13 (2002): 11.

28 Tracy Wilkison, "Father-Son Image Shocks, Sickens Both Sides" *USA Today*, October, 2nd, 2000, News Section.

The Lack of Implementation of United Nations Security Council's 242 Resolution: The Constructivists' Delusion and The Marxist and Realists Explanation.

By Yashar Keramati

Introduction

The United Nations Security Council's Resolution 242 was unanimously passed in 1967 after the end of the Arab-Israeli Six Day War. Resolution 242 asserted that Israel must remove its military occupation of Palestine and respect Palestine's sovereignty. 40 years later Resolution 242, from here on referred to as the Resolution, has still not been enforced. Instead, the situation in Palestine has consistently worsened, leaving one to wonder what the role of the United Nations is in regards to this dire issue. The following essay will analyze why the United Nations has not implemented the Resolution by drawing upon Constructivist, Realist, and Marxist explanations of the role of international organizations (IOs). After reviewing the data and empirical evidence pertinent to the issue, this essay will attempt to prove that while Constructivism has short glimpses of validity in explaining UNSC's shortcomings in enforcing the Resolution, Realism and Marxism are significantly more convincing in explaining why Palestine, in spite of the Resolution, continues to be the subject of increasing Israeli domination.

Constructivism: The IO as a Persuasive Institution Towards Peace

Constructivists see a lot of value in the Resolution because they see it as an influential and persuasive tool in shifting Israeli policy towards Palestine. Therefore, Constructivists would argue that the Resolution was responsible for Israel's withdrawal from the Gaza Strip in 2005. They may argue that IOs build international consensus and thus influence state action. Hence, in this case, the IO pressured Israel to end its occupation via the Resolution, resulting in the withdrawal from Gaza which saw the extraction of the military occupation as well as the removal of all 7,826 settlers from within the Gaza Strip[1]. Constructivists would also argue that the Resolution was a building block for additional international consensus and action for further influencing Israel's change in behavior. They may argue that one of the best examples of this kind of change was the Oslo Peace Accords in 1993 which, for the first time, saw the leaders of both Palestine and Israel come to the negotiating tables to speak about the occupation and settlements. Constructivist would argue that this was a tremendous accomplishment for the IO and displayed its ability to influence states through the Resolution, raising awareness about the issue and thus creating a forum and movement towards a peaceful resolution[2].

Constructivism: The IO as a Rhetorical Tool and of Not Having Much Practical Value

However, what is disregarded in this argument is that even during those peace accords, new settlements continued to be built and old ones were expanded which was utterly unproductive and violated the most basic principle of the summit itself[3]. Simply put, the facts on the ground largely discredit the Constructivist's arguments and bring to disrepute the IO's contribution towards real significant and lasting change in Palestine. The facts show that while disengagement did take place in Gaza, the 7,286 settlers only for accounted for 1.7% of the total Israeli settler population in Palestine in 2005 which was 423,900[4]. Furthermore, contrary to the Resolution, Gaza did not regain its sovereignty as Israel still controlled all of Gaza's borders, air spaces, coastal waters, water supplies, energy supplies, and aid entering the region, rendering Gaza to be virtually a prison[5]. Another fact which makes the emphasis Constructivists put on the progress made by the Gaza disengagement as of having little practical value lies in the fact that those settlers removed from Gaza Strip were relocated to new, old, and expanding settlements within the West Bank. Therefore, the settlement issue outlined by the IO did not improve at all. What also challenges the genuine nature of the disengagement is the fact that only one year after the disengagement from Gaza, the total number of settlers grew to 443,045[6]; an increase of almost 20,000 settlers from the year before. The number of new settlers and settlements continues to grow every year and has done so since 1967.

Realism: Israel as a Tool for American Might in the Region

Realists, on the other hand, argue that the IO is a tool of the hegemony, utilized towards the hegemony's own ends. Thus, Realist would see the lack of the Resolution's enforcement as being beneficial to the interests of the United States. This immediately raises two questions. First, what does the US have to gain from keeping the Resolution immobilized and second, how is the US impeding on UN efforts to implement the Resolution?

Firstly, an occupied Palestine at the mercy of Israel results in a stronger Israel with more reach and leverage in the Middle East. It is common knowledge that Israel is the US's most loyal and powerful ally in the Middle East, if not the world. Therefore, a stronger, more dominating Israel results in a more powerful US. Israel can thus be seen as a base for the US within the Middle East. Empirical evidence shows that it is just that. One blatant example proving this was seen during the Gulf War of 1991. During the time of the conflict, the US granted Israel $650 million towards military spending and infrastructure specifically because of its plans against Iraq in the Gulf War[7].

Furthermore, a strong US presence in the Middle East logically keeps the countries in the region in line with American foreign policy, creating a check and balance on Middle Easter countries' actions. Therefore, the more powerful the US is in Israel, the more leverage it will have. Therefore, an occupied Palestine, contrary to the Resolution, empowers both Israel and therefore the US. This explains why the US has a strong military presence and bases within Israel, the most recent and significant example of which being the base built in Negev, Israel by the US in 2001 which cost over $266 million[8]. Further US military presence and support for Israel will be revisited at length shortly.

Realism: US Interests in Keeping the Resolution Out and Israeli Occupation In

Those denying the Realist question would also question how the hegemon impeded on UN efforts to implement the Resolution. A study of the US's voting record within the UNSC quickly shines a bright light on US efforts to protect Israel from removing its occupation and maintaining Israel's dominating policy and tactics over Palestine. The US has used its power of veto within the UNSC 81 times. Over half of those veto votes were used to save Israel from condemnation and essentially save Israel from having resolutions passed against it. These US vetoes in support of Israel, which amount to over 40, have almost completely regarded Israeli actions against Palestine[9]. The topics of the resolutions concerning Israeli action against Palestine have unanimously focused on the same issues outlined in Resolution 242: Israel's occupation of Palestine and lack of respect for its sovereignty. Clearly the US has been impeding on efforts to make the Resolution a reality.

Realism: The Power of Rhetoric

With these statistics taken into account, those still skeptical of the Realist argument may be left wondering why the US voted in favor of Resolution 242 in the first place if it is in its interest to have Israel occupy Palestine. Simply put, the IO does not necessarily have to be used by the hegemon in a fashion which allow the hegemon to enforce its influence militarily. The IO can also act as a venue for the hegemon to make political statements and maneuvers to give other states the illusion that it is in fact trying to act in favor of global interests or at least in line with the interests and opinions of the majority. Doing this allows the hegemon to avoid utilizing costlier tactics to achieve what it wants, that being having its own interests flourish. Therefore, in this context, voting in favor of the Resolution created the facade that the US was, and would be for years to come, opposed to Israeli aggression and occupation on paper while those exact policies of Israel would allow for US benefits. Such a tactic is not original or scarcely used. Essentially it is the policy of saying one thing and doing another. The most relevant and substantial example of the US adopting this same policy else where can be seen in its policies towards apartheid South Africa. On April 1st 1960, the US voted in favor of Resolution 134, deploring the apartheid government's racist policies. However, for over 30 the US continued to support the racist regime because it served both its economic interests as well as its anti-communist agenda[10]. In both cases, by saying one thing, that being supporting the Resolutions, and doing another, in this case continuing to act in its own interest and contrary to the Resolutions, the US was and has been able to pursue its own selfish ends with less opposition and criticism from the international community than if it were to not have signed on to the Resolutions.

Marxism: The Military-Industrial Complex and its Influence over Government Policy

Marxists argue in a similar way, but substitute the hegemonic state with economic elites. To Marxist, the IO is a vehicle for the bourgeoisie to pursue their interests. Thus, an explanation is needed which identifies how neglecting the Resolution and maintaining a powerful, armed, and occupier Israel benefits the economic elites. Firstly, we must look at the military-industrial complex of the US. This sector of the US economy is not only a profitable one, but a powerful one as well. As is common knowledge, money can often buy influence, and the American political system is no exception to this time-tested practice. Low estimates show that in 2004, the arms industry provided $13 million dollars to political candidates and more specifically $766,355 for George W. Bush's and $399,000 for John Kerry's election campaigns[11]. It is only rational to think that whoever comes into power, which in this case it turned out to be Bush, would have ties to those in the arms industry which aided their campaign and would thus be somewhat influenced by those who helped them get into power and at least to some degree work to forward their supporters' interests. Needless to say, the arms industry makes its profits from selling arms and this theme of supporting politicians dates back to as early as the Eisenhower administration. In 2007 Northrop Grumman Corporation received a $175 million contract to build laser defense systems in Israel. In 2005 Boeing, one of the US's biggest arms manufacturer, landed a $640 million contract with Israel, selling it AH-64 Apache Longbow attack helicopters[12]. In 1999 Lockheed-Martin won a contract to supply Israel

with F-16 Fighter Planes worth over \$2.5 billion. Such politically-tied business transactions are vast and have a very long history.

The other fold of these business transactions involves those politicians and governments which the arms industry supported. Not only do the arms manufacturers gain permission from government to conduct their business, but essentially they benefit from the American governments creation of markets for them. This is done through US foreign aid. While such aid to Israel has a long and expensive history, a recent example of it will suffice in explaining the argument. Before 1998 Israel received an annual military grant worth \$1.8 billion, funded by American tax-payers' money. By 2006 the amount had been raised to \$2.28 billion[13]. However, what has remained unchanged for all the decades which the US has been funding the military of Israel is the policy that %75 of the military grants it gives to Israel must be spent in the US's arm industry. In 2007 alone Israel was granted a \$30 billion over a decade purely for its military[14]. A simple equation shows that American tax payers' dollars are being sent to Israel to be spent in American companies which benefit the elites of those companies. It is easy to see how a conflict torn, occupied Palestine and military-ready Israel benefits economic elites. In other words, according to a Marxist argument, the Resolution not being implemented benefits the arms industry which thrives on conflicts which call for arms, as it increasingly continues to do so in the case of Israel.

Marxism: Protecting Capitalist Oil Interests in the Region

Other economic elites who would also benefit from an occupied Palestine and therefore a more powerful and heavily armed Israel are those in the American oil industry. Hostile and non-complying Middle Eastern countries can be a cause of capital losses; therefore, a big and powerful Israel acts as the companies' muscle in the region. Marxists would argue that these economic elites see a more powerful and overreaching Israel as a check on the actions of regional, oil-rich countries as they would have pressure on them to act in accordance with US oil interests because failing to do so could mean military attacks. Some would argue we have witnessed such attacks very recently. Moreover, in the 2000 elections alone the American oil industry gave George W. Bush \$25.6 towards his presidential campaign and the democrats over \$5 million, once again giving business influence over government[15]. Others would argue that the first Gulf War also exemplified the US's readiness to use military force to protect oil interests which obviously benefit the industries' elites. Clearly there exists an intricate, influential, and consistent relationship between US foreign policy and the interests of the powerful capitalist class.

Conclusion

After reviewing the relevant data, it is hard to find an explanation for 40 years Palestinian oppression under Israeli occupation which does not involve selfish class and state interests. The fact that the Palestinians'

quality of life has continued to increasingly worsen due to the 40 year old military occupation renders most optimistic views and explanations of why Resolution 242 has not been implemented almost completely unsound. This, coupled with empirical evidence that there are states as well as individuals actively bene-fiting from maintaining Israel's occupation, gives great weight to both Realist and Marxist interpretations as to why a resolution which was unanimously passed in the United Nations Security Council continues to be blatantly disregarded. The United States and its powerful business and economic elites have the leverage to see Resolution 242 be implemented. Sadly, these same actors are the greatest beneficiaries of, and reason behind, maintaining the status quo.

Bibliography

Erlanger, Steven. 2007. "Israel to Get $30 Billion In Military Aid From U.S." *New York Times 156 (54039):* A6-A6.

Falk, Richard. 2005. "Gaza Illusions". *Nation* 281 (7): 4-6. Foundation for Middle East Peace. 2006. Israeli Settler Population 1972-2006. Available online at: http://www.fmep.org/settlement_info/stats_data/settler_populations/Israeli_settler_population_in_occupied_territories.html. Accessed 10 November 2007.

Friedman, T.L. 1991. "U.S. to give Israel $650 million to offset its costs in Gulf War." *New York Times* 140 (48531) A1.

McArthur, Shirl. 2006. "A Conservative Estimate of Total Direct U.S. Aid to Israel: $108 Billion." *Washington Report on Middle East Affairs* 25 (5): 16-17.

Miller, Rory. 2006. "Troubled Neighbors: The EU and Israel". *Israel Affairs* 12 (4): 642-664.

Neff, Donald. 2005. "An Updated List of Vetoes Cast by the United States to Shield Israel from Criticism by the U.N. Security Council". *Washington Report on Middle East Affairs* 24 (4): 14

New York Times. 2001. World Briefing. Middle East: Israel: U.S. Builds Base For Israelis. Available online at: http://query.nytimes.com/gst/fullpage.html?res=9A03E0DC103AF934A25756C0A9679C8B63. Accessed 9 November 2007.

Prusher, Ilene R. 1997. "While talks drag on, Israel builds". *Christian Science Monitor* 89 (240): 1.

Rivers, Brendan P. 2005. "Israel Receives First Apache Longbows." *Journal of Electronic Defense* 28 (6): 25-26.

Stone, Peter H. 2001. "Big Oil's White House Pipelines." *National Journal* 33 (14): 1042.

Thomson, Alex. 2005. "Balancing interests beyond the water's edge: Identifying the key interests that determined US foreign policy towards apartheid South Africa." *Politikon: South African Journal of Political Studies* 32 (1): 123-137.

World Policy Institute. 2004. "The Ties that Bind: Arms Industry Influence in the Bush Administration and Beyond". Arms Trade Resource Center. Available online at: http://www.worldpolicy.org/projects/arms/reports/TiesThatBind.html. Accessed on 11 November 2007.

Zunes, Stephen. 2001."The United States and the Breakdown of the Israeli-Palestinian Peace Process". *Middle East Policy* 8 (4): 66.

Notes

[1] Miller 2006. 643.

[2] Zunes 2001, 66.

[3] Prusher 1997, 1.

[4] Foundation for Middle East Peace, 2006.

[5] Falk 2005, 6.

[6] Foundation for Middle East Peace, 2006.

[7] Friedman 1991, A1.

[8] New York Times. 2001.

[9] Neff 2005, 14.

[10] Thomson 2005, 230.

[11] World Policy Institute, 2004.

[12] Rivers 2005, 25.

[13] McArthur 2006, 17.

[14] Erlanger 2007, A6.

[15] Stone 2001, 33.

The Changing Phases of Power and Civil Administration in Benin: From Inception to 1987.

By Victor Osaro Edo

Abstract

The ancient Kingdom of Benin was one of the most prosperous, powerful and prominent states in pre-colonial Africa. Its artistic triumphs, elaborate pantheon of gods, its sophisticated system of government and the intimidating aura of its monarchy make the Benin experience a fascinating subject of historical scrutiny. This paper, therefore, examines the structure, nature and character of governance and civil administration in pre-colonial Benin up to the advent of colonial rule. It analyses the processes of change in Benin from the era of the *Ogisos* through the period of the republican administration to the establishment of a monarchical system of government. The study reveals that Benin's history from the earliest times to the beginning of colonial rule was dynamic and witnessed monumental changes in the structure and character of the State. Though the monarchy had its fair share of the turbulence, yet it remained the most resilient of all traditional institutions since it provided the pivot around which the forces of change gravitated during the period under review.

Introduction

Benin is located in the forest belt in the Southwestern part of Nigeria. The Benin kingdom spread with time and became an empire that covered a vast area of land that embraced both the Edo speaking and non Edo speaking people. Several centuries ago, at the time when Benin was called *Igodomigodo* (land of *Igodo*), that geographical area now known as Benin was the hub of a conglomeration of small settlements or villages that developed or spread into most of the areas of present day Edo State of Nigeria. Throughout that period, *Igodomigodo* made steady progress, especially in the areas of spiritual, philosophical and administrative development. Its efforts were largely concentrated on the arrangement of human order so that by the time Europeans made contact with the people of Benin in the 15th century, they had already

established an administrative system that baffled the Europeans and earned for the capital of this far flung African country, the appellation "city" (Ryder, 1977:31).

A study on civil administration in Benin becomes necessary given the hues and cries that have been generated by writers on Benin history and historiography. As such, it is important to highlight the various phases of administration that the Benin kingdom and empire had enjoyed overtime. Indeed, these phases of administration are in line with the works of great Benin authors like J.U. Egharevba and P.A. Igbafe. This paper examines the changing phases of power and civil administration in Benin from this early period of the *Ogiso* termed *Igodomigodo,* an appellation coined from the name of the first *Ogiso* – Igodo (Obagodo); through the period of republican administration (the interregnum) to the establishment of monarchical system of government. It is significant to state from the out set that *Ogiso* was the name of a collection of rulers that reigned in Benin before the emergence of Prince Oranmiyan on the Benin throne. (Edo, 2001:10). .

The *Ogiso* Era of Benin History (c.900 – c.1170)

The nucleus of the great Benin Civilisation was the monarchy, which the Binis perfected around the 18th century when, after a series of experimentation with the *Ogiso,* and some of the past *Ogiso* rulers, they introduced a monarchical system that is based on the principle of primogeniture, beginning with *Oba Ewuakpe* about 1712 AD (Egharevba, 1968:39). However, it is significant that the *Ogisos* laid the foundation for the structure of civil administration in Benin, which the *Obas* of the second dynasty later built upon, as from about 1200 AD, when the republican experience failed.

Indeed, the history of Benin monarchy dates back to the *Ogiso* era, which has been traced to about the 10th century. Although it is not possible in a paper of this nature to give a full account of all the *Ogisos,* it is believed that there were thirty-one of them before the arrival of Prince Oranmiyan from Ife (called Uhe by the Binis) (Eweka, 1992:4). This figure was also corroborated by the great Benin historian, Jacob Uwadiae Egharevba. The *Ogiso* rulers are believed to have laid the foundations for most of the subsequent developments in Benin. Indeed, the *Ogiso* period represented just a part of a compressed mythology wherein presumably remarkable quasi-historical figures achieved incredible feats (Igbafe, 2007:43). The first *Ogiso* was Igodo (Obagodo) who first established the machinery for an effective system of administration. For example, his unification of the numerous clusters of independent communities gave rise to Benin City and a centralised administrative system. The last *Ogiso*, Owodo, was said to have been banished from the kingdom for maladministration. However, the most prominent and greatest *Ogiso* ruler was a man named Ere. He was credited with many achievements and innovations including the creation of four chieftainct titles. These are, *Oliha, Edohen, Eholor n'Ire* and *Ero*. The holders of these important titles became the kingmakers. These individuals survived into the period of the present dynasty. (Egharevba, 1968:4). Ogiso Ere is credited with the transfer of the *Ogiso* palace to Uhunmwidunmwun, a local village, but now a central part of Benin City. (Egharevba, 1968:3). This is said to have been a more favourable location than

Ugbekun, the original site, but both were in fact local villages.

Above all, he was reputed to have organised the Bini into various art and craft industries and established guild systems to facilitate specialisation (Edo, 1990:20). (Edo, 1991 is not included among your references on the last page) These art and craft industries date from antiquity, for tradition holds that Ere of the *Ogiso* dynasty (first Benin dynasty) founded the guilds (Dark, 1971:8). Unfortunately, the best of these products, collected and sent to the *Oba's* court; were either destroyed or carried away during the British conquest of Benin in 1897.

In the guilds, the various craftsmen in Benin were encouraged to form associations with monopoly rights to produce, standardize, market and attend to their products. Ere gave the guilds patronage. In this way, there emerged the guild of wood workers (*Owinna)*, the carvers (*Igbesanman),* leather workers (*Esohian)*, the hunters (*Ohue*), the weavers (*Owinnanido*) and the pot makers (*Emakhe*). They gave fillip to the social and economic life of the kingdom. Ere was also reputed to have founded the *Ogiso* market (*Ekiogiso*), now known as Agbado market to promote commercial activities in his kingdom (Edo, 1990:10).

Under Ere, peace reigned throughout the kingdom because of his practice of dispatching town criers to pronounce the injunction of peace once there was a dispute in any part of his kingdom. The injunction has survived to this day in the saying that "Ere forbids quarrel' (*a wua ne Ere*). Significantly too, Ere introduced the royal throne (*ekete*); the round leather box (*ekpokin*); the swords of authority of the Benin monarch (*ada* and *eben);* the beaded anklets (eyen); and the collars *(odigba)* as well as the simple, undecorated crown for the *Oba*. The introduction of domestic articles like wooden plates, bowls, mortars, and pestles carved by the *Owina* is also credited to *Ogiso* Ere (Igbafe, 2007:43).

It is significant that the political centralisation of *Ogiso* rule enabled the settlement of disputes by the common political authority; this gave the kingdom a sense of unity and through the sharing of a common goal, purpose or destiny. The *Ogiso* are believed to have planted monarchical traditions into the Benin political system. Thus, they succeeded in reducing the powers and authorities of autonomous villages or village groups given the influence of the various *Obas* over the years *(there is a need to recast this paragraph. It is not clear)*

As noted above, the last *Ogiso* was Owodo, whose reign Egharevba (1968:2) describes as "a long course of misrule, failure and anxiety". He was supposedly banished from the kingdom. At the time of his banishment, Owodo had no successor because his only son and hair-apparent, Ekaladerhan, had earlier left for an unknown destination having been secretly granted freedom by those sent by his father, Owodo, to execute him as sacrifice to the gods to enable him have more male children (Eweka, 1992:6). Record has it that Ekaladerhan founded Ughoton which was, in fact, called Iguekaladerhan (the land of Ekaladerhan). It is believed that Ekaladerhan first settled at a place called Ughoton after several months of wandering in the jungles. Hunters from Benin stumbled on him in the forest and after their return to Benin, he packed up his tent and left because he was afraid that the hunters would reveal his location and his father would give fresh order for his arrest and execution. As he feared, the hunters reported their discovery whereupon

his father sent soldiers along with them to go and arrest him. But by the time they arrived, Ekaladerhan had gone (Eweka, 1992:7). Afraid that Owodo would not believe that they did not meet him (after all was Owodo not once deceived that Ekaladerhan was executed when, in fact, his life was secretly spared), soldiers and hunters stayed put. It was they who, in fact, founded Ughoton and named it after Ekaladerhan.

Ekaladerhan's chance arrival at Uhe changed his fortunes. His adopted name, Izoduwa (later corrupted, but meaning literally in the Edo language "I have chosen the path to posterity", (Eweka, 1992:15) is symbolic and has obvious reference to the story of his life just in the same way as Oranmiyan, the name of his eldest son. It was the search for Ekaladerhan that took the Binis to Uhe; when he was located and his identity became known to the search party, Izoduwa refused to return with them because of his old age. But after testing the sincerity of their intention he sent one of his sons, Oranmiyan, to accompany them to Benin. (Eweka, 1992:18) Meanwhile, Owodo (the last and worst ruler of the *Ogiso* dynasty) eventually died without a successor, Ekaladerhan being the only male child. Hence, there was an interregnum during which a man known as Evian became an administrator of Benin. This leads us to the next phase of Benin history, the republican era, the interface between the *Ogiso* era and the Eweka dynasty. You have already joined the debate on pp.5 & 7 by suggesting that Oduduwa or Izoduwa was no other person than Ekaladerhan. Its better to stick to that position. Ok by me.

The Republican Era of Benin History (c.1170 – c.1200)

Between the end of the reign of Owodo, the last *Ogiso* and the inception of the Oranmiyan/Eweka dynasty, Benin experimented with a republican form of government in the absence of any heir to Owodo; Ekaladerhan having been banished. According to Egharevba's historical account, during Owodo's reign, a man called Evian came to prominence. At the time, there was a great monster called Osogan, which killed many people at Okedo – now known as Ikpoba slope in Benin City. The harassment took place mostly on *Ogiso* market days. Because of this, the market was nicknamed *Agbayo-Aigbare*, meaning "We go there together, but we never return together". On a particular market day, so the story went, Evian armed himself with a red hot iron rod which he trusted into the mouth of the monster that eventually perished and was heard of no more. Evian was hailed as Evian *nu rie ebe*, which translated means "Evian who prevents danger". It was this single act of gallantry that brought Evian to prominence and he was then selected to administer the Government of Benin after the banishment of Owodo for ordering the execution of a pregnant woman (Eweka, 1992:8).

We were told that the aging administrator (Evian) nominated his son, Ogiamien, to succeed him. Such nomination was not acceptable to the Edo people noting that he was not an *Ogiso*. This gave rise to the political factionalism, instability, disputes and intercine wars, which formed the background of the new Eweka dynasty.

Indeed, the era of republican administration was not a particularly fruitful one in the history of civil

administration in Benin. The period witnessed political strife and anarchy. Hence, the Benin elders (*edion*) resorted to divination and constituted a search party, which was then sent to look for the long banished prince. The train, led by Chief Oliha, eventually ended at Uhe, where Ekaladerhan was now fully settled as king. It is significant that over the years, as a result of the struggle between the *edion* (elders) and the king for supremacy, the group name '*edion*' came to be known as Uzama. As it were, the republican experiment failed. Thus, the Binis desired a monarchical form of government. (Eweka, 1992:22).

I have taken this section to the last few pages to form part of the concluding remarks.

The Obaship Era of Benin History (c.1200 – c.1897)

The people's rejection of Ogiamien as successor to Evian marked the beginning of the present Obaship dynasty in Benin. Whatever the current polemics on the origin of the Benin dynasty dating from the 13th century, from all available evidence, it seems clear that there were a people who lived in Benin before an invitation was sent to Ife for advice on good governance. Thus, the 13th century marked a significant landmark in the changing phase of power and civil administration in Benin, which lasted up to 1897, when *Oba* Ovonramwen the last independent *Oba* of Benin lost his suzerainty to the British colonial administration in the face of superior weapons. (Edo, 2001:40).

Nevertheless, this phase of Benin history witnessed momentous developments and initiatives by the successive *Obas* of Benin, particularly *Oba* Eweka I (1200-1235), *Oba* Ewedo (1255-1280) and *Oba* Ewuare the Great (1440-1473). These *Obas,* among others, carried out reforms that re-shaped the nature and character of administration in the Benin kingdom and empire. For instance, the manipulative skill of *Oba* Eweka I led to the formal institutionalisation of the Uzama chiefs – the oldest among the Benin title holders. Before his reign, this class of chiefs was not called *Uzama;* it was referred to as *edion*, meaning elders. It was Eweka I who changed it to Uzama and gave it more powers. It is significant that the *Uzama* title, particularly the first four-*Oliha, Edohen, Ero and Eholo n' Ire* – antedated the Oranmiyan dynasty (Edo, 2001:3). The four elders as the *Uzama* were then known, jointly ruled Benin with the *Oba. The Oba* was only regarded as first among equals. (Edo, 2001:4). Bradbury opined that tradition identified the *Uzama* with the elders whose request resulted in Oranmiyan being sent from Ile-Ife to found a dynasty at Benin (Bradbury, 1967:13).

It is worthy of mention too that following the steps already taken by *Oba* Eweka I, traditions tell us that the *Edaiken (*the title of the heir apparent to the Benin throne) was created and added by *Oba* Ewuare the Great to the *Uzama* group. Chief Egharevba's account does not tell us that other *Uzama* chiefs were also kingmakers, which brings us to the conclusion that the *Uzama* were originally four in number during the *Ogiso* era. The basis for this conjecture is that both *Oloton* and *Edaiken* came into the *Uzama* group after the *Ogiso* era in 1200 AD., while the *Ezomo* became an *Uzama* chief in 1713 AD during the reign of *Oba* Akenzua I (1713-1735)-bringing the number of the *Uzama* chiefs to seven.

Besides the *Edaiken*, *Oba* Ewuare the Great created many other titles as a counterpoise to the power of the *Uzama* chiefs. The inclusion of the heir-apparent in the order of *Uzama* by the monarch could be seen more as a political strategy to check the rising power of these chiefs and also to ensure that his interest was more directly represented in that order. Thus, in order to assert their superiority over these elders, the successors of Eweka I, notably Ewedo and Ewuare the Great, had to create new title orders – the *Eghaevbo n'Ogbe* (Palace Chiefs) and *Egharevbo n'Ore* (Town Chiefs) to assist in the administration of the expanding state. This policy, perhaps, accounted for the less important role, which the *Uzama* chiefs played in the administration of Benin from the eighteenth century. Thus, with the creation of more titles by the *Oba*, the monarchy was able, by playing one class of chiefs against another, to assert itself over the different grades of chiefs and particularly the *Uzama* chiefs who progressively sank into relative obscurity over the years. For, with the institutionalisation of the principle of primogeniture and the creation of the *Edaiken* title, the *Uzama* who were traditionally regarded, as kingmakers no longer had roles to play as kings were born and not made. Hence, what we have in Benin given the strategic displacement of the *Uzama* who had dictated the pace in the earlier periods of Benin history are now chiefs who officiated at the coronation of the *Oba* and not kingmakers (Edo, 2001:1)

However, as it turned out, the new offices created by the *Obas* of Benin in the pre- colonial period did not only change the fortunes of the *Uzama* group of chiefs, but enhanced in particular the newly created title of the *Iyase* (Prime-Minister), which was super-imposed on the *Uzama.* The *Iyase,* the head of the *Eghaevbo n'Ore*, became dominant in Benin politics over the years and even up to and throughout the colonial period. The *Iyase* came to be portrayed as the focus of opposition to the *Oba's* power. The *Iyase* was the commander of the Benin army before the eighteenth century when the position was devolved on the *Ezomo*- an *Uzama* chief - (Eweka, 1992:27-33). It was *Oba* Akeuzua I in 1713 that transferred this role to the *Ezomo.* Although the *Oba* had the exclusive right to confer titles on people, the *Iyase* wielded much power in this process because he was the one who publicly pronounced the title the *Oba* had granted in private.

Indeed, the *Iyase* was and is still seen as the chief protagonist of the people against the power of the palace. This was true because the best interest of the people lay in the maintenance of the balance between the *Oba* and his 'servile' palace chiefs *(Eghaevbo n'Ogbe)* on the one hand and the town chiefs on the other. In the latter part of the nineteenth century and in the early twentieth century, the different *Iyases* had acquired much power, which almost lured one of them (Agho Obaseki) into the ambition of violating the principle of primogeniture by aspiring to the throne of Benin. (Edo, 2001:25).

It is worth mentioning that the *Eghaevbo n'Ore* (Town Chiefs) formed an opposition in the state council. Unlike the Palace Chiefs, the *Eghaevbo n'Ore* chiefs included a proportion of men who had achieved wealth and influence independent of the palace. Led by the *Iyase,* this group always opposed any unpopular measures taken by the Council. Thus, the *Eghaevbo n'Ore* under the leadership of the *Iyase* provided a powerful check on the implementation of unpopular measures and decisions. Indeed, even though falling outside the scope of this discourse, the *Iyase* – Okoro-Otun – was the rallying force during the water rate agitation between 1937 and 1939, when the people kicked against *Oba* Akenzua II. Also, the *Iyase* was

the leader of the Edo in the dispute over the building rules in the early 1940s, when threats to depose *Oba* Akenzua II were made. (Edo, 2001:9-10). It is worthy of note that the *Iyase* became the mouth piece of the people, and with the coming of colonial rule became elevated to the position of Prime-Minister, the second highest office in the kingdom, next only to the *Oba* .

However, one significant lesson that can be drawn out from the development so far is that the men and women who lived through various segments of at least a millennium and a half of Benin royal history took active part in the design and construction of Benin monarchy as it later emerged in the last phase of power and civil administration in Benin Source? . In a vital sense, they believed that they owned the social institutions that housed their kingdom. Having collectively invested so much in the building of their state, they have acted as its owners. They rewarded those kings who advanced the fortunes of the state with adulation and high praise – rarely matched anywhere else in the ancient African world. But they were also known to have meted out severe punishment to those of their kings who degraded their state and threatened the people's welfare. Benin kings were powerful people within their domain and outside of it. But their power was a result of paying close attention to the affairs of the state and their unmatched ability to listen to the complaints of even the littlest man and woman in the kingdom. Kings who failed in this respects have occasionally suffered disgrace from actions of the people. Source? That was how the first dynasty of the *Ogiso* and indeed the republican administration were terminated. Without doubt, the people played a significant role in the dissolution of the *Ogiso* dynasty; in their rejection of attempts by a non-royal aristocrat to be their kings; and in the creation of a new dynasty by way of the deliberate invitation by the people to a neighbouring kingdom for a royal prince to help out with their crisis of governance.

Thus, the history of power and civil administration in Benin from the earliest period up to 1897 was dynamic and challenging, with one event leading to the other; in particular, the Benin society witnessed monumental changes in the structure and character of the state throughout the three phases examined. It is no gain saying that on the whole, the monarchy had its fair share of the turbulence, but it remained the most resilient of all traditional institutions. The monarchy provided the pivot around which the forces of change gravitated; setting the pace and dictating the direction of its dynamism throughout the period of this study and even thereafter as events in Benin history has shown up till the present.

References

Bradbury, R. E. (1973), *Benin Studies,* London: International African Institute and Oxford University Press.

Bradbury, R. E. (1964), *The Benin Kingdom and the Edo-Speaking People of South-Western Nigeria,* London: International African Institute.

Bradbury, R. E. (1967), "The Kingdom of Benin" in Forde, D and Kaberry, P. (eds), *West African Kingdoms*

in the Nineteenth Century, London: Oxford University Press.

Dark, P. C., (1971), *Introduction to Benin Arts and Technology,* London: Oxford University Press.

Edo, V. O. (1990), "Production and Exchange in Benin" (Unpublished M.A. Dissertation, University of Ibadan, Ibadan).

Edo V. O. (2001), "The Benin Monarchy 1897-1978: A Study in Institutional Adaptation to Change" (Unpublished Ph.D. Thesis, University of Ibadan, Ibadan).

Egharevba, J. U., (1968), *A Short History of Benin,* Ibadan: Ibadan University Press.

Eweka, E. B., (1989) *The Benin Monarchy: Origin and Development,* Benin City: Bendel Newspapers Corporation Ltd. (You did not cite this work within the text)

Eweka, E. B., (1992) *Evolution of Benin Chieftaincy Titles,* Benin City: Uniben Press.

Igbafe, P. A., (1979), *Benin Under British Administration, 1897-1938: The Impact of Colonial Rule on an African Kingdom,* London: Longman.

Igbafe, P. A., (2007), "A History of The Benin Kingdom: an Overview" in Plankensteiner, B. (ed), *Benin Kings and Rituals: Court Arts from Nigeria,* Belgium: Snoeck Publishers.

Ryder, A. F. C., (1977), *Benin and the Europeans, 1485-1897,* London: Longman.